

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
March 28, 2024
9:30 a.m.

By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50666



Page 2

1 PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a.m. on March 28,
3 2024, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections
4 Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference Room,
5 Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following
6 Board Members:
7
8 Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
9 Mr. Galen Paton
10 Ms. Amy Chan
11 Mr. Steve Titla
12 Mr. Damien Meyer

13 OTHERS PRESENT:
14
15 Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
16 Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
17 Mike Becker, Policy Director
18 Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director
19 Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager
20 Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General
21 Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon
22 Cathy Herring, Meeting Planner, KCA
23 Jessica Painter, KCA
24 Paige Jarrell, KCA
25

Page 3

1 P R O C E E D I N G
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: My name is Mark Kimble.
3 And Agenda Item I is the call to order. It is
4 9:30 a.m. on March 28th, 2024. I call this meeting of
5 the Citizens Clean Elections Commission to order.
6 With that, we will take attendance.
7 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
8 record.
9 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Good morning.
10 Damien Meyer.
11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I think we have
13 Commissioner Titla and Commissioner Paton also with us,
14 is that correct? You both appear to be on mute.
15 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Yes, sir. It's
16 Steve Titla here. Good morning, everybody.
17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning,
18 Commissioner Titla.
19 Commissioner Paton, are you with us too? I
20 see you appear to be on mute.
21 COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. We have all
23 five Commissioners present.
24 Item II, possible -- discussion and possible
25 action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024 meeting.

Page 4

1 Commissioners, you have the minutes from the February
2 meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion?
3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I'd like
4 to --
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
6 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'd like to move that we
7 adopt the minutes as written.
8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
9 Commissioner Chan.
10 We have a motion to adopt the minutes. Is
11 there a second?
12 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second that motion.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by
14 Commissioner Meyer.
15 I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.
16 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
20 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
22 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
24 The motion to approve the minutes is approved
25 unanimously.

Page 5

1 Item III is discussion and possible action on
2 the Executive Director's Report. Tom.
3 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Commissioners,
4 and thank you all for being here. And I know all of
5 you have a lot of different things going on, whether --
6 you know, obviously Mr. Chairman's voice and other
7 things, so I really appreciate you all making it here
8 today. I think that's an important thing, because I
9 think it's important to reflect on the fact that --
10 that this is an active board that manages the program
11 that it administrates and has continued to do that
12 month after month even under circumstances that aren't
13 always ideal, so -- so I -- I just want to thank you
14 for being here.
15 I'll try to get through this -- the
16 highlights of the report pretty quickly. The
17 presidential preference election was on March 19th.
18 The final canvass will be on April 4th. And so far the
19 unofficial turnout rate is 39 -- close to 40 percent.
20 And then we'll have another local election on our -- on
21 May 21st, 2024, and Alec will be doing the really
22 intensive labor of making sure that our website is up
23 to date for anybody who has an election, any local
24 jurisdiction that has an election in that -- on that
25 date.

Page 6	Page 8
<p>1 I wanted to hit a couple -- highlight a 2 couple of things in our voter education. I had the 3 opportunity to go out and -- and Gina and Avery 4 obviously did the work of being at the Arizona Civics 5 Coalition's Civics Night at the museum at -- at the -- 6 the Arizona -- an Arizona historical museum on 7 College -- on College and Curry. I still can't quite 8 get the name down, but it's a very beautiful facility. 9 And there were lots of teachers -- civics teachers from 10 around the state, and our table there got a lot of -- a 11 lot of visitors, and that's great. 12 You know, it's interesting, the -- last year 13 Avery was on a panel at the McCain Institute that 14 involved some very high-profile national pollsters on 15 youth voting, and so that continues to -- so he 16 continues to generate media off of that through -- both 17 internationally and then nationally through this 18 interview he did with the students from Montclair 19 State. 20 And then Gina was a panelist on the follow-up 21 to the ASU Pastor Center's -- in the next installation 22 of the ASU Pastor Center's Diversifying Political 23 Engagement Series, and so that's available -- available 24 to watch. 25 I think that -- I have a couple of highlights</p>	<p>1 the Americans for Prosperity's claim against Prop 211. 2 So a lot of action happening there. I 3 believe that the Supreme Court will conference the 4 motion to transfer in April at its conference. And 5 then, if things stay status quo, there should -- there 6 would be an argument in the Toma case in the first week 7 of May. 8 There's obviously a lot of other court 9 activity going on around the state involving elections. 10 I don't want to spend too much time on that other than 11 to say, please let us know if you need to know more 12 about any of that. 13 I wanted to -- you know, quickly, before I 14 get into one other item, I wanted to, you know, also, 15 you know, say, you know, we've had -- as we'll see in 16 the forthcoming presentations today, we're doing a lot 17 of work on the voter education front and we're doing 18 quite a bit of work with candidates as we come into 19 filing season. And so I also wanted to, you know, 20 mention that, you know, what that has done is it's 21 meant that, you know, Paula has had a -- probably a 22 bigger and more -- and different and more diverse array 23 of transactions to negotiate and get through for us as 24 we -- as we get through this -- you know, as we launch 25 our new debate program and the things that Gina will be</p>
Page 7	Page 9
<p>1 I need to mention quickly on the legal front. So 2 the -- you'll note just since the -- this report was 3 published, I'll just note that the Center for Arizona 4 Policy versus Arizona Secretary of State, which is one 5 of the Prop -- Prop 211 cases, so Center -- they filed 6 their notice of appeal on Monday. And then my 7 understanding is that they then very quickly filed a 8 motion to have their case transferred up to the State 9 Supreme Court, along with where the -- where there is a 10 motion pending in this case called Toma v. Fontes, 11 where there is a motion to transfer that case from the 12 Court of Appeals to the Arizona Supreme Court. 13 The Toma v. Fontes case, the Court of Appeals 14 yesterday issued a stay that was asked for by the 15 plaintiffs to stay the plaintiffs' lawsuit at the 16 Superior Court level pending the plaintiffs' appeal 17 from the denial of the plaintiffs' motion for 18 preliminary injunction. So for the lawyers on the 19 call, that's kind of an odd procedural posture; but 20 nevertheless, at this point the Court of Appeals has 21 granted that stay to the plaintiffs of the plaintiffs' 22 action. 23 And then, of course, importantly, and lest I 24 forget, last week the District Court granted the 25 Commission and the other defendants' motion to dismiss</p>	<p>1 talking to you about, and not to mention just 2 maintaining the day-to-day operation of this -- of this 3 meeting and these other things. So I wanted to make 4 sure to acknowledge that it's been -- it's been a 5 very -- you know, the last two quarters for Paula have 6 been probably as busy as they've been for some time, 7 but I really appreciate that work by her. 8 And I also wanted to also say that, you know, 9 I've had the opportunity to just be in the office and 10 talking to some of the candidates. You know, Mike 11 handles so many candidate conversations on a day-to-day 12 basis with candidates who are interested in running 13 clean, candidates who have questions about campaign 14 finance, candidates who have questions about, you know, 15 the paperwork, I mean, just any number of things. And 16 I can tell you, from talking to the folks who call, 17 that the level of rapport and trust that our 18 constituents -- those customers applauded Mike's 19 responsiveness and -- both substantive responsiveness 20 and his timely responsiveness is something that I want 21 to -- I wanted to mention as well. 22 I did want to spend a little time on this 23 Attorney General's Office correspondence issue, in part 24 because, you know, it's something I want to put in some 25 context. You know, we -- so as you can see if you've</p>

Page 10

1 read the report, we got this letter on March 5th that
2 said, hey, we've had this what they describe in their
3 words as an investigation open into the Commission
4 since they arrived in office in March, because it was
5 apparently waiting for them in November -- in
6 December '22. You know, so why -- why does this
7 matter? Well, I think it's pretty self-evident. We
8 tried to lay out here, in as -- or, I tried to lay out
9 here, in as neutral of terms as I could, the factual
10 history, as we understand, from our perspective.
11 Because, you know, we've gone through some of
12 these things before with, you know, other offices, I
13 really want to first say, you know, so we can sort of
14 reestablish, so that folks understand this, why are we
15 -- why am I talking about this to you in public, as I
16 get a chance to sit here, and -- and the reason for
17 that is not to start some stevedore's brawl with the
18 Attorney General's Office, but it's because this, as I
19 said at the beginning, this board actively
20 administrates and enforces the Clean Elections Act and
21 the Voters' Right to Know Act.
22 This is not an absentee board. This is a
23 board that is here at every meeting and intimately
24 involved in the decisions we make, and we have working
25 meetings in public about public matters. And that's

Page 11

1 because, as an institution for the past 20 years, with
2 many of the same staff members as we have now, we have
3 been focused on ensuring that we follow the open
4 meeting law as well as we possibly can, in addition to
5 other transparency laws.
6 So, you know, to boil this down a little bit,
7 you know, the things that sort of stand out as why I'm
8 saying -- why I plan to seek some outside assistance on
9 how to get my arms around this relationship is, you
10 know, the decision that the Solicitor General's Office
11 Government Accountability Division made about whether
12 or not to keep this case seems to be based on whether
13 or not, you know, an attorney gave specific advice, I
14 guess, on the placement of the minutes on our website,
15 but not the role of the AG in advising us on the open
16 meeting law, or, in this case, the specific person who
17 filed the complaint, and we can't -- we haven't been
18 able to identify any formal screen. This is an adverse
19 position, and we weren't given any notice of it.
20 And then, you know, I think problematically,
21 rather than just dismiss the matter because there was
22 no legal violation, the person who wrote this letter
23 thought it was a good idea to take a shot at our
24 website maintenance and our compliance as a, quote,
25 unquote, recommendation. Well, that's not -- that's

Page 12

1 not what you do in an enforcement matter, especially
2 when, you know, you're already dealing with your own
3 client.
4 You know, and this is complicated because if
5 what this means is that either conflicts don't count
6 when it comes to the Solicitor General's Office or
7 we're not clients when we talk to the Solicitor
8 General's Office, those raise real issues around what's
9 confidential, what's privileged, it implicates the
10 public records law, it implicates discovery.
11 And here this letter validated a complainant
12 who had already established himself as adverse to the
13 Commission and who we had already been advised on
14 dealing with in an open meeting by an attorney for the
15 Attorney General's Office. So that's slicing the onion
16 pretty fine, and it doesn't appear that anyone in the
17 Solicitor General's Office had a second thought before
18 this letter rolled out.
19 So I think that, you know, we can -- we will
20 hear -- we could hear, I'm sure, and I know from past
21 experience with other Attorney Generals we often hear
22 something about how complicated the nature of
23 governmental attorneys is, there's all kinds of
24 in-and-outs and that kind of thing. I don't think this
25 one is that complicated: I think we're the client; I

Page 13

1 think they're the law firm. And so, you know, like I
2 say, I have an obligation to make these reports the way
3 I do. It's based on 25 years of precedent and this
4 body being transparent about these kind of issues.
5 And so my goal is to get this back on the
6 right track, but -- you know, but the number of
7 decisions -- you know, in a relatively small
8 transaction, the number of decisions that went against
9 the client is a lot. I mean, it's like five different
10 decision points there were to get off this train, and
11 at no time did they get off the train, and I think that
12 that's something that we've just got to have some
13 real -- real conversation with them, and that's -- and
14 I intend to do that.
15 So that's, you know, that's kind of the
16 report. I know that last one may sound a little
17 dramatic, but, you know, at this point this is nothing
18 if not ordinary to have a little -- a little -- a
19 little -- I don't know what the right word is because I
20 don't know sports metaphors well enough. But, you
21 know, between the two agencies I think we'll work that
22 out, but on this one the lines are pretty -- the lines
23 are pretty clear.
24 So that concludes my report, I believe,
25 unless anybody thinks I'm missing anything. Anyone

Page 14

1 want me to keep talking? Mr. Chairman, if you have any
2 questions for me on my report, I'm happy to take those.
3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Thank you, Tom.
4 Do we have any discussion or questions from
5 Members of the Commission?
6 (No response.)
7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, we'll move
8 on.
9 Item IV, discussion and possible action on
10 2024 voter education activities, including candidate
11 debates and the Voter Education Guide. We're a few
12 days away from the filing deadline for candidates for
13 the July 30th primary and about a month away from the
14 kickoff of our debate program. Gina Roberts, our voter
15 education director, will have a report on our progress
16 on these projects.
17 Gina.
18 MS. ROBERTS: Good morning, Commissioners.
19 Yes, what we have for you today is an overview of where
20 we are. We are knee deep in preparing for our debates
21 and for the Voter Education Guide, so we thought it
22 would be timely to provide an update to the Commission.
23 So I do have some slides, just to help me stay on
24 track, of our updates.
25 And we'll go ahead and get started with this

Page 15

1 first slide, please. Thank you.
2 So our schedule is now public. It is
3 available on our website. And we have our schedule for
4 all of our federal, statewide, and legislative debates
5 that are published. We are working on a handful of
6 county races, and we'll get that information up
7 shortly.
8 Previously, when we were working through the
9 schedule, we did send out save the dates to all of the
10 candidates so they would be able to have that
11 information as soon as possible and be able to go ahead
12 and get those on their calendar. We will send official
13 invitations out once we know who the final candidates
14 that have qualified for the ballot will be.
15 As the Chairman mentioned, we're coming up on
16 the close of the candidate filing period, and that will
17 tell us who the candidates that have filed petitions to
18 qualify for the ballot are, and then, of course, we
19 have our challenge period. And so once we know the
20 final ballot makeup, which will be around April 15th,
21 we'll know for sure who gets an official invite into
22 the Clean Elections debate.
23 And just a reminder, our debates, we will
24 only have them if there's a contested primary. So
25 somebody has to actually be in a contested election,

