1	
2	
3	
4	THE STATE OF ARIZONA
5	CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING
11	
12	
13	
14	Phoenix, Arizona
15	March 22, 2018
16	9:32 a.m.
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	COASH & COASH, INC.
22	Court Reporting, Video & Videoconferencing 1802 North 7th Street, Phoenix, AZ 85006 602-258-1440 staff@coashandcoash.com
23	002-230-1440 Stall@COasHandCoasH.COM
24	Prepared by:
25	LILIA MONARREZ, CSR, RPR Certificate No. 50699

Coash & Coash, Inc. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com

Citize	ens Clean Elections Commission	March 22, 201
	Page 2	9: 09:33:50-09:35:11 Page 4
2 3 4 5	PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:32 a.m. on March 22, 2018, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections Commission, 1616 West Adams, Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following Board members: Mr. Damien R. Meyer, Chairperson Mr. Mark S. Kimble Ms. Amy B. Chan Mr. Galen D. Paton OTHERS PRESENT: Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director Sara Larsen, Financial Affairs Officer Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director Mike Becker, Policy Director Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon (telephonic) Stephanic Cooper, Executive Support Specialist Anne Froedge, Assistant Attorney General Joseph LaRue, Assistant Attorney General Christina Stone, Riester Mirja Riester, Riester	1 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Abstentions? 2 (No response.) 3 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries. 4 Item III: Discussion and possible action 5 on Executive Director's Report and notice of 6 administrative closure of MURS 18-01, -02 and -03. 7 Tom? 8 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Mr. Chairman, 9 Commissioners, just to really quickly talk about the 10 second half of the notice, about, I think, two years 11 ago, the Commission authorized the executive director 12 to close complaints administratively under certain 13 circumstances that are outlined in the rule, and we've 14 done that with three complaints. 15 I would note that one of those complaints, 16 the closure we had a request to reconsider that 17 decision. And I declined to reconsider that, but in 18 the event that having read any of those 19 administrative closures, that a commissioner wanted to 20 direct staff to reinstate a complaint, we can do that. 21 And we think that's the the rule that you passed 22 requires that you receive notice of the administrative 23 closures that I've done. 24 So 25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
09:32	2:51-09:33:49 Page 3	3 09:35:12-09:36:23 Page 5
	•	CHAIDMAN MEVED. Commissioner Class
1	PROCEEDING	1 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Chan.

- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Good morning. We're going
- 4 to call -- good morning. We're going to call to order
- 5 the meeting of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission
- 6 for March 22nd, 2018.
- We're going to start with Item Number II:
- 8 Discussion and possible action on Commission minutes
- **9** for February 15 of 2018.
- Any questions or comments on the minutes, 10
- 11 or a motion to approve the minutes?
- COMMISSIONER CHAN: Move to approve the 12
- 13 minutes as written.
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: I have a motion to approve 14
- 15 the minutes.
- Is there a second? 16
- 17 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second.
- 18 CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. A motion has
- 19 been moved and seconded.
- 20 In favor -- all in favor of approving the
- 21 meeting minutes for the February 15th, 2018, meeting
- 22 say aye.
- 23 (Chorus of ayes.)
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: All opposed? 24
- 25 (No response.)

- COMMISSIONER CHAN: Tom -- Mr. Chairman,
- 3 Tom, who request the reconsideration of the closure?
- MR. COLLINS: The complainant in MUR-03.
- 5 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. Thank you.
- MR. COLLINS: So we haven't had that
- 7 happen -- we haven't -- we haven't had that come up
- 8 before. So I just wanted to note that one specifically
- 9 in the record. So I appreciate it.
- 10 Real quickly, just highlights of what's
- happened since we last met, which seems like a long
- time ago -- and I'll move through this quickly -- in
- campaign finance news, the city of Tempe passed a
- 14 disclosure measure by a vote of 91 percent in their
- March election, and the city of Phoenix city council
- voted 6 to 3 to authorize staff to begin researching
- potential campaign finance reform measures for the 2018
- 18 Phoenix ballot.
- Gina testified at the U.S. Commission on
- 20 Civil Rights briefing -- Arizona Advisory Committee
- briefing on voting rights in Arizona on her research
- 22 and the research she's overseen on what motivates
- 23 voters and what interferes with voters, you know,
- 24 actually voting and the Commission's voter education
- **25** plan.

