

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
October 26, 2023
9:30 a.m.

By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50666



Page 2

1 PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a.m. on
3 October 26, 2023, at the State of Arizona, Clean
4 Elections Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference
5 Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the
6 following Board Members:
7
8 Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
9 Mr. Galen Paton
10 Ms. Amy Chan
11 Mr. Steve Titla

12 OTHERS PRESENT:

13 Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
14 Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
15 Mike Becker, Policy Director
16 Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director
17 Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager
18 Avery Xola, Voter Education Manager
19 Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General
20 Karen Hartman, Assistant Attorney General
21 Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon
22 Cathy Herring, Meeting Planner
23 Jessica Painter, Meeting Planner
24 Rivko Knox, Member of the Public
25

Page 3

1 P R O C E E D I N G
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Agenda Item I, the call to
3 the order. It's 9:30 a.m., October 26th, 2023, and I'm
4 going to call this meeting of the Citizens Clean
5 Elections Commission to order.
6 With that, we will take attendance.
7 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
8 record.
9 COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.
11 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Yeah, Steve Titla here.
12 Good morning.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. We have a
14 quorum with Commissioners Chan, Paton, Titla, and I'm
15 Mark Kimble, the Chairman.
16 Item II, discussion and possible action on
17 minutes for the September 21st, 2023 meeting. Is there
18 any discussion on the minutes?
19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move that
20 we approve the minutes as written.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan has moved
22 that we approve the minutes. Is there a second?
23 COMMISSIONER PATON: Paton, second.
24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. A second by
25 Commissioner Paton.

Page 4

1 I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.
2 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
4 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
6 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
8 Titla.
9 The Chair votes aye.
10 The minutes are approved 4-to-nothing.
11 Item III in the discussion -- Item III is
12 discussion and possible action on the Executive
13 Director's Report. Tom.
14 MR. COLLINS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and
15 Commissioners. Thank you all for being here.
16 I'd like to -- first, I wanted to mention,
17 and so everybody knows, we have a -- November 7th is
18 the next consolidated election date. And so many of
19 you may see, either as you're around the state or at
20 home, the signs related to school district bond and
21 override elections, local municipal elections as well.
22 Many of these elections for this time of year
23 are mail ballot elections. So what that means is, the
24 jurisdiction that is -- has called the election, for
25 example, a school district or a -- or a city or town,

Page 5

1 has the authority, under state statute, to designate it
2 to be an all-mail election. This is designed to save
3 costs and be more efficient. It also means that
4 everyone who is eligible to vote in that election will
5 be mailed a ballot, not just those folks who are on the
6 active early voter list.
7 You know, we -- the -- we recommend to folks,
8 if they contact us and in other communications, that
9 they mail their voted ballot back by October 31st,
10 which is Tuesday, and then if they -- and after that,
11 that they deliver it to the appropriate election
12 officer.
13 I wanted to talk a little bit about our voter
14 education and outreach projects for this month.
15 We've -- we've continued -- I think this fall we had a
16 very good pace of -- of outreach events that we've
17 either put on or participated in. Avery, as you can
18 see, has been -- has kept that pace up and has -- I
19 think we've been -- we've been very happy with -- with
20 that. It has -- I think our continuing to appear at
21 various events, and especially these events that are
22 put together by, you know, the community college
23 district and the -- and Arizona State here in Phoenix
24 and others, other educational institutions, are an
25 important part of what we do and I think our presence

Page 6

1 at those, you know, demonstrates that we are connected
2 to the community that we all live in.

3 I wanted to highlight also that Gina was a
4 panelist on the Scholars Strategic Network Election
5 Enhancement and Protection Program launch that -- if
6 you ever have a chance, and we can send you the link,
7 if you're interested, to that program, but it's a very
8 interesting and -- look at how to improve our election
9 processes nationwide.

10 I wanted real quick -- before we went on to
11 the administrative stuff, I wanted to welcome to the --
12 or, back to the state of Arizona Karen Hartman, who
13 is -- I don't know what her title is at the Attorney
14 General's Office, but she's joined the Attorney
15 General's Office election section, for what it's worth,
16 or whatever the right nomenclature is, in the -- in the
17 agency council section of the Attorney General's
18 Office, which is in the state government division, I
19 think.

20 In any event, Karen has a long experience as
21 an attorney in elections and other important government
22 roles. She comes to the AG's Office having worked in
23 the civil division for the Maricopa County Attorney's
24 Office for the past several years, where she advised
25 the elected officials, including the Recorder's Office,

Page 7

1 the Treasurer's Office, the Assessor's Office, and
2 participated in -- in a whole lot of litigation, if you
3 want to call it that, of the 2020 election and the 2022
4 election. Some of you -- and, Mark, you may recall,
5 Karen was an attorney at Steptoe & Johnson in their
6 first amendment public records practice, which is, I
7 think, where we first met, so -- so this is a welcome
8 to Karen. And I'm sure anyone who's not here today
9 will meet her eventually.

10 On the administrative front, we do -- we are
11 running candidate workshops, and we've had about 20
12 candidates that participated in those workshops thus
13 far.