Page 16

1 have a competitor in order for us to host the debate.
2 So, again, the schedule is available. We do
3 kick off at the beginning of May with our first debate.
4 And voters are able to see that schedule as well on our
5 website.
6 We can go to the next slide, please.
7 So an update on our broadcast debates. So
8 our broadcast debates are going to be our federal and
9 statewide debates. And we -- as we had mentioned
10 previously in the voter education report for 2024, we
11 have a new partnership that we are working with,
12 Riester and the Arizona Media Association. And so with
13 that comes a new filming location, which will be at
14 BitFire Studios. That's located in northern Phoenix,
15 and we were able to take a tour of it, and it is a
16 beautiful facility that is very state of the art. And
17 so with the technology that they have, I'm very excited
18 that I -- I believe we will be able to at least
19 visually create a new and improved debate style. So it
20 should look really well. We're very excited with the
21 tools that are available to us through this new studio.
22 And right now we're in the process of
23 developing our stage design and the graphics that
24 voters will see on screen. As we mentioned, with this
25 partnership with the Arizona Media Association, every

Page 17

1 media partner in the state of Arizona will have the
2 option to pick up these debates. And so with that,
3 they'll be able to put their own branding on it, but we
4 will always have the Clean Elections logo in there, and
5 so it's a great opportunity to expand reach to the
6 voters of Arizona.
7 In regards to the debate format, this is
8 really exciting too, the Arizona Media Association has
9 put together a steering committee, and these are --
10 it's just really another opportunity to showcase that
11 stakeholders are having their input heard and respected
12 and received by the Commission on what these debates
13 should look like. And it's also being -- the format is
14 also being created in conjunction with what the debate
15 workgroup recommendations were.
16 So what we're looking at right now is
17 editorial control, which will be fully retained by the
18 moderator of the debate. One interesting point too
19 that I think that came up was how we are going to be
20 handling our mics. So during the debates for the
21 broadcast we will not have hot mics all the time. It
22 would -- only the person who is speaking will have
23 their mic actually on. So that will help the moderator
24 control the flow of the discussion, and the moderator
25 will ensure that candidates get near equal speaking

Page 18

1 time, that no one candidate dominates a discussion.
2 We will have some standard time limits in
3 place. We'll have two minutes for opening statements,
4 one minute for closing. And then each candidate that
5 gets asked a question, they'll have their two-minute
6 initial response time, and then candidates will also
7 get a one-minute rebuttal.
8 So, again, this format is really derived
9 from, one, those recommendations from the debate
10 workgroup, but also in consultation with the
11 stakeholder steering committee through the Arizona
12 Media Association, which, again, we're talking about
13 our folks here who are journalists across the state,
14 media members, and have a lot of experience in the
15 debate process.
16 We are also currently finalizing our
17 moderator selections. So we put out a call for
18 moderators to folks who have those journalistic
19 backgrounds and we are working through those
20 selections. We hope to finalize that by the end of
21 this week and get them on board hopefully by early next
22 week. And with that comes -- as I mentioned, every
23 media partner in the state has the option to pick up
24 the debates, so they have all been notified of the
25 schedule.

Page 19

1 And the broadcast, we are making our progress
2 on ensuring that all broadcasts include an ASL inbox
3 feed and we will also have a Spanish feed. So this
4 goes to making sure that the debates are as accessible
5 as possible.
6 Next, we can move on to the next slide, which
7 is an overview of our legislative debates. So our
8 broadcast debates, again, those are going to be
9 available on TV. With our legislative debates, we host
10 those through Zoom and we stream them through the Clean
11 Elections YouTube channel. However, again, through our
12 partnership with the Arizona Media Association, we will
13 make sure that any media entity that wants to have
14 access to the stream, they will be able to pick it up.
15 We have brought on a debate consultant to
16 help us with our legislative debate process. That is
17 actually Steve Goldstein. He's a very well-known name
18 in the state of Arizona. He has over 25 years of
19 journalist experience. He's award winning at national
20 and local levels. And so Steve has a lot of experience
21 with debates, and, in fact, he's moderated some of our
22 debates in the past.
23 And so we are very excited to bring him on to
24 help us coordinate, one, with the new recommendations
25 of the debate workgroup, but also -- one thing I'll

Page 20

1 talk about in the next slide too is, again, some of the
2 post-debate activities that we'll be implementing to
3 help to continue to push content out to the voters once
4 the debate concludes, but I'll talk about that in the
5 next slide. So we're very excited to bring Steve on
6 board.
7 He will also be hosting our moderator
8 training for us, and we plan to have that done in the
9 middle of April. And for our legislative debates we
10 also did a call for moderators, and so we're working
11 through finalizing that -- those moderator assignments
12 as well.
13 In addition to a debate consultant, we've
14 also brought on a debate writer that we've used in the
15 past, and this writer is Hank Stephenson with the
16 Arizona Agenda, and he will help us create some stock
17 debate questions. So typically with our debates we
18 like the questions to come from the voters, we want
19 them to come from the voters, and we ask voters to
20 submit those to us either in advance of the debate or
21 they can submit them live during the debate actually
22 happening.
23 With that, we also do our issue research,
24 which we've -- are actually close to wrapping up and we
25 will have our final report on April 1st for that. And

Page 21

1 that's where we put out a poll to voters across the
2 state about what issues they think are important and
3 want to hear the candidates talk about. So with all of
4 that content and Hank's background as a journalist, he
5 will develop stock questions for us for the moderators
6 to have in their back pocket just in case, you know,
7 maybe we have, you know, some quiet voters in a certain
8 district, and so that way we have questions that are
9 prepared and available for the moderator to use that
10 are still reflective of the issues that we know are
11 important to voters in those particular regions.
12 With that, for our legislative debates, we
13 are also finalizing the format. This was perhaps one
14 of the biggest changes to our debate process that came
15 out of the debate workgroup. This is where we decided
16 to structure our debates by party and by chamber. So
17 essentially we have one legislative event per evening,
18 but within that we have our subdebates. So we worked
19 through a format and a template for our moderators to
20 follow seamlessly once again to ensure that candidates
21 have near equal speaking time, but that it's also very
22 clear for the voters about who the true competitors
23 are.
24 Our debates, again, for -- on the legislative
25 side, we try to make them as accessible as possible.

Page 22

1 We will have closed captioning available. And, as I
2 mentioned before, with streaming they will be available
3 for all of our media partners to pick up.
4 We can go to the next slide.
5 So for debates, voter education and outreach.
6 We have these debates, we're working on the production
7 of them, that's one component of it, but how do we get
8 the voters engaged, how do we get them to tune in, and
9 also, how do we ensure that the debates are tailored to
10 the voter, that they're relevant and meaningful to the
11 voter.
12 So as I mentioned, we do that issue research.
13 We have that poll that's out so that we can talk to
14 voters and have a better understanding about, you know,
15 again, what issues do you care about, and we have our
16 moderators who will take that information to help shape
17 and guide the discussion at the debates.
18 We plan on creating subject matter expert
19 videos. So if we hear that water conservation is one
20 of those top issues that voters have identified, then
21 we intend to bring in a water conservation specialist
22 and just create an educational and informational video
23 to further help voters understand what these issues are
24 and how it's currently affecting the state. And that
25 would be, again, just more from an educational

Page 23

1 standpoint, not necessarily policy as the candidates
2 would discuss.
3 We also plan to do behind-the-scenes videos
4 of the debate process; that's always interesting
5 content to help capture voters' eyes. And we'll create
6 preview videos as where -- as well where we will be
7 able to -- let's say, for example, we'll film Tom
8 talking about, okay, here is this upcoming U.S. Senate
9 debate. Here is what we expect the candidates to talk
10 about and the top issues. And so we'll be able to push
11 them onto social media to help, again, capture the
12 attention of voters and get them interested in watching
13 the debate.
14 We also have our paid media which we'll push
15 out to let voters know across the state, here is the
16 schedule and here is how you can submit your questions.
17 We're looking at hosting a media day where
18 we'd like to bring in media members to help them
19 understand, here is the debate process, here is how you
20 can cover it, here is how you can be involved, here is
21 how you can attend and, you know, be in the media room
22 during our broadcast debates.
23 We also intend to host meetings with the
24 political parties and talk to them about what this new
25 debate season looks like and the rules of engagement

Page 24

1 for candidates and, again, the top issues voters are
2 talking about. All of this is intended to create that
3 buy-in to the debate process.
4 We also are creating toolkits for the
5 candidates and the voters; toolkits for the candidates
6 so that they can promote their participation in the
7 Clean Elections debates and toolkits for voters so they
8 can participate.
9 Avery actually has a meeting coming up where
10 he'll be working with NAU and their student association
11 on how to host a debate watch party, so great things
12 there. I mean, one of the things he mentioned was
13 possibly doing a debate bingo card, so things like that
14 to get people engaged and excited about watching the
15 debates, that's part of our grassroots outreach as
16 well.
17 We are also -- as part of the debate
18 workgroup recommendation, we have a texting service
19 that we'll be piloting. So one of the recommendations
20 was, you know, hey, maybe a voter can just get a quick
21 text message saying, your legislative district debate
22 is tonight, tune in. So we started researching how we
23 could utilize a texting service, we implemented it, and
24 started beginning sign-ups for voters. So we will be
25 kicking that off on a soft level to try to get voters

Page 25

1 educated about the schedule through this texting
2 service.
3 And then another opportunity that we have,
4 and this goes back to what I was mentioning with Steve
5 Goldstein, is our post-debate efforts. So once the
6 debate happens, it's not over. We want these debates
7 to continue to be able to be available for voters up
8 until they cast their ballot. So our schedule has us
9 wrapping up our debates near the start of early voting,
10 but what we want to do, and this is, again, in
11 alignment with the debate workgroup, is take that
12 debate content and create bite-sized pieces of
13 information, highlights, social media reels, Instagram
14 reels, if you will, where we can further promote these
15 debates and try to get voters engaged and interested in
16 watching the entire debate.
17 So what we intend to do is, after the --
18 after all of our debates conclude, we'll have the
19 moderators come in and Steve will interview them.
20 Steve Goldstein has -- is a podcaster. He has great
21 experience as -- hosting podcasts and doing interviews.
22 So he will talk to the moderators and talk about, okay,
23 you know, what surprised you, things like that, and
24 then he will also go through the videos and identify
25 those bookmarks for us to take from the debates and

Page 26

1 create those reels. So we're excited about creating
2 these bite-sized pieces of content that will hopefully
3 drive voters to watch the full debate.
4 And then we're also looking at an opportunity
5 to bring debates into the classroom. So this is an
6 exciting opportunity for us to work with the educator
7 community across the state. As Tom mentioned in the
8 Executive Director's Report, we were at a civics event
9 and we had the opportunity to talk to a lot of
10 educators. And our table was quite full. We had a lot
11 of folks coming to talk to us both about our debates
12 and our Voter Education Guide, because they find these
13 tools to be very useful for the students in the
14 classroom. They like to get the students engaged in
15 discussion about debates, and also actually flipping
16 through the physical Guides to research the candidates,
17 to talk about government, to talk about elections. And
18 so the tools that we are providing for voters, our
19 educators are also finding them very useful.
20 So what we want to offer the opportunity is
21 we are always available to come out and talk to
22 classrooms, to talk about elections. We can host mock
23 elections, but we can also host mock debates. And then
24 we can work with not just the student government
25 teachers, but also the English teachers and the student

Page 27

1 council and the debate club, the debate team to help
2 bring forward these debates.
3 And then another piece here that we have, all
4 in the name of encouraging people to participate in the
5 debate process and utilize these tools, we are looking
6 to create a segment that talks about unforgettable
7 debates and historic moments. So this is where we will
8 look back in history on important debates that have
9 occurred and, again, kind of highlight those and drive
10 home the importance of why debates matter.
11 So this quote here that I have, "By embracing
12 debate, individuals can become more adept at navigating
13 complex issues and engaging with diverse perspectives,
14 ultimately contributing to a more informed and
15 understanding world." And this is coming from Oxford.
16 And the intent here is to show that we, as humans,
17 we've been debating for our entire lives, going back to
18 historical debates and important events, such as, you
19 know, the Athenian democracy in ancient Greece and, you
20 know, the Han dynasty in imperial China.
21 We all -- we have seen in history how
22 debates -- whether they're philosophical or political
23 or religious, debating is a part of our culture, of our
24 history. And so creating this series, it will help,
25 again, showcase why debates matter, why they're

Page 28

1 important, important to not only the candidates, but to
2 the voters and how they contribute to that informed
3 perspective. So we have a lot going on in the voter
4 education and outreach front for debates.
5 We can go to the next slide.
6 I can jump into the Voter Education Guide
7 here, Mr. Chairman, if you'd like, or I can pause for
8 questions on the debate process.
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Do we have any questions
10 from Commissioners on the debate process? Very, very
11 impressive, Amy -- I mean, Gina.
12 (No response.)
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: No, no questions at this
14 point?
15 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I wish I could take
16 credit for all the work Gina is doing and her team.
17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Gina, why don't you
18 continue.
19 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Yes,
20 it is pretty impressive. We like that.
21 So for our Voter Guide, again, this -- I'll
22 share -- I'll remind, the Voter Education Guide is
23 consistently ranked, in all of our research where we
24 talk to voters, as one of the top tools that voters
25 trust and look forward to and utilize during the

Page 29

1 election process. So we are constantly looking at ways
2 to make sure that the Voter Guide continues to remain
3 relevant and important and meaningful for our voters.
4 So we had a kickoff meeting with our process
5 where we met with the United States Postal Service,
6 which is very important to keep them involved in our
7 process. We simply don't want to show up at the post
8 office and drop 2.3 million pieces of mail and say,
9 here you go. So they are a very critical partner to
10 us. And so Paula was able to coordinate a meeting
11 where we had all of our representatives from across the
12 state. Because, again, we're mailing these across the
13 state, so it's important that we are not just looking
14 at Maricopa County, but all of our counties and how
15 mail is processed.
16 We met with the USPS, we had our print
17 vendor, we had our partners at Riestler, we had the
18 Secretary of State's Office there, and so it was a very
19 productive meeting where we explained how our process
20 works so that everybody could be kept informed. We
21 have a timeline with them -- to share with them about
22 when we will stagger dropoffs for our deliveries. And
23 they understand that, again, this is official election
24 mail and prompt delivery is important, so we had great
25 conversations with that. And we've always had a

Page 30

1 wonderful partnership with the United States Postal
2 Service, so I'm very pleased with that because, again,
3 they appreciate very much the importance of election
4 mail.