09:36:23-09:37:47 Page 6 | 09:39:27-09:40:40 Page 8

- 1 The Commission does have a new website
- 2 that's up. I would take a look at it if you get a
- 3 chance. We really are proud of it. Alec and Stephanie
- 4 and Gina have all worked very, very hard to get it
- 5 prepared. Alec has been -- as far as I understand, he
- 6 hasn't left the office in a month at all, and he's
- 7 here, you know.
- 8 So it's been a real labor for them, but I
- 9 think that the results are going to benefit voters
- 10 because I think the website is better organized and the
- 11 content is easier to access. And it's more oriented
- 12 towards getting voters what they need quickly than
- 13 our -- than our prior version. And I've got to say
- 14 that I really liked our previous website, but once --
- 15 you know, I think all of us as staff have remarked that
- 16 once you saw the new website, the old website didn't
- 17 look like -- well, the old website, it really looked
- 18 like it had aged.
- **19** So we're really proud of that. I'm really
- 20 proud of them, and I -- and I think that that's
- 21 really -- that's great.
- We're working on the debate schedule. We
- 23 do -- we have been working with a number of
- 24 districts -- school districts on a pilot program to
- 25 host debates which is -- you know, Commissioner Paton

- 1 spending limits that apply to clean candidates because
- 2 the expenditure is not by the candidate. It is -- a
- 3 party expenditure is -- by definition under Senate Bill
- 4 1516 is not a contribution and it's not an expenditure
- 5 by the candidate.
- 6 It's also one of the provisions that the
- 7 Arizona Advocacy Network and the Democratic Caucus and
- 8 the rest of the plaintiffs are suing over, that
- 9 particular provision, but nevertheless, that's there to
- 10 make sure that everybody knows what the Commission has
- 11 already put into the rule and what's in law.
- And that's all. I apologize for going on
- 13 so long, but that is -- that completes my report.
- 14 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
- 15 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Yes, Commissioner Chan.
- 16 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I just
- 17 wanted to recognize the city of Tempe and the city of
- 18 Phoenix because I feel like I'm really, really pleased
- 19 to see cities picking up the slack where the State has
- 20 left off with regard to dark money and trying to shine
- 21 a light on who's spending money on elections. I always
- 22 say this. So I may sound like a broken record, but as
- 23 a voter, to me, I want to know who's speaking in our
- 24 elections, who's making the claims and statements that
- 25 we see on our ads and our mailers.

09:37:50-09:39:22 Page 7 09:40:43-09:41:50 Page 9

- 1 has raised for us, and I think that's been going well.
- 2 And, you know, I think that, you know --
- 3 and I think the benefit will be even if the turnout at
- 4 the debates is not -- in terms of live folks is not
- 5 necessarily -- doesn't -- even if it worked -- even if
- 6 it increases but doesn't increase dramatically, I think
- 7 that being in the community in this way will be a
- 8 measure of success if word of mouth gets folks watching
- 9 it on YouTube and those kinds of things, which I
- 10 think -- I think is important. And Commissioner Kimble
- 11 has been working with Gina on Legislative -- 2? --
- **12** Legislative District 2.
- There's an election on April 24th.
- 14 The last thing I wanted to mention -- and I
- 15 don't mean to go on so long -- is there's a -- there's
- **16** a memo or an email, rather, that I wrote to an attorney
- 17 who requested one regarding how Section 16-911 of the
- 18 new campaign finance measure that passed a couple of
- 19 years ago interacted with the clean candidate spending
- 20 limits, and there's some language in a guidebook which
- 21 the Secretary produced that says that party
- 22 expenditures would be reported by the candidate if
- 23 they're for the candidate.
- 24 And it doesn't have a citation to it or
- 25 anything, but there's -- that would not affect the