14 The -- I guess this is probably the most
15 important bullet point here, from my perspective, in
16 terms of just positive news for us. So on the other
17 day, I guess it was Tuesday, the Governor -- the
18 Governor's Office, as you may recall, started a
19 Bipartisan Election Task Force. And the Bipartisan
20 Election Task Force brought together folks from
21 elections, from the nonprofit sector, you know, from
22 different parts of the state to talk about ways to
23 improve their election processes. And there's a --
24 there's a whole range of proposals that were voted on,
25 and we can get you those. The final report will be due

Page 8

1 on November 1st.

2 For our purposes, you know, the report calls
3 for, and this was -- these were all approved by the --
4 by the Task Force, having a central website that's a
5 sort of a one-stop shop for voters to get information
6 about what's on their ballot. And the Task Force
7 report recognizes the Commission's website as the
8 proper vehicle for that and recognizes the work that
9 we've always done -- already done to build that
10 capacity.

11 You know, and I think that's a -- I think
12 this is a very big plus for the voters of the state. I
13 think it's important recognition for the work that Gina
14 and Alec and the rest of our team have done on that and
15 I think that -- so the vision going forward is to build
16 that out further, to bring in more information that
17 directly connects voters with both their state and
18 federal and increasingly their local elections.

19 Gina, would you mind, if you have a second,
20 would you -- could you -- would you have a little bit
21 to add about that maybe.

22 If you don't mind, Mr. Chairman.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Sure.

24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Gina.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Mr. Chairman, if I may.

Page 9

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Gina. Go ahead.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners,
3 yes, this is actually very exciting news, you know,
4 one, for obviously the recognition that the site has
5 been successful in its mission in serving voters across
6 the state. We know with all of our Commissioners it's
7 always been stressed that our voter education program,
8 you know, meets the needs of every voters regardless if
9 they're in a rural part of the state or, you know, if
10 they're in metro Phoenix. And so our website has been
11 designed to interact with all voters across the state
12 regardless of their location and the election that is
13 occurring.

14 So we have built relationships, Alec has
15 built relationships with all of our local election
16 officials to make sure that we get the timely and
17 accurate election information to essentially
18 consolidate it all on this single source, on this
19 website, and we ensure that our website is accessible
20 for voters. So we're not just putting the information
21 out there, but we make sure that it's accessible in an
22 easy-to-absorb way.

23 And so it's accessible from a voter with
24 disabilities standpoint. It's accessible with screen
25 readers. We have multiple languages for the website.

Page 10

1 And, of course, we present it in information that's
2 very easy for the user, whether it's entering in their
3 address if it's a nonstandard address for our travel
4 communities, or simply just using a pin drop with --
5 with their longitude and latitude. So we've really
6 built this website with the future in mind.

7 So we -- you know, we have the front facing
8 of the website that provides this great service to
9 voters, but also on the back end in how our systems and
10 our databases operate and where we pull data from. We
11 built it really forward thinking so that, to be able to
12 continue to expand on the information that we want to
13 provide voters, we have that infrastructure already in
14 place because we were very forward thinking in its
15 design. And we're actually going through a redesign
16 right now too, so we're continuing to make improvements
17 to the website all in the hopes that we are meeting
18 voters. And the good news is -- too is that our data,
19 our analytics show this as well.

20 We look at our monthly analytics, and more
21 and more people are getting to the Clean Elections
22 website organically, outside of paid media, outside of
23 paid media campaigns. They are going to Google and
24 they are searching for the Clean Elections website. So
25 we know that it's being used by voters, we know that

Page 11

1 it's successful in the information that it's providing
2 to voters, and we are in a position to continue to grow
3 the website so that we can meet the needs of all
4 voters.

5 So it really is a great, I think, recognition
6 by the Governor's Task Force, but also it makes sense,
7 because it really is a system that is very primed to
8 continue to serve and meet the needs of voters.

9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Gina.
10 Tom.

11 MR. COLLINS: Thank you. Yes, and I just
12 want to, you know, reiterate that I think that the work
13 that Gina and Alec and the rest of their team on this
14 has been, you know, excellent, and this has been -- you
15 know, I think it's very exciting.

16 I want to -- real quick, couple other things
17 just to keep our eyes on going forward. And this is
18 also wrapped up in the Governor's Task Force
19 recommendations. You know, there's some indication,
20 you know, that -- back in, I think it was 2020 -- 2020
21 or -- 2021 or 2022 the Legislature passed a bill that
22 lowered the threshold for automatic recounts. And we
23 did, in fact, have automatic recounts in 2022. So the
24 County Association and Election Directors have raised
25 this as an issue for purposes of 2024. Two -- two

Page 12

1 consequences potentially if there's not some remedy for
2 this recount threshold.

3 Recounts take a lot of time, right, so you've
4 got to -- I mean, not an inordinate amount of time,
5 but, you know, certainly an amount of time, when
6 everything is on a very tight deadline. So two issues
7 where that becomes a factor.

8 One, the primary. If there's an automatic
9 recount in the primary, and there's no -- and the
10 county in question or counties in question don't have
11 the ability to know who is the nominee for a general
12 election, that delays the printing of the ballots,
13 which runs into the deadlines for -- particularly for
14 sending -- mailing ballots to uniformed and overseas
15 voters under UOCAVA.