5 We had that kickoff meeting, and we are
6 currently in the process of collecting our candidate
7 submissions. So candidates right now are submitting
8 their picture, their profile, all of their information
9 to be printed in the Guide. We do have a deadline in
10 place for those submissions; that is April 8th, so that
11 is coming up. Staff will be working and reaching out
12 to all of the candidates that have qualified for
13 the ballot to ensure everybody is represented in the
14 Guide.

15 We are also making preparations for all of
16 the different versions of the Voter Guide that we
17 create, whether that's American Sign Language or our
18 partnership with Sun Sounds for an audio version or the
19 different other languages that we translate them into.
20 We are getting those contracts in place and we are
21 working to create those translations. That way, again,
22 this election and important voting information, it's --
23 again, it's not just a one size fits all. We make sure
24 that we provide this in different -- very different
25 versions so we can meet voters where they are and

Page 31

1 provide them the information they need in a manner
2 that's most comfortable to them.

3 A couple of new things for the Voter Guide
4 that we had previously hinted at. We are now including
5 an "I voted" sticker, which is very exciting, because
6 we know the "I voted" sticker is important social
7 currency and people love stickers. So it's really
8 exciting to be able to offer that into the Voter Guide.
9 It will be stitched in into the center of the Guide.
10 This is an example of what the cover will look like.
11 It's not final, we do have some changes to make, but I
12 wanted to give you an idea -- a general idea of what it
13 will look like. And as I mentioned before briefly, we
14 are anticipating we'll have approximately 2.3 million
15 pieces that will go out for the primary election.

16 Next slide.

17 So, what education and outreach do we do with
18 this? We create the Guide, we automatically send it to
19 households with a registered voter, and we have to, of
20 course, let people know that it's available too. So in
21 addition to sending it to every household, we will also
22 do bulk shipments. We will send bulk shipments of the
23 Guides to all of our county partners, which is
24 wonderful because they're great about putting them in
25 voting locations. We will send them out to libraries.

Page 32

1 We will send them out to Native American chapter
2 houses, to post offices that specifically service our
3 Native American communities, because we know sometimes
4 with mail and having nonstandard addresses, the post
5 office is a central point for voters to have access to
6 information. We will send them to community centers,
7 to our colleges, our universities, our classrooms, as I
8 mentioned, our schools. And essentially anybody who
9 likes them, who would want them, if they reach out to
10 us, we're happy to ship them a box. We will also
11 employ our paid media tactics where we can let voters
12 know, hey, check your mailbox or read the Guide online.

13 And then we're also looking at reimagining
14 the Voter Education Guide. So we have our standard
15 Guide that we will absolutely and always send out in
16 mail -- you know, print to the households with
17 registered voters. But again, it's important to make
18 sure the Guide is accessible and meet voters where they
19 are and produce content that they are willing to
20 consume in a way that works for them.

21 So one of the things we're looking at are
22 illustrations of kind of how to -- a guide to the
23 Guide, how to use the Guide. And we also want to reach
24 out to our high school and college STEM clubs to maybe
25 take a look at this printed piece of paper and how

Page 33

1 would you, you know, with a STEM background, take this
2 Guide and turn it into something more, what would you
3 do, and create it in a digital world or this visual
4 component in kind of like a robotics challenge. So
5 this is something that we felt, again, knowing the
6 feedback that we've received from the educator
7 community and how do they utilize the Guide in
8 classrooms, this is another opportunity to get the STEM
9 side involved and, again, sort of reimagine what that
10 Voter Guide would look like.

11 Our first in-home drop for the Voter Guide is
12 expected to be around June 12th and our last drop is
13 expected to be June 26. This is well in advance of the
14 July 3rd early voting period. And we will also
15 continue to push the Guide out at grassroots events.
16 So Avery and I will be attending a Celebrate Mesa event
17 or any of our other on-the-ground events that we have
18 coming up, we'll make sure that we have these Guides
19 available for community members.

20 All right. Next slide.

21 And that's all. So I'm happy to answer any
22 questions regarding our debates or our Voter Guide,
23 but, yes, we are knee deep in working through these
24 things and, one, the production of both debates and
25 Voter Guide, but also making sure that people are aware

Page 34

1 it exists and how they can engage with it.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much, Gina.
3 Any questions from Members of the Commission?
4 (No response.)
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Very impressive
6 undertaking. Thank you, Gina.
7 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank
8 you, Commissioners.
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item V on our Agenda,
10 discussion and possible action on Advisory Opinion
11 2024-03 relating to the application of the definition
12 of campaign media spending in A.R.S. 16-971 to public
13 communications involving candidates, elected officials,
14 and parties.
15 We have an advisory opinion request filed by
16 an organization called Opportunity Arizona. The
17 questions presented involve the application of three
18 definitions of campaign media spending to a particular
19 set of public communications. As you will see in your
20 materials, staff is asking us to allow additional --
21 excuse me -- public comment on this draft ahead of the
22 deadline for responding, which is April 23rd. Tom is
23 going to provide an overview of the issues in the draft
24 and then we'll take some questions.
25 Tom.

Page 35

1 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
2 Commissioners. So as Chairman Kimble said, and you
3 have in your materials the e-mail I sent out to the --
4 sort of the regulated community list that we have, you
5 know, we are looking for some additional comment on
6 this. I wanted to, you know, say that, you know, part
7 of the -- part of the thing here is that, you know --
8 you know, we're looking at this -- we have to look at
9 this from the perspective of it's a statute, right, and
10 it has findings in it and it has language in it and
11 obviously there is a First Amendment overlay, and so
12 this is a complicated process, in part, because of --
13 this is a particularly -- this advisory opinion request
14 asks a lot of that process and asks for an evaluation
15 on a lot of different particular communication pieces.
16 But, you know, the heart of Prop 211, which,
17 you know, is obviously consistent with the First
18 Amendment -- well, it may not be obvious to everyone,
19 but it's obvious under the case law and the First
20 Amendment itself, you know, is that voters ought to
21 have the ability to have information about who's vying
22 to influence their vote and they ought to be able to --
23 and we ought to be able to have measures in place that
24 prevent corruption and the appearance of corruption.
25 So, you know, I think that it's important

Page 36

1 to -- you know, as we're looking at this, we are -- we
2 are always trying to, you know, understand the
3 regulated community's perspective and get as much
4 information as we can. That's very important to us as
5 staff members in terms of our ability to advise the
6 Commission, but it also -- you know, at the heart of
7 it, you know, this is -- the voters passed a disclosure
8 regime consistent with the First Amendment, so that's
9 sort of a premise I wanted to start with.
10 So if we could, Cathy, is that okay to go to
11 the next thing.
12 So what we tried to do in this PowerPoint,
13 which hopefully won't take too long, is outline the key
14 provisions that this particular request regards. The
15 first is a provision of 16-971 that talks about a
16 publication that promotes, supports, attacks, or
17 opposes a candidate within six months preceding an
18 election involving that candidate. And we'll go
19 through, in a little bit, some examples of that.
20 You'll see in the draft memo that, you know,
21 look, I mean, promotes, supports, attacks, or opposes,
22 those are pretty simple terms. We think the language
23 is plain. And, in fact, the U.S. Supreme Court
24 precedent on that in the case called McConnell v. FEC
25 says that those terms are, in fact -- you know, are

Page 37

1 clear and not vague.
2 The next provision is a provision that deals
3 with a public communication that refers to a clearly
4 identified candidate within 90 days before a primary
5 election until the time of the general election and
6 that is disseminated in the jurisdiction where the
7 candidate's election is taking place. As you'll see in
8 the letter -- in the AOR, you know, the -- you know,
9 part of the question there is, well, does that mean --
10 you know, how does that work in the -- you know, how
11 should that work and the Opportunity Arizona's concerns
12 with that. We'll talk about that more generally -- or,
13 more in a bit.
14 And then finally, activities or public
15 communications that support the election or defeat of
16 candidates of an identified political party or the
17 electoral prospects of an identified political party.
18 So those are the three subdefinitions of
19 campaign media spending we're really working with
20 today. So if you don't mind, Mr. Chairman, I think
21 probably to help deal with this it would be better if
22 we could go to the next slide where we start putting
23 these in some context here.
24 So, Cathy, if that's...
25 So, first question we got, basically there's

Page 38

1 a number of examples that are in the letter, the AOR,
2 and they're reproduced in this brief PowerPoint or --
3 I've heard that if you say PowerPoint, it
4 tags you as a Gen Xer. You're supposed to say deck,
5 but I'm not sure I'm -- I don't know. What are you
6 going to do.
7 Anyways, and we -- and like I said, we -- in
8 our draft we sought to apply the plain meaning of those
9 terms.
10 Cathy, if we could go to the next one.
11 So --
12 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Tom, I just learned
13 something new. I think your audience here on the
14 Commission is also going to say PowerPoint, but no
15 longer.
16 MR. COLLINS: Well, just so we all know. You
17 know, I mean, I read a -- I read a -- I saw a reel
18 about it, so -- because I'm a Gen Xer and I get my
19 video shorts from reels.
20 So this first one, this is an example that
21 was included in the AOR. It says, click to send a
22 thanks to a senator for investing in housing
23 affordability. And then it says, visit Opportunity
24 Arizona to learn more. So the letter presumes, for
25 purposes of the analysis, that the -- that the

Page 39

1 Opportunity Arizona is looking for our advisory opinion
2 on that this senator is, in fact, a candidate and that
3 we are in the six months prior to an election involving
4 the candidate.
5 And, you know, the sort of short bottom line,
6 and you can, you know, look more at the text, is that
7 this would promote or support a candidate because it
8 contributes to the growth or prosperity of the
9 candidate. I mean, to put -- to boil it down perhaps
10 even more simply, there's nothing more definitively
11 supporting a candidate than thanking the candidate for
12 supporting an issue. I mean, so, you know -- and
13 again, this is time -- and it's important, and the
14 draft talks about this, it's time limited by six months
15 and it's financially -- you know, you have to be at the
16 thresholds that are -- that are required before the
17 Prop 211 factors in, so...
18 Cathy.
19 So, similarly --
20 And, Mr. Chairman, because, you know, I don't
21 always see whatever -- if anyone wants -- if you want
22 to interrupt me or whatever, just let me know, or if
23 anyone has questions.
24 So this is sort of the flip side of the thank
25 you. This is the, you know, tell this lawmaker to stop

Page 40

1 making barriers to voting in Arizona. So, you know,
2 again, we would say -- in the draft we say this is an
3 attack, it's language to show that, you know, in this
4 case, Opportunity Arizona, is placed opposed to or
5 opposite the candidate's stance. You know, again, you
6 know, it's sort of the plain meaning of attack, you
7 know, it -- you know, we think that that is accurate.
8 So then the next slide -- the next slide, we
9 didn't see a candidate there, so I guess we can go to
10 the next one. Sorry.
11 Okay. So this one is a little different,
12 we'll get one -- there's one more after this example
13 that I think is -- ties together the first two pretty
14 well, but this one is kind of a unique thing. This is
15 a tactic that Opportunity Arizona uses and says that
16 they'll continue to use called a patch call where --
17 this is where you're at -- you have a person call a
18 number, the person picks up, you ask them essentially
19 do you want to talk -- you know, do you want to tell
20 Senator or Representative So-and-So, you know, whatever
21 you want to tell them about the bill -- a bill or what
22 have you, you know, that -- which the AOR assumes is a
23 public communication, and we take that assumption.
24 It's a direct solicitation to immediately contact the
25 elected official, so we saw that as not falling within

Page 41

1 the PASO definition.
2 And then I think the next one, Cathy, if we
3 could.
4 So the next one, you know, this is -- this
5 is -- we do not think in the draft that this is -- that
6 this promotes, supports, attacks, or opposes a
7 candidate. It doesn't identify the candidate's
8 position on the issue. It simply directs -- similar,
9 in fact, to the patch call, it simply directs a
10 communication to the elected official who is a
11 candidate and says -- you know, asks them to tell them
12 to protect our freedom to vote.
13 So you can see, the way that we have in the
14 draft and as I said in my e-mail to our -- to the
15 extent I've been able to reach the regulated community
16 and I'll say here again, you know, we are obviously
17 looking for substantive comments on this particular
18 aspect. And that's, in part, because, other than the
19 AOR itself, we received zero comments about -- about
20 the PASO definition.
21 And the reason I want to highlight that here
22 is because I have been told, either through
23 communications or -- formal communications and
24 otherwise, that -- whether it's letters from -- you
25 know, letters, for example, that the PASO standard is

Page 42

1 the standard people are very concerned about, that we
2 have understood this from -- from people who purport to
3 represent regulated entities under this Act. So if --
4 you know, obviously our goal with these advisory
5 opinions is to provide, you know -- well, first of all,
6 they cabin the Commission's discretion going forward,
7 and second of all, they are intended by rule to be
8 reliable.

9 So we would like to have that feedback, and
10 if, you know -- but we can't generate the feedback
11 ourselves. In other words, if this is an issue, as
12 it's been articulated to us over the course of the last
13 few months, then, you know, we would really like --
14 whether people like it or hate it, we would like to
15 hear from them as soon as possible on the draft, so --
16 but you can see, you know, obviously there -- under the
17 plain terms of the Act and the way that the two
18 advertisements at the beginning juxtapose with this
19 third, you know, you can see a very obvious bright line
20 between them, it's predictable, it's consistent with
21 the plain terms, and that's why that is what the draft
22 says at this point.