- 1 And so dark money has been something that I
- 2 really oppose and have opposed since Citizens United
- 3 legitimized it. And I'm just very, very pleased to see
- 4 that where the State has kind of dropped the ball, in
- 5 my opinion, that we have some localities here in the
- 6 Valley picking up the slack. So kudos to Tempe and
- 7 their voters and kudos to the city of Phoenix for
- 8 looking into that.
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you, Commissioner
- 10 Chan.
- 11 Any other comments on the executive
- 12 director report?
- 13 (No response.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Let's move on to
- 15 Agenda Item Number IV: Recognition and appreciation to
- 16 Sara Larsen, financial affairs and compliance officer,
- 17 for her service to the Commission and the state of
- 18 Arizona.
- 19 Sara, congratulations. We're very sad ---
- 20 sad that you're leaving us, but very happy for you that
- 21 you're moving on to something that you're very excited
- 22 about, I understand, from Tom.
- 23 Tom, I'll give you the floor to -- to make
- 24 any comments.
- MR. COLLINS: Yeah, but I -- thank you,

09:41:53-09:43:20 Page 10 09:44:25-09:45:59 Page 12

- 1 Mr. Chairman. Yeah, this is, I think, a real
- 2 opportunity for Sara. I was talking to Todd Lang
- 3 who -- now Judge Lang who is the executive director who
- 4 hired Sara, and he said it will -- basically, that
- 5 was -- like, her job will to just do good things for
- 6 the world which -- and Todd is in San Francisco or he
- 7 would be here.
- I've spoken with -- or emailed with a
- 9 number of former commissioners. Commissioner Reckart
- 10 told me that he thinks that everybody on the -- every
- 11 commissioner has always been in awe of Sara's work.
- 12 You know, Commissioner -- Commissioner Koester
- 13 similarly said that.
- 14 There are two things I've received by email
- 15 that I wanted to specifically read in the record. One
- 16 is from former Chairman Laird who would have been here,
- 17 but he is -- he left for a cruise off the Panama Canal
- vesterday -- vesterday night.
- He said, I'm excited to hear about the 19
- 20 wonderful position that Sara Larsen has accepted at the
- 21 Flinn Foundation. During my time on the Commission, it
- 22 was a great joy to get to know and work with Sara. She
- 23 was a high school friend of my son's, and I took
- 24 special joy in watching her provide such outstanding
- 25 work and service to the Commission. When I came on the

- So I think that that sums up better than I
- 2 could in my own words, but I've worked with Sara for
- 3 seven years. We have worked on conciliations at 1:00
- o'clock in the morning. We have seen the entire office
- gutted and then restored. And so, you know, she's been
- integral to our work here and, certainly since I've had
- since this job, crucial to us being able to perform our
- 8 work.
- 9 So I would turn it over to the rest of the
- 10 Commission at that point, anything else you-all want to
- 11 say, but congratulations.
- 12 And we will miss you. And we have a plaque
- 13 coming, but we -- the plaque will be here.
- COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman? 14
- 15 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Kimble.
- COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: I just wanted to 16
- 17 briefly say, Sara, that I think it would have been
- impossible to do this job without all of your
- assistance and guidance, and I have just been in awe at
- your encyclopedic knowledge of everything in here by
- section, by subsection, by rule number and everything.
- And a number of the enforcement actions
- 23 that we're going to be discussing today -- one in
- 24 particular -- would not have -- would not have come
- 25 about without your expertise in the area of all the