16 Second, and perhaps more -- well, more
17 interesting in a sort of intellectual way and maybe a
18 little more anxiety inducing in a -- in an emotional
19 way, is that the -- such a recount, if it were to
20 affect the electoral -- the electors for the electoral
21 college, the counties have said, and this is in a
22 Votebeat story that's cited there, that that could
23 delay the ability of the state to meet the safe harbor
24 provisions of the Electoral Count Act. I don't purport
25 to be an expert in the Electoral Count Act, but -- and

Page 13

1 what the consequences of that would be, but
2 nevertheless, it's a serious issue. The counties have
3 taken it quite seriously and are working on legislation
4 related to it, according to Votebeat.

5 So the -- for us, what's the issue? You
6 know, obviously, our -- a lot of our work, both on the
7 voter education side and on the -- especially on the
8 clean funding side, is tied to the primary date, in
9 part, because of the -- both things, both on the
10 deadlines for us to issue the candidate statement
11 pamphlet and the deadlines the candidates face for
12 qualifying for the Clean Elections funding if they were
13 to choose to do that.

14 And then on the general election side, like
15 people who print ballots, we also need to know the
16 nominees for -- for the general election from a
17 primary.

18 So -- so there's been discussion about moving
19 the primary maybe back a couple weeks -- or, up a
20 couple weeks, I should say. We've evaluated that
21 internally and we are comfortable that we could -- you
22 know, we could deal with that. The -- you know, on the
23 clean candidate side, it would cut off, you know, two
24 weeks of qualification. However, you know, in our
25 experience as -- in working with these candidates,

Page 14

1 ordinarily if a candidate is that far behind, they're
2 probably at the margins of qualifying and maybe weren't
3 going to qualify anyways. In other words, very few
4 people who get in at the last minute are able to use
5 their funding in a particularly useful way. We've had
6 candidates get funded at the last minute and basically
7 have to turn around and return the money right away.
8 So, you know, we're keeping an eye on it.
9 Obviously, whatever the Governor and the Legislature
10 choose to do would be -- you know, be good to know
11 sooner rather than later, I suspect, but -- so we can
12 provide, you know, appropriate information to
13 candidates. But anyways, I think that's -- but that's
14 something to keep an eye on, and it's not really clear
15 to me that there yet -- and it may be clear to others,
16 but it's not clear to me yet that there will be -- that
17 we know how those things will get resolved and on what
18 time frame.
19 We have our first advisory opinion request,
20 which is attached. We have -- we have about a month
21 left to -- to provide some kind of answer. So what I
22 anticipate, just for preview of next month, is that
23 we'll -- that we will have a draft advisory opinion for
24 your consideration at the next meeting.
25 There is, as always, quite a bit of

Page 15

1 litigation, including new cases that have been brought
2 in the last few weeks, one challenging what the Free
3 Enterprise Club refers to as unstaffed drop boxes,
4 claiming that the Election Procedures Manual that
5 authorizes drop boxes is -- violates a statute that
6 says that when you return mail ballots, you have to
7 return them to the County Recorder or other officer in
8 charge of elections.
9 Obviously, you know, were that lawsuit to be
10 successful, it would -- election officials -- other
11 election officials have said, and I think that it's
12 fairly -- fairly clear that that would at least have an
13 impact on the ability of folks to get their ballot back
14 efficiently and -- and on the other hand, you know, the
15 Maricopa County Recorder has said that in the event
16 they had to staff these drop boxes 24 hours or however
17 long, that that would raise a real cost-benefit issue
18 for -- for at least Maricopa.
19 So, again, just, you know, that's out there.
20 We obviously haven't taken a position on it, but I
21 wanted to make sure that you're aware that -- that
22 that's -- that's out there and that's sort of the
23 situation.
24 MS. KARLSON: Excuse me, Mr. Chairman.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Kara.

Page 16

1 MS. KARLSON: If you wanted an -- just
2 procedurally an update on that, there was a response
3 filed yesterday, and Karen will be going to Prescott
4 tomorrow for a hearing on that. So just -- that just
5 happened, so I wanted to give an update on that.
6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.
7 Did you want to say anything about that,
8 Karen? You don't have to. I just wanted to give you
9 the opportunity, if you want it.
10 MS. HARTMAN: Thank you. No, I don't need to
11 say anything.
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
13 Were you done, Tom?
14 MR. COLLINS: Oh, I'm done.
15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any questions from
16 any Commissioners?
17 (No response.)
18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Karen, welcome. Thank you
19 for coming.
20 MS. HARTMAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Always nice to have one
22 more lawyer in the room. We don't quite have enough,
23 but -- but thank you for coming.
24 Next item, Item IV, discussion and possible
25 action on adoption of rules pursuant to the Voters'

Page 17

1 Right to Know Act, Chapter 6.1 of Arizona Revised
2 Statutes Title 16. This Agenda item involves the
3 enforcement process for Proposition 211. The rules
4 outline the requirements for filing and handling
5 complaints. These are the final rules we have in our
6 queue for implementation.
7 We have, over the course of the year, spent
8 several meetings reviewing the substance and
9 requirements of the Act. We have published and
10 received comments on the core rules necessary to
11 implement the Act. And going forward, we hope to work
12 to help ensure the public and other stakeholders have
13 the information they need in order to be in compliance
14 with Proposition 211.
15 With that, staff has prepared a memo about
16 comments related to this proposed rule. Tom.
17 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
18 Commissioners. So these are the -- so Rule --
19 R2-20-809 through 813 outline the process by which we
20 would handle complaints. It also, a little more
21 substantially, I suppose, has some issues related to
22 how to define the structuring provisions of the Act in
23 the context of a -- which would only arise really in
24 the context of a complaint.
25 So we received several comments, not as many

Page 18

1 as we have on other things. You can see outlined our
2 thoughts on that. I don't know if anybody has any sort
3 of specific questions beyond what's outlined in the
4 memo.