23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, can you hear me?
24 MR. COLLINS: Yes.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I'm not sure I see a huge

Page 43

1 difference between the ad you have here, call to tell
2 Senator So-and-So to protect our freedom to vote, and
3 the one you used earlier that says, click to send a
4 thanks to Senator So-and-So for investing in housing
5 affordability. But you see a difference between those
6 two?

7 MR. COLLINS: Right. Yes. Mr. Chairman,
8 that's a very good question, and actually I think
9 that's a really -- really the question.

10 So what do these things have in common? They
11 both have desert vistas. They both are calling for
12 contact to the candidate or the elected official. They
13 both mention issues, right. So in that sense, you
14 know, match, match, match, match, match.

15 So the difference is that on the one hand the
16 ad is asking -- is asking you to express your support
17 to the candidate and also expressing Opportunity
18 Arizona's support for the candidate's position. The
19 other is not telling you anything about the candidate's
20 position or Opportunity Arizona's position vis-a-vis
21 that candidate.

22 So, to me, that's the difference is one is
23 saying, Senator Such-and-Such did a thing Opportunity
24 Arizona likes, express support; the other one is
25 saying, here is an issue, we support the issue, express

Page 44

1 that to the candidate, right, or the elected official.
2 So to me it's the difference between promote, support,
3 attack, and oppose, as opposed to what the Opportunity
4 Arizona folks refer to as actual issue advocacy. So
5 one focuses on the issue; the other one, the subject is
6 truly -- the call to action is, Opportunity Arizona
7 supports this candidate/elected official and so should
8 you. Does that answer the question?

9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Not really.

10 MR. COLLINS: I mean, that's -- okay. Well,
11 this is very important, so I'd like to -- I'd like to
12 hear a little more about what --

13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I don't see much
14 difference between protect our freedom to vote and
15 investing in housing affordability.

16 MR. COLLINS: Oh.

17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, Tom.

18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I think it's clear what
19 Opportunity Arizona wants, they want to protect our
20 freedom to vote.

21 Commissioner Chan.

22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I think -- I don't know
23 if this will be helpful, but to me the difference is in
24 the one that's on screen where it says, you know, for
25 30 years Arizonans have voted by mail, contact this

Page 45

1 senator to tell her to protect our freedom to vote,
2 without naming which position the senator has taken,
3 versus the earlier one where it says, thank this person
4 for voting this way, indicates that the senator -- or,
5 I don't remember if it was a senator or representative
6 in the other example -- indicates that legislator's
7 position. Tom, is that the distinction between the
8 two?

9 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Yes. Yes. That's
10 exactly -- Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan, yes. The
11 distinction is -- so just to put this in terms of the
12 statute, the statute says promote, support, attack, or
13 oppose a candidate within six months of an election
14 where they're going to appear, okay. So, thank you,
15 Senator X, is an -- is a -- is a -- for your position
16 on Issue X is a direct expression of support for the
17 candidate in relation to the issue, and therefore it is
18 supporting the candidate.

19 Exactly as Commissioner Chan said, these may
20 optically look very similar -- and I agree with you,
21 Chairman, that probably Opportunity Arizona's view on
22 this is understood, but the difference is, is it
23 promote, support, attack a candidate.

24 Here we stipulate that this is a candidate,
25 but we're not identifying -- we're not telling -- we're

Page 46

1 not calling to thank Senator B for their position on
2 voted by -- on vote by mail or any other thing. We're
3 just saying -- we're just saying the issue. We're
4 saying, call Senator So-and-So and tell her you support
5 this issue, but the plain language of this piece does
6 not take a position upon whether or not Senator B, as
7 opposed to Senator A, is doing good, bad, or
8 indifferent. It's not expressing support for the
9 candidate at all. It doesn't talk about the candidate;
10 it's talking about the issue.

11 So to me that's the line. So you can do
12 something that, you know, on a surface level looks very
13 similar, but, you know, it is -- it is -- it is the
14 statute that overlays that says promote, support a
15 candidate within six months. This one is promoting or
16 supporting something, obviously I agree with that, it's
17 just it's promoting or supporting the protection of the
18 freedom to vote.

19 So obviously we have more time on this, and
20 that's part of the reason we wanted -- because this is
21 complex, we wanted to build in this additional time for
22 additional comment, but, you know, that's sort of the
23 -- it really is in the language, it's what's the object
24 of the communication. I don't know if that -- if
25 that's -- if that's getting closer, Mr. Chairman.

Page 47

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I see a slight
2 difference. I don't know that I see much of a
3 distinction. This seems like this is going to lead to
4 arguments down the line about did we go over this line
5 or not, because I -- I just don't see a huge difference
6 here that -- I don't know how else to explain it, but
7 I'm not persuaded that they're that --

8 MR. COLLINS: That's fair. I mean,
9 Mr. Chairman, I think that's --

10 COMMISSIONER PATON: Tom.

11 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Sorry.

12 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is
13 Commissioner Paton. I would echo the Chairman's
14 position. I think that this kind of opens up a
15 free-for-all where we're going to be referee for like
16 hundreds of items.

17 MR. COLLINS: Well, so to -- if I may,
18 Mr. Chairman, if I should -- I don't know if I
19 should -- if I could go to Commissioner Paton's
20 question first.

21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Of course.

22 MR. COLLINS: I mean, I think,
23 Commissioner Paton, you're right. I mean, the reality
24 is that the Act makes the Commission the referee of
25 that. That's what we've been asked to do.

Page 48

1 How -- what we hope to do -- and if we don't
2 -- if we aren't there yet, obviously that's part of the
3 issue and that's part of the reason we are obviously
4 seeking additional feedback about that. So what we're
5 trying to do with this AO is at least provide a
6 sufficient -- you know, sufficient information, to your
7 point, Commissioner Paton, that, you know, someone can
8 pick it up and know where they are -- and this, I
9 guess, answers both of your questions, Mr. Chairman --
10 know where they are and not have to feel like they have
11 to ask us again, right, that's the goal.

12 So if we're not there, that's the purpose of
13 this extra month -- or, not extra month. We're still
14 within the rule timeline, but that's the purpose of
15 this discussion.

16 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. So you think --

17 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. -- oh.

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, just to -- so
19 you think there is a black and white thing here in
20 that, whereas with us --

21 MR. COLLINS: Right.

22 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- we're thinking that's
23 kind of very, very blurry. And, I don't know, I'm not
24 a lawyer and, you know, I know that -- I mean, if you
25 think there's a distinction, I guess -- to me, I agree

Page 49

1 with the Chairman that I feel -- I feel like I'm not
2 sure I could justify that little difference, I guess.

3 MR. COLLINS: Well, sure. No. Mr. Chairman,
4 Commissioner Paton, I hear what you're saying. I mean,
5 the other way to think about this is, and this would be
6 for your consideration as we move along, would you
7 think that the line that you would draw would be
8 inclusive, such that this one that is on the screen now
9 would be considered promoting -- promoting or
10 supporting or opposing or attacking a candidate within
11 six months of the election, or do you think that you
12 would draw the line so that --

13 COMMISSIONER PATON: I think they should both
14 be disallowed.

15 MR. COLLINS: They should both be -- they
16 should both trigger the campaign media spending
17 definition?

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: Right.

19 MR. COLLINS: Okay. Okay. All right.

20 Well --

21 COMMISSIONER PATON: Right.

22 MR. COLLINS: Okay. Well, I mean, from my
23 point of view, Mr. Chairman --

24 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, I'm sure -- and
25 then I'm sure they could find another -- another way to

Page 50

1 try to come up to the line too, I guess, but -- I
2 understand you've got language that you think is cut
3 and dried, but for us, I guess, a layman, it's really
4 hard to tell the difference. And these people, this is
5 their business, and they -- and I just -- I see
6 arguments all over that, so --
7 MR. COLLINS: Sure. Well, Mr. Chairman,
8 Commissioner Paton, I take that point and I think
9 that -- I mean, again, like that's part of the reason
10 we wanted to make sure -- I mean, what we've done in
11 the past with these other AOs -- I just want to draw a
12 -- just kind of point out where we are procedurally.
13 With the other AOs that were more discrete and focused
14 on -- more on the text of the actual statute and
15 focused on a discrete question, we were able to do this
16 in one meeting without a problem.
17 This one we knew, because of the volume of
18 material that Opportunity Arizona wanted reviewed, and
19 in addition the fact that we had, like I said, heard --
20 to your point, heard that this particular aspect of the
21 statute is something people wanted to talk about, and
22 yet received no additional comment about it from anyone
23 in the regulated community, is exactly -- your
24 questions are precisely highlighting why we're doing it
25 this way. And so I think --

Page 51

1 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah.
2 MR. COLLINS: -- as staff, I mean, our --
3 what I take as the direction on that is we need to --
4 we need to think about that from -- through those
5 issues and be in a position to have a better answer for
6 both you and Commissioner Kimble. So that would be the
7 direction I take from that.
8 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, I would say -- I
9 would say that if they're advocating for an issue and
10 they're mentioning the candidate within six months of
11 the election, maybe that's like -- that's a cutoff
12 that's very apparent, right?
13 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman,
14 Commissioner Paton, yes, that's right. I mean, if that
15 was the standard, that would be -- that would be a
16 black letter or bright line, whatever the right term
17 for that, yes.
18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, there's a -- there's a
19 lengthy comment that you've included here from the
20 Campaign Legal Center --
21 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- which I've read a couple
23 times. And is it possible for you to say what their
24 feelings are on this question that we're talking about
25 now?

Page 52

1 MR. COLLINS: As I read their comment, they
2 did not touch this issue at all.
3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I mean, their
4 general tone is more things should be -- should be
5 covered than fewer.
6 MR. COLLINS: To that point, Mr. Chairman,
7 yeah. I read their comment as focused on the second
8 question, which has to do with the 90-day clearly
9 identified candidate standard.
10 Certainly, given our call to have people
11 focus on this specific textual language, that call
12 includes the Campaign Legal Center if they want to
13 provide that, as well as every other person. I mean,
14 I -- but I didn't -- I -- you know, I reviewed that
15 letter several times and, yeah, I agree with you that,
16 both in their prior communications and in this one with
17 respect to the 90-day statute we'll talk about next,
18 they are in favor of more disclosure rather than less.
19 It's not -- I don't -- I mean, obviously, given the
20 context here, I'm not in a position to sort of ask them
21 why they chose to focus on one aspect of the AOR versus
22 another, but, you know, maybe we'll get something from
23 them on this -- on this second round, and other people
24 too hopefully.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any more comments on

Page 53

1 this issue before we let Tom move on?
2 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I thought
3 Commissioner Meyer might have had a comment,
4 Mr. Chairman.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
6 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Sure. Thank you. I
7 guess, going back to the comments that
8 Commissioner Kimble and Commissioner Paton had and
9 Commissioner Chan, I see the distinction. And I guess,
10 you know, the more time I look at this and spend
11 thinking about this the greater -- or, the easier it is
12 for me to see that distinction.
13 So I think, you know, as this sort of
14 develops and matures and people are working with this
15 rule, they'll understand that -- I think, you know, the
16 first -- the first issue -- the first slide that you
17 showed was, hey, you know, thank your congressperson
18 because they did a great job on this. And then the
19 second one is basically, hey, call your congressperson
20 about this issue. It's not trying to influence them at
21 all. And to me, that's -- you know, the more time I
22 spend with this, the more -- the more I see a
23 distinction.
24 And so I think, you know, at first it
25 seems -- at least to me, at first it seemed like more

Page 54

1 of a gray area. But the more time I spend thinking
2 about this and hearing you talk about it, it becomes
3 more distinct for me. And I think -- or, hope that
4 that's the impact or the way others reading this would
5 eventually learn to interpret it and I think that there
6 would be less, you know, confusion than maybe we
7 initially think. That's all I wanted to say.
8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you,
9 Commissioner Meyer. That was helpful.
10 Any other comments before we move on?
11 (No response.)
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Tom.
13 MR. COLLINS: Thank you.
14 Cathy, can we go to the next.
15 Okay. So Question 2 focuses on the section
16 of the Act that talks about this sort of clearly
17 identified candidate term, which is a term in Title 16,
18 Chapter 6, Article 1 that, although we don't -- the
19 actual definition is not in 6.1, it's a term of art
20 that we think is -- we're sort of -- we are bound by
21 case law, and we'll talk about it in a minute.
22 But basically that -- this is where we're
23 talking about the kind of an advertisement that would
24 say -- you know, that would essentially, you know,
25 refer to a clearly identified candidate within the 90

Page 55

1 days before their election cycle starts -- or, their
2 election, rather. So that -- this is the kind -- and
3 we'll go through some of this. But, for example, a
4 thing that might not be a -- promote, support, attack,
5 or oppose a candidate in the six months, within the 90
6 days that referral to the candidate might be -- might
7 kick in.
8 So, in other words, if you think about this
9 on a timeline, the two issues -- and this is something
10 maybe we need to focus on in the draft a little bit.
11 But if you think about this on a time continuum, prior
12 to six months you're in one space. At six months,
13 you're at this PASO standard. At 90 days, when voters
14 are going to be most focused and most interested in
15 what -- how their vote is sought to be influenced and
16 the other values of the campaign finance laws that are
17 there -- as you get to 90 days, it's the referral to
18 the clearly identified candidate. So you're going from
19 promote at six months to refer at 90 days on that
20 continuum. So --
21 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman.
22 Mr. Chairman.
23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
24 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Apologies for
25 interrupting, but I just -- I just want to jump in

Page 56

1 here. So does that mean, if we go back to the prior
2 slide, that this slide would be treated differently at
3 the, you know, six-month stage as opposed to the 90
4 days simply because it has a reference to, you know,
5 essentially say call your congressman in it?
6 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman,
7 Commissioner Meyer, the statutes are different and use
8 different words for different time frames. So I'm not
9 sure that I can say, because I can't remember if we
10 actually reached the question whether or not that
11 particular advertisement would be within the 90 days.
12 I'm not sure I'm in a position to say that right now.
13 But I can tell you that there are going to be public
14 communications that at six months are not campaign
15 media spending, that very well could be at 90 days,
16 because we're capturing a broader set under the terms
17 of the -- terms of the statute, a broader set of public
18 communications at 90 days than we are at six months.
19 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Thank you.
20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
21 Commissioner Meyer.
22 Okay. Tom.
23 MR. COLLINS: So trying to anticipate some of
24 the discussion, I wanted to here highlight some of
25 Opportunity Arizona's arguments. Whether or not, you