5 You know -- you know, I think that -- you
6 know, I really don't have a lot to add to the memo, I
7 guess is what I'm trying to say. You know, we do
8 have -- and I guess I'll just highlight it. We have
9 a -- we have a -- we have a comment from the Campaign
10 Legal Center related to donors and whether or not
11 donors ought to -- how we would regulate donors, as
12 opposed to -- I shouldn't say "as opposed to" --
13 separately from covered persons or -- you know, under
14 the Act.

15 You know, my point of view on that is, as I
16 state in the memo, is that if we're interested in -- in
17 talking about that, the better place to do that would
18 be, rather than in this context, would be to talk about
19 it in the context of next -- of the next meeting. We
20 could evaluate that more deeply and look at whether or
21 not that's something we want to do and get some --
22 some, you know, feedback on that if we wanted to. You
23 know, it's really up to the -- it's up to the
24 Commission to really -- it's not a -- you know, I don't
25 have a -- I mean, I have some -- well, that would be

Page 19

1 my -- if we want to talk about that more, I'd recommend
2 we do that at an additional -- or, at our next meeting.

3 Beyond that, you know, as Chairman Kimble
4 said, you know, this has been -- this is our -- this is
5 sort of our -- we think that this is pretty much where
6 we're going to be for the -- as we go into January.
7 And as a practical matter, you know, I think that
8 that's good. I mean, I think that we've done a good
9 job of working through the statute and these rule
10 proposals efficiently. I think we gave the courts a
11 timeline for this process in responding to some of the
12 filings in some of the now three cases that are out
13 there, again, you know, trying to stop -- block Prop
14 211. I think we've kept to that timeline effectively.
15 We may be off by a month, but -- give or take, but I
16 think we've kept the -- kept that process moving along.
17 And I think -- you know, so we'll --

18 You know, I just want to thank the
19 Commissioners, you know, all of you, for -- I know
20 we've -- obviously I am a talkative person in certain
21 contexts and I go on and on sometimes at these
22 meetings. And, as a result of that and this new Act,
23 you know, we've spent a lot of -- I've spent a lot of
24 time talking at you about the -- what's in the Act
25 and -- to the best I can. And we've talked, I think --

Page 20

1 you know, certainly Commissioner Paton, Commissioner
2 Kimble, and other Commissioners have had good questions
3 about, you know, what we're trying to do -- or, what
4 the Act purports to do and what we're trying to do to
5 do our duty under the Act. And so I want to thank you
6 all, Commissioners, for your patience in sitting
7 through some of these longer PowerPoint presentations
8 and such to have a -- to get up to speed on what --
9 what we're doing.

10 And, you know, unless -- and not to continue
11 to prattle on, but unless you have any questions about
12 the comments, I'm -- you know, I'm available for them,
13 but otherwise I'm hopeful that you will approve the
14 draft with the changes that we recommend that's in your
15 packet.

16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And just to be clear, we
17 have received two sets of recommendations for changes
18 to proposed rules, and the staff has recommended that
19 some of those recommendations or requests be taken into
20 account, and those changes are included in Exhibit 1 of
21 this item, and in other cases they've recommended we
22 not follow the requests by the two organizations. So
23 what we're now looking at is Exhibit 1 of today's
24 Agenda.

25 Is there anyone else here in the audience or

Page 21

1 on Zoom who wishes to make public comment on these
2 rules?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing no one, is there
5 anyone -- any Commissioners who want to make any
6 comment or have any questions from Tom about the rules
7 as recommended for adoption?

8 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman.

9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.

10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I just want to state, for
11 the record, that I think -- I appreciate what Tom has
12 done in his memo because I feel like it's reflective of
13 his unbiased approach to things. He's willing to take,
14 you know, suggestions from interested parties who've
15 weighed in, consider them thoughtfully, and make
16 decisions on his recommendations to us on that basis
17 rather than, you know -- I guess what I want to say is,
18 I appreciate the thoughtfulness that Tom has exhibited
19 in his memo.

20 And at this time I don't have any questions,
21 and I don't want to -- you know, obviously if other
22 Commissioners do, that's fine. But the one question I
23 have is, would the motion be to approve with changes
24 reflected in the Executive Director Memo, Exhibit 1?
25 Is that, Tom, what we would be doing if we were going

Page 22

1 to just adopt, you know, approve your suggestions?
2 MR. COLLINS: I believe that that would be
3 perfectly reasonably clear for the record and people
4 would be able to understand what you're voting on. And
5 if we have a roll call on that, I think that would
6 be -- yes.
7 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. That's -- I just
8 wanted to make that statement for the record that, you
9 know, I think -- obviously the record does kind of
10 speak for itself in your memo, but I wanted to just
11 make that statement that I was impressed with the work
12 you've put into this.
13 And frankly, I appreciate all the parties --
14 I think we discussed this last time too. I'm very
15 appreciative of the time that interested parties have
16 put into this, because it's not easy. I mean, you
17 know, I want to acknowledge the work you've done, Tom,
18 and also the interested parties who've reviewed this
19 and weighed in with their thoughts, because I do think
20 it takes a village sometimes to make sure that all the
21 different interests and potential interests are
22 evaluated and thoroughly considered when we're
23 adopting -- considering adopting things like this. So
24 I just want to recognize that for you, as well as all
25 the folks who've weighed in.