Page 57

1 know, I captured -- I hope I've captured this with some
2 accuracy, you know. Basically their point is a mere
3 reference to the individual should not automatically
4 take a public communication and turn it into one that
5 refers to a clearly identified candidate.
6 I wonder if that's a quote. Because if it's
7 a quote, it's kind of --
8 Well, anyways -- anyways, so that essentially
9 is their position, like, look, if we -- if we make a
10 reference to a clearly identified candidate, it should
11 be a reference to a candidate as a candidate. In other
12 words, it should -- clearly identified, in their view,
13 should be the -- you know, refers to a person as
14 Senator Such-and-Such, a candidate for governor, or,
15 you know, that kind of -- that kind of thing. It needs
16 to call out, in the view of Opportunity Arizona, the
17 fact of this person's candidacy in order to trigger a
18 campaign media -- campaign media spending event, if you
19 will.
20 And I want to make clear, it's a good time to
21 make it clear, none of this stops anyone from talking.
22 This is -- none of this is -- none of this is -- you
23 know, I've heard in the regulated community the word
24 violate Prop 211 to mean, well, when we have -- when we
25 have to report. That's -- that is -- you know, that is

Page 58

1 -- to coin a phrase, that is misinformation about what
2 it takes to violate Prop 211. Complying with Prop 211
3 is not violating Prop 211, so --
4 And then the other thing Opportunity Arizona
5 says is, look, we want to do what we see as issue
6 advocacy. And if we have to think about whether or not
7 this person is clearly identified as -- other than
8 labeled by us as a candidate, that's going to be a
9 problem for us.
10 So we can go to the next slide.
11 So that, for us -- from a staff perspective,
12 our point of view on this is essentially we already
13 have this term defined by case law in Arizona in a case
14 where there was an advertisement involving a person who
15 was running for one office, who then -- who at that
16 time occupied another office. So the advertisement did
17 not mention the office that that person was running
18 for; it only mentioned the office they were currently
19 occupying.
20 And the Court of Appeals, in a case that was
21 reported that's not over -- been overruled, basically
22 explained that, no, clearly identified candidate means
23 to -- the information identified actually in 16-901(9),
24 you know, name, photograph, drawing that appears, and
25 the identity -- the identity of the candidate is

Page 59

1 otherwise apparent by unambiguous reference. So what
2 the court said was, it's unnecessary for the
3 advertisement to further identify the position being
4 sought. So despite the fact the ad in that case
5 involved a Republican running for Attorney General and
6 only referred to him as a Superintendent of Public
7 Instruction, that was, nevertheless, a clearly
8 identified candidate.
9 So we think that question of how that should
10 be treated is handled by the case law. You know, if
11 there are -- again, since we are soliciting additional
12 comments, if there's reasons why that's not so,
13 obviously that would be helpful to hear.
14 So I don't know if we have anything else on
15 this one. I don't know. Cathy, could we go to the
16 next slide just to see.
17 Okay. So that's all I have on Question 2,
18 Mr. Chairman. I'm going to -- with your permission,
19 I'll go on to Question 3.
20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any questions for
21 Tom on Question 2?
22 (No response.)
23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Go ahead, Tom.
24 MR. COLLINS: Okay. So Question 3, support
25 the election or defeat of candidates of an identified

Page 60

1 political party or the electoral prospects of an
2 identified political party. So, you know, in these we
3 have three examples we'll go through here, and then
4 we'll have -- and then we'll talk a little bit more
5 about the pitch call or whatever it is, patch call.
6 So here -- okay. So here we have the
7 question really -- we understood the question to focus
8 on the electoral prospects of an identified political
9 party. Here, on the communication on my left, which I
10 don't know if that's your left, you know, has a
11 headline from Salon.com describing -- you know, saying,
12 Arizona GOP advances voting bills inspired by
13 conspiracy theories, but the call to action there is
14 e-mail the lawmaker or candidate.
15 And so, you know, our assessment at this
16 point was that this -- you know, so we've already said
17 we think this attacks the senator, but we don't see
18 this as being about the electoral prospects of the
19 identified political party because that headline is
20 there to serve to provide context for the call to
21 action.
22 The second one is a little easier because
23 there's no concurrent candidate mentioning, right, it's
24 just a list of criticisms that are denominated at the
25 Republican -- at Republicans.

Page 61

1 In case it's not self-evident, I mean,
2 Opportunity Arizona seems to tend to favor policies of
3 one party over the other.
4 And then -- but then if you read through all
5 the language and you take it together, it is driving
6 people to find out about the Republican Legislature
7 from Opportunity Arizona. So, you know -- so our
8 thought on that was, well, you know, again, is it -- is
9 it -- you know, it's a -- to get to the electoral
10 prospects of the Republican Legislature, you have to
11 get -- you have to do two steps, not one, right.
12 There's two steps. There's a step of you have to first
13 join Opportunity Arizona, and then they're going to
14 find -- and then they're going to find more.
15 Now, you might say, well, tax breaks for
16 private jet owners, giveaways for big business, and
17 rigging the system for the elite are obviously critical
18 of the policies of whatever party you're using those
19 kind of terms to refer to. But in this particular
20 case, you know -- you know, we think that the context
21 matters, and the call to action here is to -- is to
22 become a member or get information from Opportunity
23 Arizona. You know, that may ultimately mean that you
24 get information from Opportunity Arizona or someone
25 else that is -- that is supporting or defeating the

Page 62

1 electoral prospects of an identified party, but this is
2 the invitation to that. And I think -- and we saw --
3 in the draft we saw a distinction there. Again, open
4 to additional comment.
5 So then, Cathy, if we could.
6 Then on the next slide we do the patch call.
7 And again, we think that because this -- although
8 there's a reference to party, you know, we just -- we
9 maintain the same point of view as we had on the other
10 matter that this was evaluated under, which is this is
11 a narrow form of communication directly to a person who
12 picks up the phone at the office of the elected
13 official.
14 So I think that's -- I think that that is --
15 I think that is all we have. Yeah, that is all we have
16 on those. So, anyway, Mr. Chairman, I don't know if
17 there are -- if there are additional questions on these
18 at this point, I'm happy to try to answer those.
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I just wanted to
20 clarify one point. So the ad with the Salon headline
21 would be covered; the tax breaks for private jet owners
22 would not?
23 MR. COLLINS: We think the ad with the Salon
24 headline would be covered because of the reference to
25 the candidate, not because of the reference to

Page 63

1 Republicans.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Right.
3 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
4 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: But the tax breaks for
5 private jet owners would not be covered?
6 MR. COLLINS: Yes. It could be, if you -- if
7 it was -- if it had different language, but the
8 language there --
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Right. But as it stands
10 here.
11 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And the patch call would
13 not be covered?
14 MR. COLLINS: Correct.
15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
16 Any other questions, comments from
17 Commissioners?
18 (No response.)
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Boy, I feel like we're
20 wading through some pretty tall legal grass here.
21 MR. COLLINS: Well, Mr. Chairman, yeah. I
22 mean, that's exactly right. I mean, this is -- this is
23 a -- like I said, this is a hefty request that -- and
24 that's part of the reason why we wanted to break this
25 into a couple of different meetings to talk about --

Page 64

1 talk about it. But, you know, the best we can do, and
2 our hope as we go forward here, is to be in a position
3 to, you know, have a process that will ultimately lead
4 to some answers that folks can rely on. That's what
5 the rule talks about.
6 And then secondly, I think that -- I'm
7 hopeful that folks -- and there are some folks who
8 don't appear, but do listen to our meetings on YouTube
9 and other places -- will see that the Commission is
10 engaged specifically in analyzing the text of this Act
11 and its application. And I think that -- so from my
12 perspective as a staff member, this is precisely the
13 kind of conversation you want to have to do this.
14 So, yes, Mr. Chairman, I appreciate the
15 preparation all of you obviously put into understanding
16 this to have these questions ready.
17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: So any other questions,
18 comments from Commissioners?
19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I do have a
20 question for Tom.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Based on -- based on the
23 questions raised by some of the Commissioners, Tom, and
24 your comments regarding taking more time, are -- should
25 we vote on this as a Commission today? Do we need to

Page 65

1 wait and see if others from the regulated community are
2 going to weigh in? I feel like time is of the essence
3 because of the elections coming, but --
4 MR. COLLINS: Right. So, Mr. Chairman, if I
5 may.
6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Tom.
7 MR. COLLINS: Two points on that.
8 Number one, we have a deadline imposed on -- that the
9 Rule imposes on us of either issuing an opinion or
10 explaining why we're not issuing an opinion of
11 April 23rd. We're currently scheduled to meet on
12 April 18th.
13 The staff's recommendation is to at least --
14 is to have, in order to allow us to process it and work
15 with it, to have additional written comments due by
16 April 5th. And staff's further recommendation is that
17 the Commission formalize that in a vote, that the
18 Commission formally vote to request additional written
19 comments between now and April 5th.
20 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. Mr. Chairman.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: In that case, I would
23 move that the Commission officially seek additional
24 comment on this draft advisory opinion -- or, the
25 advisory opinion request prior to the next -- by

Page 66

1 April 5th.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: By April 5th. Thank you.
3 Is there a second to Commissioner Chan's
4 motion?
5 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. Yes,
6 I'll second that.
7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. It's been moved and
8 seconded that we'll take additional comment through
9 April 5th on -- on these matters. I'll call the roll.
10 Commissioner Chan.
11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
13 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
15 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
17 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And Chair votes aye.
19 The motion is approved 5-to-nothing.
20 Thank you, Tom. Thank you, Commissioners.
21 Item VI. Commissioners, you all should have
22 had the chance to review the dates that Paula has
23 proposed for our future meetings. Just to be clear,
24 they are April 18th, May 30th, June 27th, July 25th,
25 and August 29th.

Page 67

1 Is there any discussion on this? If not, do
2 we have a motion to approve these meeting dates?
3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we
4 approve the meeting dates, the proposed meeting dates.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
6 Commissioner Chan.
7 Is there a second?
8 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll
9 second it.
10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
11 Commissioner Paton.
12 It's been moved and seconded that these
13 meeting dates be approved. I'll call the roll.
14 Commissioner Chan.
15 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
17 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
19 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
21 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
23 The meeting dates are approved 5-to-nothing.
24 Item VII, public comment. This is the time
25 for consideration of comments and suggestions from the

Page 68

1 public. Action taken as a result of public comment
2 will be limited to directing staff to study the matter
3 or rescheduling the matter for further consideration
4 and decision at a later date or responding to
5 criticism. Please limit your comment to no more than
6 two minutes.
7 Does any member of the public wish to make
8 comments at this time or does any member of the public
9 on Zoom wish to make a comment? I don't see anyone.
10 Cathy, are you aware of anyone?
11 MS. HERRING: There are not any members of
12 the public.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you. The
14 public may also send comments to the Commission by
15 e-mail at ccec@azcanelections.gov.
16 At this time, I would entertain a motion to
17 adjourn.
18 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we
19 adjourn.
20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
21 Commissioner Chan.
22 Is there a second?
23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second.
24 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,

Page 69

1 Commissioner Meyer, for the second.
2 I will call the roll on the motion to
3 adjourn. Commissioner Chan.
4 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
6 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
8 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
10 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
12 We are adjourned. Thank you very much.
13 (The meeting adjourned at 10:58 a.m.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
3

4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
13

14 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17

18 DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 29th day of
19 March, 2024.
20

21 
22

23 Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
24 Certified Reporter #50666
25

<hr/>	3rd 33:14	Act 10:20,21 42:3,17 47:24 54:16 64:10	advocating 51:9
1	<hr/>	action 3:25 5:1 7:22 8:2 14:9 34:10 44:6 60:13, 21 61:21 68:1	affecting 22:24
1 54:18	4	active 5:10	affordability 38:23 43:5 44:15
10:58 69:13	40 5:19	actively 10:19	AG 11:15
12th 33:12	4th 5:18	activities 14:10 20:2 37:14	agencies 13:21
15th 15:20	<hr/>	activity 8:9	Agenda 3:3 20:16 34:9
16 54:17	5	actual 44:4 50:14 54:19	agree 45:20 46:16 48:25 52:15
16-901(9) 58:23	5-to-nothing 66:19 67:23	ad 43:1,16 59:4 62:20, 23	ahead 14:25 15:11 34:21 59:23
16-971 34:12 36:15	5th 10:1 65:16,19 66:1, 2,9	addition 11:4 20:13 31:21 50:19	Alec 5:21
18th 65:12 66:24	<hr/>	additional 34:20 35:5 46:21,22 48:4 50:22 59:11 62:4,17 65:15,18, 23 66:8	alignment 25:11
19th 5:17	6	addresses 32:4	Amendment 35:11,18, 20 36:8
1st 20:25	6 54:18	adept 27:12	American 30:17 32:1,3
<hr/>	6.1 54:19	adjourn 68:17,19 69:3	Americans 8:1
2	<hr/>	adjourned 69:12,13	Amy 3:11 28:11
2 54:15 59:17,21	8	administrates 5:11 10:20	analysis 38:25
2.3 29:8 31:14	8th 30:10	adopt 4:7,10	analyzing 64:10
20 11:1	<hr/>	advance 20:20 33:13	ancient 27:19
2024 3:4,25 5:21 14:10 16:10	9	advances 60:12	answers 48:9 64:4
2024-03 34:11	90 37:4 54:25 55:5,13, 17,19 56:3,11,15,18	adverse 11:18 12:12	anticipate 56:23
211 7:5 8:1 35:16 39:17 57:24 58:2,3	90-day 52:8,17	advertisement 54:23 56:11 58:14,16 59:3	anticipating 31:14
21st 5:21	9:30 3:4	advertisements 42:18	AO 48:5
22 10:6	<hr/>	advice 11:13	AOR 37:8 38:1,21 40:22 41:19 52:21
23rd 34:22 65:11	A	advise 36:5	AOS 50:11,13
25 13:3 19:18	a.m. 3:4 69:13	advised 12:13	Apologies 55:24
25th 66:24	A.R.S. 34:12	advising 11:15	apparent 51:12 59:1
26 33:13	ability 35:21 36:5	advisory 34:10,15 35:13 39:1 42:4 65:24, 25	apparently 10:5
27th 66:24	absentee 10:22	advocacy 44:4 58:6	appeal 7:6,16
28th 3:4	absolutely 32:15		Appeals 7:12,13,20 58:20
29th 3:25 66:25	access 19:14 32:5		appearance 35:24
<hr/>	accessible 19:4 21:25 32:18		appears 58:24
3	Accountability 11:11		applauded 9:18
3 59:19,24	accuracy 57:2		application 34:11,17
30 44:25	accurate 40:7		
30th 14:13 66:24	acknowledge 9:4		
39 5:19			

64:11	ASU 6:21,22	basis 9:12	broadcasts 19:2
apply 38:8	Athenian 27:19	beautiful 6:8 16:16	broader 56:16,17
approve 4:24 67:2,4	attack 40:3,6 44:3 45:12,23 55:4	beginning 10:19 16:3 24:24 42:18	brought 19:15 20:14
approved 4:24 66:19 67:13,23	attacking 49:10	behind-the-scenes 23:3	build 46:21
approximately 31:14	attacks 36:16,21 41:6 60:17	big 61:16	bulk 31:22
April 5:18 8:4 15:20 20:9,25 30:10 34:22 65:11,12,16,19 66:1,2, 9,24	attend 23:21	bigger 8:22	business 50:5 61:16
area 54:1	attendance 3:6	biggest 21:14	busy 9:6
argument 8:6	attending 33:16	bill 40:21	buy-in 24:3
arguments 47:4 50:6 56:25	attention 23:12	bills 60:12	C
Arizona 6:4,6 7:3,4,12 16:12,25 17:1,6,8 18:11 19:12,18 20:16 34:16 38:24 39:1 40:1,4,15 43:24 44:4,6,19 50:18 57:16 58:4,13 60:12 61:2,7,13,23,24	attorney 9:23 10:18 11:13 12:14,15,21 59:5	bingo 24:13	cabin 42:6
Arizona's 37:11 43:18, 20 45:21 56:25	attorneys 12:23	bit 8:18 11:6 36:19 37:13 55:10 60:4	calendar 15:12
Arizonans 44:25	audience 38:13	bite-sized 25:12 26:2	call 3:3,4 4:15 7:19 9:16 18:17 20:10 40:16,17 41:9 43:1 44:6 46:4 52:10,11 53:19 56:5 57:16 60:5,13,20 61:21 62:6 63:12 66:9 67:13 69:2
arms 11:9	audio 30:18	Bitfire 16:14	called 7:10 34:16 36:24 40:16
array 8:22	August 66:25	black 48:19 51:16	calling 43:11 46:1
arrived 10:4	automatically 31:18 57:3	blurry 48:23	campaign 9:13 34:12, 18 37:19 49:16 51:20 52:12 55:16 56:14 57:18
art 16:16 54:19	Avery 6:3,13 24:9 33:16	board 5:10 10:19,22,23 18:21 20:6	candidacy 57:17
Article 54:18	award 19:19	body 13:4	candidate 9:11 14:10 15:16 18:1,4 30:6 36:17,18 37:4 39:2,4,7, 9,11 40:9 41:7,11 43:12,17,21 44:1 45:13, 17,18,23,24 46:9,15 49:10 51:10 52:9 54:17, 25 55:5,6,18 57:5,10, 11,14 58:8,22,25 59:8 60:14,23 62:25
articulated 42:12	aware 33:25 68:10	boil 11:6 39:9	candidate's 37:7 40:5 41:7 43:18,19
asks 35:14 41:11	aye 4:16,18,20,22,23 66:11,13,15,17,18 67:15,17,19,21,22 69:4, 6,8,10,11	bookmarks 25:25	candidate/elected 44:7
ASL 19:2	B	bottom 39:5	candidates 8:18 9:10, 12,13,14 14:12 15:10, 13,17 17:25 18:6 21:3, 20 23:1,9 24:1,5 26:16
aspect 41:18 50:20 52:21	back 13:5 21:6 25:4 27:8,17 53:7 56:1	bound 54:20	
assessment 60:15	background 21:4 33:1	box 32:10	
assignments 20:11	backgrounds 18:19	Boy 63:19	
assistance 11:8	bad 46:7	branding 17:3	
association 16:12,25 17:8 18:12 19:12 24:10	ballot 15:14,18,20 25:8 30:13	brawl 10:17	
assumes 40:22	barriers 40:1	break 63:24	
assumption 40:23	based 11:12 13:3 64:22	breaks 61:15 62:21 63:4	
	basically 37:25 53:19 54:22 57:2 58:21	briefly 31:13	
		bright 42:19 51:16	
		bring 19:23 20:5 22:21 23:18 26:5 27:2	
		broadcast 16:7,8 17:21 19:1,8 23:22	

28:1 30:7,12 34:13 37:16 59:25	18 67:3,5,10,16,18,20, 22 68:13,18,20,25 69:5, 7,9,11	clubs 32:24	23 66:20,21
canvass 5:18	Chairman's 5:6 47:13	Coalition's 6:5	committee 17:9 18:11
captioning 22:1	challenge 15:19 33:4	coin 58:1	common 43:10
capture 23:5,11	chamber 21:16	collecting 30:6	communication 35:15 37:3 40:23 41:10 46:24 57:4 60:9 62:11
captured 57:1	Chan 3:11 4:3,5,6,9,15, 16 28:15 38:12 44:17, 21,22 45:10,19 53:2,9 64:19,21,22 65:20,21, 22 66:10,11 67:3,6,14, 15 68:18,21 69:3,4	college 6:7 32:24	communications 34:13,19 37:15 41:23 52:16 56:14,18
capturing 56:16	Chan's 66:3	colleges 32:7	communities 32:3
card 24:13	chance 10:16 66:22	COLLINS 5:3 35:1 38:16 42:24 43:7 44:10, 16 45:9 47:8,11,17,22 48:21 49:3,15,19,22 50:7 51:2,13,21 52:1,6 54:13 56:6,23 59:24 62:23 63:3,6,11,14,21 65:4,7	community 26:7 32:6 33:7,19 35:4 41:15 50:23 57:23 65:1
care 22:15	channel 19:11	comfortable 31:2	community's 36:3
case 7:8,10,11,13 8:6 11:12,16 21:6 35:19 36:24 40:4 54:21 58:13, 20 59:4,10 61:1,20 65:22	chapter 32:1 54:18	comment 34:21 35:5 46:22 50:22 51:19 52:1, 7 53:3 62:4 65:24 66:8 67:24 68:1,5,9	competitor 16:1
cases 7:5	check 32:12	comments 41:17,19 52:25 53:7 54:10 59:12 63:16 64:18,24 65:15, 19 67:25 68:8,14	competitors 21:22
cast 25:8	China 27:20	Commission 3:5 7:25 10:3 12:13 14:5,22 17:12 34:3 36:6 38:14 47:24 64:9,25 65:17,18, 23 68:14	complainant 12:11
Cathy 36:10 37:24 38:10 39:18 41:2 54:14 59:15 62:5 68:10	chose 52:21	Commission's 42:6	complaint 11:17
ccec@	circumstances 5:12	Commissioner 3:9,11, 13,15,18,19,21 4:3,5,6, 9,12,14,15,16,17,18,19, 20,21,22 28:15 38:12 44:17,21,22 45:10,19 47:10,12,13,19,23 48:7, 16,17,18,22 49:4,13,18, 21,24 50:8 51:1,6,8,14 53:2,3,5,6,8,9 54:9 55:21,23,24 56:7,19,21 64:19,21,22 65:20,21, 22 66:3,5,10,11,12,13, 14,15,16,17 67:3,6,8, 11,14,15,16,17,18,19, 20,21 68:18,21,23,24 69:1,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10	complex 27:13 46:21
azcleanelections.	Citizens 3:5	Commissioners 3:7, 23 4:1 5:3 14:18 28:10 34:8 35:2 63:17 64:18,	compliance 11:24
gov. 68:15	civics 6:4,5,9 26:8		complicated 12:4,22, 25 35:12
Celebrate 33:16	claim 8:1		Complying 58:2
center 7:3,5 31:9 51:20 52:12	clarify 62:20		component 22:7 33:4
Center's 6:21,22	classroom 26:5,14		concerned 42:1
centers 32:6	classrooms 26:22 32:7 33:8		concerns 37:11
central 32:5	clean 3:5 9:13 10:20 15:22 17:4 19:10 24:7		conclude 25:18
Chair 4:23 66:18 67:22 69:11	clear 13:23 21:22 37:1 44:18 57:20,21 66:23		concludes 13:24 20:4
Chairman 3:2,12,17,22 4:3,5,8,13,17,19,21,23 14:1,3,7 15:15 28:7,9, 13,17,19 34:2,5,7,9 35:1,2 37:20 39:20 42:23,25 43:7 44:9,13, 17,18 45:10,21 46:25 47:1,9,18,21 48:9 49:1, 3,23 50:7 51:13,18,22 52:3,6,25 53:4,5 54:8, 12 55:21,22,23 56:6,20 59:18,20,23 62:16,19 63:2,4,9,12,15,19,21 64:14,17,19,21 65:4,6, 20,21 66:2,7,12,14,16,	click 38:21 43:3		concurrent 60:23
	client 12:3,25 13:9		conference 8:3,4
	clients 12:7		confidential 12:9
	close 5:19 15:16 20:24		conflicts 12:5
	closed 22:1		confusion 54:6
	closer 46:25		congressman 56:5
	closing 18:4		congressperson 53:17,19
	club 27:1		conjunction 17:14
			conservation 22:19,21
			consideration 49:6

folks 9:16 10:14 18:13,
18 26:11 44:4 64:4,7
follow 11:3 21:20
follow-up 6:20
Fontes 7:10,13
forget 7:24
form 62:11
formal 11:18 41:23
formalize 65:17
formally 65:18
format 17:7,13 18:8
21:13,19
forthcoming 8:16
forward 27:2 28:25
42:6 64:2
frames 56:8
free-for-all 47:15
freedom 41:12 43:2
44:14,20 45:1 46:18
front 7:1 8:17 28:4
full 26:3,10
fully 17:17
future 66:23

G

Galen 3:21
gave 11:13
Gen 38:4,18
general 31:12 37:5
52:4 59:5
General's 9:23 10:18
11:10 12:6,8,15,17
generally 37:12
Generals 12:21
generate 6:16 42:10
Gina 6:3,20 8:25 14:14,
17 28:11,16,17 34:2,6
give 31:12

giveaways 61:16
goal 13:5 42:4 48:11
Goldstein 19:17 25:5,
20
good 3:9,16,17 11:23
14:18 43:8 46:7 57:20
GOP 60:12
government 11:11
26:17,24
governmental 12:23
governor 57:14
granted 7:21,24
graphics 16:23
grass 63:20
grassroots 24:15
33:15
gray 54:1
great 6:11 17:5 24:11
25:20 29:24 31:24
53:18
greater 53:11
Greece 27:19
growth 39:8
guess 11:14 40:9 48:9,
25 49:2 50:1,3 53:7,9
guide 14:11,21 22:17
26:12 28:6,21,22 29:2
30:9,14,16 31:3,8,9,18
32:12,14,15,18,22,23
33:2,7,10,11,15,22,25
Guides 26:16 31:23
33:18

H

Han 27:20
hand 43:15
handful 15:5
handled 59:10
handles 9:11
handling 17:20

Hank 20:15
Hank's 21:4
happening 8:2 20:22
happy 14:2 32:10 33:21
62:18
hard 50:4
hate 42:14
he'll 24:10
headline 60:11,19
62:20,24
hear 12:20,21 21:3
22:19 42:15,23 44:12
49:4 59:13
heard 17:11 38:3 50:19,
20 57:23
hearing 14:7 54:2
heart 35:16 36:6
hefty 63:23
helpful 44:23 54:9
59:13
HERRING 68:11
hey 10:2 24:20 32:12
53:17,19
high 32:24
high-profile 6:14
highlight 6:1 27:9
41:21 56:24
highlighting 50:24
highlights 5:16 6:25
25:13
hinted 31:4
historic 27:7
historical 6:6 27:18
history 10:10 27:8,21,
24
hit 6:1
home 27:10
hope 18:20 48:1 54:3
57:1 64:2
hopeful 64:7

host 16:1 19:9 23:23
24:11 26:22,23
hosting 20:7 23:17
25:21
hot 17:21
household 31:21
households 31:19
32:16
houses 32:2
housing 38:22 43:4
44:15
huge 42:25 47:5
humans 27:16
hundreds 47:16

I

idea 11:23 31:12
ideal 5:13
identified 22:20 37:4,
16,17 52:9 54:17,25
55:18 57:5,10,12 58:7,
22,23 59:8,25 60:2,8,19
62:1
identify 3:7 11:18
25:24 41:7 59:3
identifying 45:25
identity 58:25
II 3:24
III 5:1
illustrations 32:22
immediately 40:24
impact 54:4
imperial 27:20
implemented 24:23
implementing 20:2
implicates 12:9,10
importance 27:10 30:3
important 5:8,9 21:2,
11 27:8,18 28:1 29:3,6,
13,24 30:22 31:6 32:17