Page 23

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
2 Chan. Those are very helpful comments. And I agree
3 that it would have been very easy for Tom and other
4 staff members who have worked on this to look at these
5 suggestions and say, no. We -- we did it. We -- we
6 don't need any of your suggestions. We got it right.
7 But there are some -- some thoughtful comments that we
8 received that have been incorporated in Exhibit 1, and
9 I think it makes -- it makes the rule stronger and more
10 clear for anyone who has questions. So thank you for
11 those comments, Commissioner Chan.
12 Any other comments or questions from Members
13 of the Commission?
14 (No response.)
15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, is there a
16 motion to adopt R2-20-809 through R2-20-813 with the
17 changes indicated in Exhibit 1 of the staff memo on
18 those items?
19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I would so
20 move.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
22 Commissioner Chan.
23 Is there a second?
24 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I would
25 second it.

Page 24

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
2 Commissioner Paton.
3 It's been moved and seconded to adopt
4 R2-20-809 through R2-20-813 with the changes indicated
5 in Exhibit 1 of the staff memo on those items. If
6 there's no further discussion, I'll call the roll.
7 Commissioner Chan.
8 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
10 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
12 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
14 The motion is approved 4-to-nothing.
15 Thank you very much, Commissioners. Thank
16 you very much, Tom.
17 Item V, public comments. This is the time
18 for consideration of comments and suggestions from the
19 public. Action taken as a result of public comment
20 will be limited to directing staff to study the matter
21 or rescheduling the matter for further consideration
22 and decision at a later date or responding to
23 criticism. If you have any comments, please limit them
24 to no more than two minutes.
25 Does any member of the public wish to make

Page 25

1 comments at this time either in person or on Zoom?
2 (No response.)
3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Going, going, no one.
4 MS. HERRING: No one.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.
6 The public may also send comments to the
7 Commission by mail or e-mail at
8 ccec@azcleelections.gov.
9 At this time, I would entertain a motion to
10 adjourn.
11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move that
12 we adjourn.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
14 Commissioner Chan.
15 Is there a second?
16 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton, second.
17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
18 Commissioner Paton.
19 I will call the roll on the motion to
20 adjourn. Commissioner Chan.
21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
23 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
25 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.

Page 26

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
2 We are adjourned. Thank you very much.
3 (The meeting adjourned at 10:09 a.m.)
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page 27

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
3
4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
13
14 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17
18 DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 27th day of
19 October, 2023.
20
21 
22
23 Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter #50666
24
25