35:25 36:4 39:13 44:11	intend 13:14 22:21 23:23 25:17	IV 14:9	knowing 33:5
importantly 7:23	intended 24:2 42:7	J	L
imposed 65:8	intensive 5:22	jet 61:16 62:21 63:5	labeled 58:8
imposes 65:9	intent 27:16	job 53:18	labor 5:22
impressive 28:11,20 34:5	interested 9:12 23:12 25:15 55:14	join 61:13	language 30:17 35:10 36:22 40:3 46:5,23 50:2 52:11 61:5 63:7,8
improved 16:19	interesting 6:12 17:18 23:4	journalist 19:19 21:4	languages 30:19
in-and-outs 12:24	internationally 6:17	journalistic 18:18	launch 8:24
in-home 33:11	interpret 54:5	journalists 18:13	law 11:4,16 12:10 13:1 35:19 54:21 58:13 59:10
inbox 19:2	interrupt 39:22	July 14:13 33:14 66:24	lawmaker 39:25 60:14
include 19:2	interrupting 55:25	jump 28:6 55:25	laws 11:5 55:16
included 38:21 51:19	interview 6:18 25:19	June 33:12,13 66:24	lawsuit 7:15
includes 52:12	interviews 25:21	jurisdiction 5:24 37:6	lawyer 48:24
including 14:10 31:4	intimately 10:23	justify 49:2	lawyers 7:18
inclusive 49:8	investigation 10:3	juxtapose 42:18	lay 10:8
indifferent 46:8	investing 38:22 43:4 44:15	K	layman 50:3
individual 57:3	invitation 62:2	key 36:13	lead 47:3 64:3
individuals 27:12	invitations 15:13	kick 16:3 55:7	learn 38:24 54:5
influence 35:22 53:20	invite 15:21	kicking 24:25	learned 38:12
influenced 55:15	involve 34:17	kickoff 14:14 29:4 30:5	left 60:9,10
information 15:6,11 22:16 25:13 30:8,22 31:1 32:6 35:21 36:4 48:6 58:23 61:22,24	involved 6:14 10:24 23:20 29:6 33:9 59:5	Kimble 3:2,12,17,22 4:5,8,13,17,19,21,23 14:3,7 28:9,13,17 34:2, 5,9 35:2 42:23,25 44:9, 13,18 47:1,21 51:6,18, 22 52:3,25 53:5,8 54:8, 12 55:23 56:20 59:20, 23 62:19 63:2,4,9,12, 15,19 64:17,21 65:6,21 66:2,7,12,14,16,18 67:5,10,16,18,20,22 68:13,20,25 69:5,7,9,11	legal 7:1 11:22 51:20 52:12 63:20
informational 22:22	involving 8:9 34:13 36:18 39:3 58:14	kind 7:19 12:24 13:4,15 27:9 32:22 33:4 40:14 47:14 48:23 50:12 54:23 55:2 57:7,15 61:19 64:13	legislative 15:4 19:7,9, 16 20:9 21:12,17,24 24:21
informed 27:14 28:2 29:20	issue 9:23 20:23 22:12 39:12 41:8 42:11 43:25 44:4,5 45:16,17 46:3,5, 10 48:3 51:9 52:2 53:1, 16,20 58:5	kinds 12:23	legislator's 45:6
initial 18:6	issued 7:14	knee 14:20 33:23	Legislature 61:6,10
initially 54:7	issues 12:8 13:4 21:2, 10 22:15,20,23 23:10 24:1 27:13 34:23 43:13 51:5 55:9	knew 50:17	lengthy 51:19
injunction 7:18	issuing 65:9,10		letter 10:1 11:22 12:11, 18 37:8 38:1,24 51:16 52:15
input 17:11	item 3:3,24 5:1 8:14 14:9 34:9 66:21 67:24		letters 41:24,25
inspired 60:12	items 47:16		level 7:16 9:17 24:25 46:12
Instagram 25:13			levels 19:20
installation 6:21			
Institute 6:13			
institution 11:1			
Instruction 59:7			

libraries 31:25	making 5:7,22 19:1,4 30:15 33:25 40:1	memo 36:20	month 5:12 14:13 48:13
likes 32:9 43:24	manages 5:10	mention 7:1 8:20 9:1, 21 43:13 58:17	months 36:17 39:3,14 42:13 45:13 46:15 49:11 51:10 55:5,12,19 56:14,18
limit 68:5	manner 31:1	mentioned 15:15 16:9, 24 18:22 22:2,12 24:12 26:7 31:13 32:8 58:18	morning 3:9,16,17 14:18
limited 39:14 68:2	March 3:4 5:17 10:1,4	mentioning 25:4 51:10 60:23	motion 4:10,12,24 7:8, 10,11,17,25 8:4 66:4,19 67:2 68:16 69:2
limits 18:2	Maricopa 29:14	mere 57:2	move 4:6 14:7 19:6 49:6 53:1 54:10 65:23 67:3 68:18
lines 13:22	Mark 3:2	Mesa 33:16	moved 66:7 67:12
list 35:4 60:24	match 43:14	message 24:21	move 4:6 14:7 19:6 49:6 53:1 54:10 65:23 67:3 68:18
listen 64:8	material 50:18	met 29:5,16	museum 6:5,6
live 20:21	materials 34:20 35:3	metaphors 13:20	mute 3:14,20
lives 27:17	matter 10:7 11:21 12:1 22:18 27:10,25 62:10 68:2,3	Meyer 3:9,10 4:12,14, 17,18 48:17 53:3,5,6 54:9 55:21,23,24 56:7, 19,21 66:12,13 67:16, 17 68:23 69:1,5,6	<hr/> N
local 5:20,23 19:20	matters 10:25 61:21 66:9	mic 17:23	naming 45:2
located 16:14	matures 53:14	mics 17:20,21	narrow 62:11
location 16:13	Mccain 6:13	middle 20:9	national 6:14 19:19
locations 31:25	Mcconnell 36:24	Mike 9:10	nationally 6:17
logo 17:4	meaning 38:8 40:6	Mike's 9:18	Native 32:1,3
long 36:13	meaningful 22:10 29:3	million 29:8 31:14	nature 12:22
longer 38:15	means 12:5 58:22	mind 37:20	NAU 24:10
lot 5:5 6:10,11 8:2,8,16 13:9 18:14 19:20 26:9, 10 28:3 35:14,15	meant 8:21	minute 18:4 54:21	navigating 27:12
lots 6:9	measures 35:23	minutes 3:25 4:1,7,10, 24 11:14 18:3 68:6	necessarily 23:1
love 31:7	media 6:16 16:12,25 17:1,8 18:12,14,23 19:12,13 22:3 23:11,14, 17,18,21 25:13 32:11 34:12,18 37:19 49:16 56:15 57:18	misinformation 58:1	negotiate 8:23
<hr/> M	meet 30:25 32:18 65:11	missing 13:25	neutral 10:9
made 11:11	meeting 3:4,25 4:2 9:3 10:23 11:4,16 12:14 24:9 29:4,10,19 30:5 50:16 67:2,4,13,23 69:13	mock 26:22,23	Night 6:5
mail 29:8,15,24 30:4 32:4,16 44:25 46:2	meetings 10:25 23:23 63:25 64:8 66:23	moderated 19:21	nonstandard 32:4
mailbox 32:12	member 61:22 64:12 68:7,8	moderator 17:18,23,24 18:17 20:7,11 21:9	northern 16:14
mailing 29:12	members 11:2 14:5 18:14 23:18 33:19 34:3 36:5 68:11	moderators 18:18 20:10 21:5,19 22:16 25:19,22	note 7:2,3
maintain 62:9		moments 27:7	notice 7:6 11:19
maintaining 9:2		Monday 7:6	notified 18:24
maintenance 11:24		Montclair 6:18	November 10:5
make 9:3 10:24 13:2 19:13 21:25 29:2 30:23 31:11 32:17 33:18 50:10 57:9,20,21 68:7,9			number 9:15 13:6,8 38:1 40:18 65:8
makes 47:24			
makeup 15:20			

<hr/> O	oppose 44:3 45:13 55:5	partner 17:1 18:23 29:9	petitions 15:17
object 46:23	opposed 40:4 44:3 46:7 56:3	partners 22:3 29:17 31:23	philosophical 27:22
obligation 13:2	opposes 36:17,21 41:6	partnership 16:11,25 19:12 30:1,18	Phoenix 16:14
obvious 35:18,19 42:19	opposing 49:10	party 21:16 24:11 37:16,17 60:1,2,9,19 61:3,18 62:1,8	phone 62:12
occupied 58:16	opposite 40:5	PASO 41:1,20,25 55:13	photograph 58:24
occupying 58:19	optically 45:20	passed 36:7	phrase 58:1
occurred 27:9	option 17:2 18:23	past 11:1 12:20 19:22 20:15 50:11	physical 26:16
odd 7:19	order 3:3,5 16:1 57:17 65:14	Pastor 6:21,22	pick 17:2 18:23 19:14 22:3 48:8
offer 26:20 31:8	ordinary 13:18	patch 40:16 41:9 60:5 62:6 63:12	picks 40:18 62:12
office 9:9,23 10:4,18 11:10 12:6,8,15,17 29:8,18 32:5 58:15,16, 17,18 62:12	organization 34:16	Paton 3:13,19,21 4:21, 22 47:10,12,13,23 48:7, 16,18,22 49:4,13,18,21, 24 50:8 51:1,8,14 53:8 66:5,14,15 67:8,11,18, 19 68:24 69:7,8	picture 30:8
offices 10:12 32:2	outline 36:13	Paton's 47:19	piece 27:3 32:25 46:5
official 15:12,21 29:23 40:25 41:10 43:12 44:1, 7 62:13	outreach 22:5 24:15 28:4 31:17	Paula 8:21 9:5 29:10 66:22	pieces 25:12 26:2 29:8 31:15 35:15
officially 65:23	overlay 35:11	pause 28:7	piloting 24:19
officials 34:13	overlays 46:14	pending 7:10,16	pitch 60:5
on-the-ground 33:17	overruled 58:21	people 24:14 27:4 31:7, 20 33:25 42:1,2,14 50:4,21 52:10,23 53:14 61:6	place 18:3 30:10,20 35:23 37:7
one-minute 18:7	overview 14:19 19:7 34:23	percent 5:19	placement 11:14
onion 12:15	owners 61:16 62:21 63:5	period 15:16,19 33:14	places 64:9
online 32:12	Oxford 27:15	permission 59:18	plain 36:23 38:8 40:6 42:17,21 46:5
open 10:3 11:3,15 12:14 62:3	<hr/> P	person 11:16,22 17:22 40:17,18 45:3 52:13 57:13 58:7,14,17 62:11	plaintiffs 7:15,21
opening 18:3	packet 4:2	person's 57:17	plaintiffs' 7:15,16,17, 21
opens 47:14	paid 23:14 32:11	perspective 10:10 28:3 35:9 36:3 58:11 64:12	plan 11:8 20:8 22:18 23:3
operation 9:2	panel 6:13	perspectives 27:13	pleased 30:2
opinion 34:10,15 35:13 39:1 65:9,10,24,25	panelist 6:20	persuaded 47:7	pocket 21:6
opinions 42:5	paper 32:25		podcaster 25:20
opportunity 6:3 9:9 17:5,10 25:3 26:4,6,9, 20 33:8 34:16 37:11 38:23 39:1 40:4,15 43:17,20,23 44:3,6,19 45:21 50:18 56:25 57:16 58:4 61:2,7,13, 22,24	paperwork 9:15		podcasts 25:21
	part 9:23 24:15,17 27:23 35:6,7,12 37:9 41:18 46:20 48:2,3 50:9 63:24		point 7:20 13:17 17:18 28:14 32:5 42:22 48:7 49:23 50:8,12,20 52:6 57:2 58:12 60:16 62:9, 18,20
	participate 24:8 27:4		points 13:10 65:7
	participation 24:6		policies 61:2,18
	parties 23:24 34:14		policy 7:4 23:1

political 6:22 23:24
27:22 37:16,17 60:1,2,
8,19
poll 21:1 22:13
pollsters 6:14
position 11:19 41:8
43:18,20 45:2,7,15
46:1,6 47:14 51:5 52:20
56:12 57:9 59:3 64:2
possibly 11:4 24:13
post 29:7 32:2,4
post-debate 20:2 25:5
Postal 29:5 30:1
posture 7:19
Powerpoint 36:12
38:2,3,14
precedent 13:3 36:24
preceding 36:17
precisely 50:24 64:12
predictable 42:20
preference 5:17
preliminary 7:18
premise 36:9
preparation 64:15
preparations 30:15
prepared 21:9
preparing 14:20
present 3:23
presentations 8:16
presented 34:17
presidential 5:17
presumes 38:24
pretty 5:16 10:7 12:16
13:22,23 28:20 36:22
40:13 63:20
prevent 35:24
preview 23:6
previously 15:8 16:10
31:4

primary 14:13 15:24
31:15 37:4
print 29:16 32:16
printed 30:9 32:25
prior 39:3 52:16 55:11
56:1 65:25
private 61:16 62:21
63:5
privileged 12:9
problem 50:16 58:9
problematically 11:20
procedural 7:19
procedurally 50:12
process 16:22 18:15
19:16 21:14 23:4,19
24:3 27:5 28:8,10 29:1,
4,7,19 30:6 35:12,14
64:3 65:14
processed 29:15
produce 32:19
production 22:6 33:24
productive 29:19
profile 30:8
program 5:10 8:25
14:14
progress 14:15 19:1
projects 14:16
promote 24:6 25:14
39:7 44:2 45:12,23
46:14 55:4,19
promotes 36:16,21
41:6
promoting 46:15,17
49:9
prompt 29:24
Prop 7:5 8:1 35:16
39:17 57:24 58:2,3
proposed 66:23 67:4
prospects 37:17 60:1,
8,18 61:10 62:1
prosperity 39:8