<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>1 20:20,23 21:24 23:8, 17 24:5</p> <p>10:09 26:3</p> <p>16 17:2</p> <p>1st 8:1</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>a.m. 3:3 26:3</p> <p>ability 12:11,23 15:13</p> <p>accessible 9:19,21,23, 24</p> <p>account 20:20</p> <p>accurate 9:17</p> <p>acknowledge 22:17</p> <p>Act 12:24,25 17:1,9,11, 22 18:14 19:22,24 20:4, 5</p> <p>action 3:16 4:12 16:25 24:19</p> <p>active 5:6</p> <p>add 8:21 18:6</p> <p>additional 19:2</p> <p>address 10:3</p> <p>adjourn 25:10,12,20</p> <p>adjourned 26:2,3</p> <p>administrative 6:11 7:10</p> <p>adopt 22:1 23:16 24:3</p> <p>adopting 22:23</p> <p>adoption 16:25 21:7</p> <p>advised 6:24</p> <p>advisory 14:19,23</p> <p>affect 12:20</p> <p>AG's 6:22</p> <p>agency 6:17</p> <p>Agenda 3:2 17:2 20:24</p> <p>agree 23:2</p> <p>ahead 9:1</p> <p>Alec 8:14 9:14 11:13</p> <p>all-mail 5:2</p> <p>amendment 7:6</p> <p>amount 12:4,5</p> <p>Amy 3:10</p> <hr/>	<p>analytics 10:19,20</p> <p>anticipate 14:22</p> <p>anxiety 12:18</p> <p>appreciative 22:15</p> <p>approach 21:13</p> <p>approve 3:20,22 20:13 21:23 22:1</p> <p>approved 4:10 8:3 24:14</p> <p>arise 17:23</p> <p>Arizona 5:23 6:12 17:1</p> <p>Assessor's 7:1</p> <p>Association 11:24</p> <p>attached 14:20</p> <p>attendance 3:6</p> <p>attorney 6:13,14,17,21 7:5</p> <p>Attorney's 6:23</p> <p>audience 20:25</p> <p>authority 5:1</p> <p>authorizes 15:5</p> <p>automatic 11:22,23 12:8</p> <p>Avery 5:17</p> <p>aware 15:21</p> <p>aye 4:2,4,6,9 24:8,10, 12,13 25:21,23,25 26:1</p> <hr/>	<p>Bipartisan 7:19</p> <p>bit 5:13 8:20 14:25</p> <p>block 19:13</p> <p>bond 4:20</p> <p>boxes 15:3,5,16</p> <p>bring 8:16</p> <p>brought 7:20 15:1</p> <p>build 8:9,15</p> <p>built 9:14,15 10:6,11</p> <p>bullet 7:15</p> <hr/>
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>20 7:11</p> <p>2020 7:3 11:20</p> <p>2021 11:21</p> <p>2022 7:3 11:21,23</p> <p>2023 3:3,17</p> <p>2024 11:25</p> <p>211 17:3,14 19:14</p> <p>21st 3:17</p> <p>24 15:16</p> <p>26th 3:3</p> <hr/>	<p>address 10:3</p> <p>adjourn 25:10,12,20</p> <p>adjourned 26:2,3</p> <p>administrative 6:11 7:10</p> <p>adopt 22:1 23:16 24:3</p> <p>adopting 22:23</p> <p>adoption 16:25 21:7</p> <p>advised 6:24</p> <p>advisory 14:19,23</p> <p>affect 12:20</p> <p>AG's 6:22</p> <p>agency 6:17</p> <p>Agenda 3:2 17:2 20:24</p> <p>agree 23:2</p> <p>ahead 9:1</p> <p>Alec 8:14 9:14 11:13</p> <p>all-mail 5:2</p> <p>amendment 7:6</p> <p>amount 12:4,5</p> <p>Amy 3:10</p> <hr/>	<p>Association 11:24</p> <p>attached 14:20</p> <p>attendance 3:6</p> <p>attorney 6:13,14,17,21 7:5</p> <p>Attorney's 6:23</p> <p>audience 20:25</p> <p>authority 5:1</p> <p>authorizes 15:5</p> <p>automatic 11:22,23 12:8</p> <p>Avery 5:17</p> <p>aware 15:21</p> <p>aye 4:2,4,6,9 24:8,10, 12,13 25:21,23,25 26:1</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <p>call 3:2,4 4:1 7:3 22:5 24:6 25:19</p> <p>called 4:24</p> <p>calls 8:2</p> <p>Campaign 18:9</p> <p>campaigns 10:23</p> <p>candidate 7:11 13:10, 23 14:1</p> <p>candidates 7:12 13:11, 25 14:6,13</p> <p>capacity 8:10</p> <p>cases 15:1 19:12 20:21</p> <p>ccec@ azcleaselections. gov. 25:8</p> <p>Center 18:10</p> <p>central 8:4</p> <p>Chair 4:9 24:13 26:1</p> <p>Chairman 3:2,13,15, 19,21,24 4:3,5,7,14 8:22,24,25 9:1,2 11:9 15:24,25 16:6,12,15,18, 20,21 17:17 19:3 20:16 21:4,8,9 23:1,15,19,21 24:1,9,11,13 25:3,5,11, 13,17,22,24 26:1</p> <p>challenging 15:2</p> <p>Chan 3:10,14,19,21 4:1,2 21:8,9,10 22:7</p>
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>31st 5:9</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4-to-nothing 4:10 24:14</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>back 5:9 6:12 10:9 11:20 13:19 15:13</p> <p>ballot 4:23 5:5,9 8:6 15:13</p> <p>ballots 12:12,14 13:15 15:6</p> <p>basically 14:6</p> <p>basis 21:16</p> <p>big 8:12</p> <p>bill 11:21</p>	
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <p>6.1 17:1</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7th 4:17</p> <hr/>		
<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <p>813 17:19</p> <hr/>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9:30 3:3</p> <hr/>		

Exhibit 20:20,23 21:24 23:8,17 24:5	future 10:6	hopes 10:17	item 3:2,16 4:11 16:24 17:2 20:21 24:17
exhibited 21:18	<hr/> G	hours 15:16	items 23:18 24:5
expand 10:12	Galen 3:9	<hr/> I	IV 16:24
experience 6:20 13:25	gave 19:10	identify 3:7	<hr/> J
expert 12:25	general 12:11 13:14,16	II 3:16	January 19:6
eye 14:8,14	General's 6:14,15,17	III 4:11	job 19:9
eyes 11:17	Gina 6:3 8:13,19,24 9:1 11:9,13	impact 15:13	Johnson 7:5
<hr/> F	give 16:5,8 19:15	implement 17:11	joined 6:14
face 13:11	good 3:12,13 5:16 10:18 14:10 19:8 20:2	implementation 17:6	jurisdiction 4:24
facing 10:7	Google 10:23	important 5:25 6:21 7:15 8:13	<hr/> K
fact 11:23	government 6:18,21	impressed 22:11	Kara 15:25
factor 12:7	Governor 7:17 14:9	improve 6:8 7:23	Karen 6:12,20 7:5,8 16:3,8,18
fairly 15:12	Governor's 7:18 11:6, 18	improvements 10:16	KARLSON 15:24 16:1
fall 5:15	great 10:8 11:5	included 20:20	keeping 14:8
federal 8:18	grow 11:2	including 6:25 15:1	Kimble 3:2,13,15,21,24 4:3,5,7 8:24 9:1 11:9 15:25 16:6,12,15,18,21 19:3 20:2,16 21:4,9 23:1,15,21 24:1,9,11,13 25:3,5,13,17,22,24 26:1
feedback 18:22	guess 7:14,17 18:7,8 21:17	incorporated 23:8	kind 14:21 22:9
feel 21:12	<hr/> H	increasingly 8:18	<hr/> L
filed 16:3	hand 15:14	indication 11:19	languages 9:25
filing 17:4	handle 17:20	inducing 12:18	latitude 10:5
filings 19:12	handling 17:4	information 8:5,16 9:17,20 10:1,12 11:1 14:12 17:13	launch 6:5
final 7:25 17:5	happened 16:5	infrastructure 10:13	lawsuit 15:9
fine 21:22	happy 5:19	inordinate 12:4	lawyer 16:22
folks 5:5,7 7:20 15:13 22:25	harbor 12:23	institutions 5:24	left 14:21
follow 20:22	Hartman 6:12 16:10,20	intellectual 12:17	Legal 18:10
Force 7:19,20 8:4,6 11:6,18	hearing 16:4 21:4 23:15	interact 9:11	legislation 13:3
forward 8:15 10:11,14 11:17 17:11	helpful 23:2	interested 6:7 18:16 21:14 22:15,18	Legislature 11:21 14:9
frame 14:18	HERRING 25:4	interesting 6:8 12:17	limit 24:23
frankly 22:13	highlight 6:3 18:8	interests 22:21	limited 24:20
Free 15:2	home 4:20	internally 13:21	link 6:6
front 7:10 10:7	hope 17:11	involves 17:2	
funded 14:6	hopeful 20:13	issue 11:25 13:2,5,10 15:17	
funding 13:8,12 14:5		issues 12:6 17:21	

list 5:6	mention 4:16	officer 5:12 15:7	perfectly 22:3
litigation 7:2 15:1	met 7:7	officials 6:25 9:16 15:10,11	person 19:20 25:1
live 6:2	metro 9:10	one-stop 8:5	persons 18:13
local 4:21 8:18 9:15	mind 8:19,22 10:6	operate 10:10	perspective 7:15
location 9:12	minute 14:4,6	opinion 14:19,23	Phoenix 5:23 9:10
long 6:20 15:17	minutes 3:17,18,20,22 4:10 24:24	opportunity 16:9	pin 10:4
longer 20:7	mission 9:5	opposed 18:12	place 10:14 18:17
longitude 10:5	money 14:7	order 3:3,5 17:13	point 7:15 18:15
lot 7:2 12:3 13:6 18:6 19:23	month 5:14 14:20,22 19:15	ordinarily 14:1	position 11:2 15:20
lowered 11:22	monthly 10:20	organically 10:22	positive 7:16
<hr/>			
M			
mail 4:23 5:9 15:6 25:7	morning 3:12,13	organizations 20:22	potential 22:21
mailed 5:5	motion 21:23 23:16 24:14 25:9,19	outline 17:4,19	potentially 12:1
mailing 12:14	move 3:19 23:20 25:11	outlined 18:1,3	Powerpoint 20:7
make 9:16,21 10:16 15:21 21:1,5,15 22:8, 11,20 24:25	moved 3:21 24:3	outreach 5:14,16	practical 19:7
makes 11:6 23:9	moving 13:18 19:16	override 4:21	practice 7:6
Manual 15:4	multiple 9:25	overseas 12:14	prattle 20:11
margins 14:2	municipal 4:21	<hr/>	
Maricopa 6:23 15:15, 18	N		
Mark 3:15 7:4	nationwide 6:9	pace 5:16,18	prepared 17:15
matter 19:7 24:20,21	Network 6:4	packet 20:15	Prescott 16:3
means 4:23 5:3	news 7:16 9:3 10:18	paid 10:22,23	presence 5:25
media 10:22,23	nice 16:21	pamphlet 13:11	present 10:1
meet 7:9 11:3,8 12:23	nomenclature 6:16	panelist 6:4	presentations 20:7
meeting 3:4,17 10:17 14:24 18:19 19:2 26:3	nominee 12:11	part 5:25 9:9 13:9	pretty 19:5
meetings 17:8 19:22	nominees 13:16	participated 5:17 7:2, 12	preview 14:22
meets 9:8	nonprofit 7:21	parties 21:14 22:13,15, 18	primary 12:8,9 13:8,17, 19
member 24:25	nonstandard 10:3	parts 7:22	primed 11:7
members 23:4,12	November 4:17 8:1	passed 11:21	print 13:15
memo 17:15 18:4,6,16 21:12,19,24 22:10 23:17 24:5	<hr/>		
	O		
	occurring 9:13	patience 20:6	printing 12:12
	October 3:3 5:9	Paton 3:9,14,23,25 4:3, 4 20:1 23:24 24:2,9,10 25:16,18,22,23	procedurally 16:2
	Office 6:14,15,18,22, 24,25 7:1,18	past 6:24	Procedures 15:4
		people 10:21 13:15 14:4 22:3	process 17:3,19 19:11, 16