Prosperity's 8:1
protect 41:12 43:2
44:14,19 45:1
protection 46:17
provide 14:22 30:24
31:1 34:23 42:5 48:5
52:13 60:20
providing 26:18
provision 36:15 37:2
provisions 36:14
public 10:15,25 12:10
15:2 34:12,19,21 37:3,
14 40:23 56:13,17 57:4
59:6 67:24 68:1,7,8,12,
14
publication 36:16
published 7:3 15:5
purport 42:2
purpose 48:12,14
purposes 38:25
push 20:3 23:10,14
33:15
put 9:24 17:3,9 18:17
21:1 39:9 45:11 64:15
putting 31:24 37:22

Q

qualified 15:14 30:12
qualify 15:18
quarters 9:5
question 18:5 37:9,25
43:8,9 44:8 47:20 50:15
51:24 52:8 54:15 56:10
59:9,17,19,21,24 60:7
64:20
questions 9:13,14
14:2,4 20:17,18 21:5,8
23:16 28:8,9,13 33:22
34:3,17,24 39:23 48:9
50:24 59:20 62:17
63:16 64:16,17,23
quick 24:20

quickly 5:16 7:1,7 8:13
quiet 21:7
quo 8:5
quote 11:24 27:11 57:6,
7

R

races 15:6
raise 12:8
raised 64:23
ranked 28:23
rapport 9:17
rate 5:19
reach 17:5 32:9,23
41:15
reached 56:10
reaching 30:11
read 10:1 32:12 38:17
51:22 52:1,7 61:4
reading 54:4
ready 64:16
real 12:8 13:13
reality 47:23
reason 10:16 41:21
46:20 48:3 50:9 63:24
reasons 59:12
rebuttal 18:7
received 17:12 33:6
41:19 50:22
recommendation
11:25 24:18 65:13,16
recommendations
17:15 18:9 19:24 24:19
record 3:8
records 12:10
reel 38:17
reels 25:13,14 26:1
38:19
reestablish 10:14

refer 44:4 54:25 55:19 61:19	represented 30:13	running 9:12 58:15,17 59:5	set 34:19 56:16,17
referee 47:15,24	reproduced 38:2		shape 22:16
reference 56:4 57:3, 10,11 59:1 62:8,24,25	Republican 59:5 60:25 61:6,10	S	share 28:22 29:21
referral 55:6,17	Republicans 60:25 63:1	Salon 62:20,23	ship 32:10
referred 59:6	request 34:15 35:13 36:14 63:23 65:18,25	Salon.com 60:11	shipments 31:22
refers 37:3 57:5,13	required 39:16	save 15:9	short 39:5
reflect 5:9	rescheduling 68:3	schedule 15:2,3,9 16:2,4 18:25 23:16 25:1,8	shortly 15:7
reflective 21:10	research 20:23 22:12 26:16 28:23	scheduled 65:11	shorts 38:19
regime 36:8	researching 24:22	school 32:24	shot 11:23
regions 21:11	respect 52:17	schools 32:8	show 27:16 29:7 40:3
registered 31:19 32:17	respected 17:11	screen 11:18 16:24 44:24 49:8	showcase 17:10 27:25
regulated 35:4 36:3 41:15 42:3 50:23 57:23 65:1	responding 34:22 68:4	seamlessly 21:20	showed 53:17
reimagine 33:9	response 14:6 18:6 28:12 34:4 54:11 59:22 63:18	season 8:19 23:25	side 21:25 33:9 39:24
reimagining 32:13	responsiveness 9:19, 20	seconded 4:13 66:8 67:12	Sign 30:17
relating 34:11	result 68:1	Secretary 7:4 29:18	sign-ups 24:24
relation 45:17	retained 17:17	section 54:15	similar 41:8 45:20 46:13
relationship 11:9	review 66:22	seek 11:8 65:23	similarly 39:19
relevant 22:10 29:3	reviewed 50:18 52:14	seeking 48:4	simple 36:22
reliable 42:8	Riester 16:12 29:17	segment 27:6	simply 29:7 39:10 41:8, 9 56:4
religious 27:23	rigging 61:17	selections 18:17,20	sir 3:15
rely 64:4	Roberts 14:14,18 28:19 34:7	self-evident 10:7 61:1	sit 10:16
remain 29:2	robotics 33:4	Senate 23:8	six-month 56:3
remember 45:5 56:9	role 11:15	senator 38:22 39:2 40:20 43:2,4,23 45:1,2, 4,5,15 46:1,4,6,7 57:14 60:17	size 30:23
remind 28:22	roll 4:15 66:9 67:13 69:2	send 15:9,12 31:18,22, 25 32:1,6,15 38:21 43:3 68:14	slicing 12:15
reminder 15:23	rolled 12:18	sending 31:21	slide 15:1 16:6 19:6 20:1,5 22:4 28:5 31:16 33:20 37:22 40:8 53:16 56:2 58:10 59:16 62:6
report 5:2,16 7:2 10:1 13:16,24 14:2,15 16:10 20:25 26:8 57:25	room 23:21	sense 43:13	slides 14:23
reported 58:21	round 52:23	series 6:23 27:24	slight 47:1
reports 13:2	rule 42:7 48:14 53:15 64:5 65:9	serve 60:20	small 13:7
represent 42:3	rules 23:25	service 24:18,23 25:2 29:5 30:2 32:2	So-and-so 40:20 43:2, 4 46:4
representative 40:20 45:5			social 23:11 25:13 31:6
representatives 29:11			soft 24:25
			solicitation 40:24

soliciting 59:11	started 14:25 24:22,24	Studios 16:14	tailored 22:9
Solicitor 11:10 12:6,7, 17	starts 55:1	study 68:2	takes 58:2
sort 10:13 11:7 33:9 35:4 36:9 39:5,24 40:6 46:22 52:20 53:13 54:16,20	state 6:10,19 7:4,8 8:9 16:16 17:1 18:13,23 19:18 21:2 22:24 23:15 26:7 29:12,13	style 16:19	taking 37:7 64:24
sought 38:8 55:15 59:4	State's 29:18	subdebates 21:18	talk 12:7 20:1,4 21:3 22:13 23:9,24 25:22 26:9,11,17,21,22 28:24 37:12 40:19 46:9 50:21 52:17 54:2,21 60:4 63:25 64:1
sound 13:16	statements 18:3	subdefinitions 37:18	talking 9:1,10,16 10:15 14:1 18:12 23:8 24:2 46:10 51:24 54:23 57:21
Sounds 30:18	States 29:5 30:1	subject 22:18 44:5	talks 27:6 36:15 39:14 54:16 64:5
space 55:12	statewide 15:4 16:9	submissions 30:7,10	tall 63:20
Spanish 19:3	status 8:5	submit 20:20,21 23:16	tax 61:15 62:21 63:4
speaking 17:22,25 21:21	statute 35:9 45:12 46:14 50:14,21 52:17 56:17	submitting 30:7	teachers 6:9 26:25
specialist 22:21	statutes 56:7	substantive 9:19 41:17	team 27:1 28:16
specific 11:13,16 52:11	stay 7:14,15,21 8:5 14:23	Such-and-such 43:23 57:14	technology 16:17
specifically 32:2 64:10	steering 17:9 18:11	sufficient 48:6	telling 43:19 45:25
spend 8:10 9:22 53:10, 22 54:1	STEM 32:24 33:1,8	suggestions 67:25	template 21:19
spending 34:12,18 37:19 49:16 56:15 57:18	step 61:12	Sun 30:18	tend 61:2
sports 13:20	Stephenson 20:15	Superintendent 59:6	term 51:16 54:17,19 58:13
staff 11:2 30:11 34:20 36:5 51:2 58:11 64:12 68:2	steps 61:11,12	Superior 7:16	terms 10:9 36:5,22,25 38:9 42:17,21 45:11 56:16,17 61:19
staff's 65:13,16	Steve 3:16 19:17,20 20:5 25:4,19,20	support 37:15 39:7 43:16,18,24,25 44:2 45:12,16,23 46:4,8,14 55:4 59:24	text 24:21 39:6 50:14 64:10
stage 16:23 56:3	stevedore's 10:17	supporting 39:11,12 45:18 46:16,17 49:10 61:25	texting 24:18,23 25:1
stagger 29:22	sticker 31:5,6	supports 36:16,21 41:6 44:7	textual 52:11
stakeholder 18:11	stickers 31:7	supposed 38:4	thanking 39:11
stakeholders 17:11	stipulate 45:24	Supreme 7:9,12 8:3 36:23	theories 60:13
stance 40:5	stitched 31:9	surface 46:12	thing 5:8 12:24 19:25 35:7 36:11 40:14 43:23 46:2 48:19 55:4 57:15 58:4
stand 11:7	stock 20:16 21:5	surprised 25:23	things 5:5,7 6:2 8:5,25 9:3,15 10:12 11:7 24:11,12,13 25:23 31:3 32:21 33:24 43:10 52:4
standard 18:2 32:14 41:25 42:1 51:15 52:9 55:13	stop 39:25	system 61:17	
standpoint 23:1	stops 57:21		
stands 63:9	stream 19:10,14	T	
start 10:17 25:9 36:9 37:22	streaming 22:2	table 6:10 26:10	
	structure 21:16	tactic 40:15	
	student 24:10 26:24,25	tactics 32:11	
	students 6:18 26:13,14	tags 38:4	
	studio 16:21		

thinking 48:22 53:11
54:1
thinks 13:25
thought 11:23 12:17
14:21 53:2 61:8
thresholds 39:16
ties 40:13
time 8:10 9:6,22 13:11
17:21 18:1,2,6 21:21
37:5 39:13,14 46:19,21
53:10,21 54:1 55:11
56:8 57:20 58:16 64:24
65:2 67:24 68:8,16
timeline 29:21 48:14
55:9
timely 9:20 14:22
times 51:23 52:15
Titla 3:13,15,16,18
4:19,20 66:16,17 67:20,
21 69:9,10
Title 54:17
today 5:8 8:16 14:19
37:20 64:25
told 41:22
Tom 5:2 14:3 23:7 26:7
34:22,25 38:12 42:23
44:17 45:7 47:10 51:18
53:1 54:12 56:22 59:21,
23 64:20,23 65:6 66:20
Toma 7:10,13 8:6
tone 52:4
tonight 24:22
toolkits 24:4,5,7
tools 16:21 26:13,18
27:5 28:24
top 22:20 23:10 24:1
28:24
touch 52:2
tour 16:15
track 13:6 14:24
train 13:10,11
training 20:8

transaction 13:8
transactions 8:23
transfer 7:11 8:4
transferred 7:8
translate 30:19
translations 30:21
transparency 11:5
transparent 13:4
treated 56:2 59:10
trigger 49:16 57:17
true 21:22
trust 9:17 28:25
tune 22:8 24:22
turn 33:2 57:4
turnout 5:19
TV 19:9
two-minute 18:5
typically 20:17

U

U.S. 23:8 36:23
ultimately 27:14 61:23
64:3
unambiguous 59:1
unanimously 4:25
understand 10:10,14
22:23 23:19 29:23 36:2
50:2 53:15
understanding 7:7
22:14 27:15 64:15
understood 42:2
45:22 60:7
undertaking 34:6
unforgettable 27:6
unique 40:14
United 29:5 30:1
universities 32:7
unnecessary 59:2

unofficial 5:19
unquote 11:25
upcoming 23:8
update 14:22 16:7
updates 14:24
USPS 29:16
utilize 24:23 27:5 28:25
33:7

V

vague 37:1
validated 12:11
values 55:16
vendor 29:17
version 30:18
versions 30:16,25
versus 7:4 45:3 52:21
VI 66:21
video 22:22 38:19
videos 22:19 23:3,6
25:24
view 45:21 49:23 57:12,
16 58:12 62:9
VII 67:24
violate 57:24 58:2
violating 58:3
violation 11:22
vis-a-vis 43:20
visit 38:23
visitors 6:11
vistas 43:11
visual 33:3
visually 16:19
voice 5:6
volume 50:17
vote 35:22 41:12 43:2
44:14,20 45:1 46:2,18
55:15 64:25 65:17,18

voted 31:5,6 44:25 46:2
voter 6:2 8:17 14:10,11,
14,21 16:10 22:5,10,11
24:20 26:12 28:3,6,21,
22 29:2 30:16 31:3,8,19
32:14 33:10,11,22,25
voters 16:4,24 17:6
20:3,18,19 21:1,7,11,22
22:8,14,20,23 23:12,15
24:1,5,7,24,25 25:7,15
26:3,18 28:2,24 29:3
30:25 32:5,11,17,18
35:20 36:7 55:13
voters' 10:21 23:5
votes 4:23 66:18 67:22
69:11
voting 6:15 25:9 30:22
31:25 33:14 40:1 45:4
60:12
vying 35:21

W

wading 63:20
wait 65:1
waiting 10:5
wanted 6:1 8:13,14,19
9:3,8,21 31:12 35:6
36:9 46:20,21 50:10,18,
21 54:7 56:24 62:19
63:24
watch 6:24 24:11 26:3
watching 23:12 24:14
25:16
water 22:19,21
ways 29:1
website 5:22 11:14,24
15:3 16:5
week 7:24 8:6 18:21,22
weigh 65:2
well-known 19:17
white 48:19
winning 19:19

wonderful 30:1 31:24

word 13:19 57:23

words 10:3 42:11 55:8
56:8 57:12

work 6:4 8:17,18 9:7
13:21 26:6,24 28:16
37:10,11 65:14

worked 21:18

workgroup 17:15
18:10 19:25 21:15
24:18 25:11

working 10:24 15:5,8
16:11 18:19 20:10 22:6
24:10 30:11,21 33:23
37:19 53:14

works 29:20 32:20

world 27:15 33:3

wrapping 20:24 25:9

writer 20:14,15

written 4:7 65:15,18

wrote 11:22

X

Xer 38:4,18

Y

year 6:12

years 11:1 13:3 19:18
44:25

yesterday 7:14

youth 6:15

Youtube 19:11 64:8

Z

Zoom 19:10 68:9