proper 8:8	range 7:24	resolved 14:17	serve 11:8
proposals 7:24 19:10	readers 9:25	responding 19:11 24:22	service 10:8
proposed 17:16 20:18	real 6:10 11:16 15:17	response 16:2,17 21:3 23:14 25:2	serving 9:5
Proposition 17:3,14	recall 7:4,18	rest 8:14 11:13	sets 20:17
Protection 6:5	received 17:10,25 20:17 23:8	result 19:22 24:19	shop 8:5
provide 10:13 14:12,21	recognition 8:13 9:4 11:5	return 14:7 15:6,7	show 10:19
providing 11:1	recognize 22:24	reviewed 22:18	side 13:7,8,14,23
provisions 12:24 17:22	recognizes 8:7,8	reviewing 17:8	signs 4:20
public 7:6 17:12 21:1 24:17,19,25 25:6	recommend 5:7 19:1 20:14	Revised 17:1	simply 10:4
published 17:9	recommendations 11:19 20:17,19 21:16	ROBERTS 8:23,25 9:2	single 9:18
pull 10:10	recommended 20:18, 21 21:7	roles 6:22	site 9:4
purport 12:24	record 3:8 21:11 22:3, 8,9	roll 4:1 22:5 24:6 25:19	sitting 20:6
purports 20:4	Recorder 15:7,15	room 16:22	situation 15:23
purposes 8:2 11:25	Recorder's 6:25	rule 17:16,18 19:9 23:9	sooner 14:11
pursuant 16:25	records 7:6	rules 16:25 17:3,5,10 20:18 21:2,6	sort 8:5 12:17 15:22 18:2 19:5
put 5:17,22 22:12,16	recount 12:2,9,19	running 7:11	source 9:18
putting 9:20	recounts 11:22,23 12:3	runs 12:13	speak 22:10
<hr/>	redesign 10:15	rural 9:9	specific 18:3
Q	refers 15:3	<hr/>	speed 20:8
qualification 13:24	reflected 21:24	S	spent 17:7 19:23
qualify 14:3	reflective 21:12	safe 12:23	staff 15:16 17:15 20:18 23:4,17 24:5,20
qualifying 13:12 14:2	regulate 18:11	save 5:2	stakeholders 17:12
question 12:10 21:22	reiterate 11:12	Scholars 6:4	standpoint 9:24
questions 16:15 18:3 20:2,11 21:6,20 23:10, 12	related 4:20 13:4 17:16,21 18:10	school 4:20,25	started 7:18
queue 17:6	relationships 9:14,15	screen 9:24	state 4:19 5:1,23 6:12, 18 7:22 8:12,17 9:6,9, 11 12:23 18:16 21:10
quick 6:10 11:16	remedy 12:1	searching 10:24	statement 13:10 22:8, 11
quorum 3:14	report 4:13 7:25 8:2,7	seconded 24:3	statute 5:1 15:5 19:9
<hr/>	request 14:19	section 6:15,17	Statutes 17:2
R	requests 20:19,22	sector 7:21	Steptoe 7:5
R2-20-809 17:19 23:16 24:4	requirements 17:4,9	send 6:6 25:6	Steve 3:11
R2-20-813 23:16 24:4	rescheduling 24:21	sending 12:14	stop 19:13
raise 15:17		sense 11:6	story 12:22
raised 11:24		separately 18:13	
		September 3:17	

Strategic 6:4
stressed 9:7
stronger 23:9
structuring 17:22
study 24:20
stuff 6:11
substance 17:8
substantially 17:21
successful 9:5 11:1
15:10
suggestions 21:14
22:1 23:5,6 24:18
suppose 17:21
suspect 14:11
system 11:7
systems 10:9

T

takes 22:20
talk 5:13 7:22 18:18
19:1
talkative 19:20
talked 19:25
talking 18:17 19:24
Task 7:19,20 8:4,6
11:6,18
team 8:14 11:13
terms 7:16
things 11:16 13:9
14:17 18:1 21:13 22:23
thinking 10:11,14
thoughtful 23:7
thoughtfully 21:15
thoughtfulness 21:18
thoughts 18:2 22:19
threshold 11:22 12:2
tied 13:8
tight 12:6

time 4:22 12:3,4,5
14:18 19:24 21:20
22:14,15 24:17 25:1,9
timeline 19:11,14
timely 9:16
Titla 3:11,14 4:5,6,8
24:11,12 25:24,25
title 6:13 17:2
today 7:8
today's 20:23
Tom 4:13 11:10 16:13
17:16 21:6,11,18,25
22:17 23:3 24:16
tomorrow 16:4
town 4:25
travel 10:3
Treasurer's 7:1
Tuesday 5:10 7:17
turn 14:7

U

unbiased 21:13
understand 22:4
uniformed 12:14
unstaffed 15:3
UOCAVA 12:15
update 16:2,5
user 10:2

V

vehicle 8:8
view 18:15
village 22:20
violates 15:5
vision 8:15
vote 5:4
Votebeat 12:22 13:4
voted 5:9 7:24

voter 5:6,13 9:7,23 13:7
voters 8:5,12,17 9:5,8,
11,20 10:9,13,18,25
11:2,4,8 12:15
Voters' 16:25
votes 4:9 24:13 26:1
voting 22:4

W

wanted 4:16 5:13 6:3,
10,11 15:21 16:1,5,8
18:22 22:8,10
ways 7:22
website 8:4,7 9:10,19,
25 10:6,8,17,22,24 11:3
weeks 13:19,20,24
15:2
weighed 21:15 22:19,
25
who've 21:14 22:18,25
wishes 21:1
words 14:3
work 8:8,13 11:12 13:6
17:11 22:11,17
worked 6:22 23:4
working 13:3,25 19:9
workshops 7:11,12
worth 6:15
wrapped 11:18
written 3:20

Y

year 4:22 17:7
years 6:24
yesterday 16:3

Z

Zoom 21:1 25:1