09:43:22-09:44:23 Page 11 09:46:04-09:47:16 Page 13

- 1 Commission, I asked for some accounting and budget
- 2 reports that had never been done by the Commission, and
- 3 the very next meeting after I expressed my desire for
- 4 the reports, Sara had them all done exactly as I had 5 requested. And for the rest of my tenure, those
- 6 reports were prepared and presented by Sara with the
- 7 highest level of professionalism and accuracy. It is
- 8 rare to find someone who has the professional
- 9 abilities, character and wonderful people skills that
- 10 Sara possesses. Sara is a constant professional who
- 11 will succeed and excel in anything she does in her new
- 12 job opportunities. It's a great loss for the
- 13 Commission, but another step for Sara as she continues
- 14 to grow professionally. I wish her the very best in
- 15 all she does.
- And then the second one -- the other thing 16
- 17 I wanted to read, as you all know -- maybe some of you
- 18 know -- Daniel Ruiz was our deputy director. He is now
- 19 deputy chief of staff at -- for Governor Ducey, and he
- 20 wrote me to say that he was so appreciative to have the
- 21 opportunity to work with Sara Larsen. Her passion for
- 22 public policy is admirable and I know that it will be a
- 23 great benefit in her new role. That combined with the
- 24 positive congeniality will undoubtedly be helpful in 25 inspiring future leaders at the Flinn Foundation.

- 1 rules that we have that I can't possibly keep track of
 - 2 in the detail that you've been able to.
 - In addition to that, your knowledge of the
 - 4 budget, which we discussed just recently, anyone who
- asked a question here, you had an immediate answer to,
- which was astounding. And I think -- while I'm happy
- that you're doing a job that I know is something that's
- going to be a new challenge for you, I think it's very
- 9 sad for the Commission and it's going to be a huge **10** loss.
- COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman? 11
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Chan. 12
- COMMISSIONER CHAN: I guess I'm the one 13
- 14 commissioner who's been here the shortest amount of
- time since you have been here, but I knew you a little
- bit before from my role at the Secretary of State's
- office. And I was floored when I heard the news, and
- 18 I'm thrilled for you. It's fabulous that you found
- something wonderful to step into and it is important to
- kind of try new things and especially things that are
- 21 meaningful to us, but having said that, it is a big
- 22 loss for us because you're so knowledgeable and have
- So we've got big shoes to fill that you're

done such a wonderful job.

25 leaving, and I know that we'll hopefully be able to

23

09:47:20-09:48:28 Page 14 09:49:42-09:50:54 Page 16

- 1 fill them with somebody who can do as wonderful a job
- 2 as you have done. And when I was speaking with you
- 3 before the meeting, Mike mentioned -- Mike Becker
- 4 mentioned you'll be back. And maybe 5, 10, 20 years,
- 5 you know, people seem to come back to this place. So,
- 6 anyway, we can hope.
- Thank you very much for everything you've
- 8 done for us.
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you, Commissioner
- 10 Chan.
- Commissioner Kimble, do you have any 11
- 12 comments?
- COMMISSIONER PATON: Thanks a lot. I 13
- 14 appreciated -- all of the staff, I really appreciate
- 15 all their work, and you've been tops. So thank you.
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: And, yes, I echo what my 16
- 17 fellow commissioners have said, and I just -- you know,
- 18 it's a -- it's a steep learning curve that we have when
- 19 we join the Commission. And I don't think I've ever
- 20 asked a question that you didn't immediately know the
- 21 answer to, and I've always appreciated that. And
- 22 equally -- I've been equally appreciative of just your
- 23 professionalism. The way you go about doing your job
- 24 is very admirable and something that we're missing a
- 25 lot during these times.

- 1 which we work with.
- And I just want to say, you know, I
- 3 leave -- it's very bitter sweet that I leave. I've
- 4 spent a lot of my professional life here and I'm
- working with the Commission, and I believe in
- everything that we do here. And I know that everyone
- here is committed to it, and I'm just -- I'm so
- grateful for the opportunity that I've had to have been
- here and worked with all of you and for all of you.
- And thank you so much for your kind words.
- 11 Thanks.
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you.
- COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman, I might 13
- 14 point out to the governor there is a vacancy on the
- 15 Commission if he's looking for someone to fill it.
- 16 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you.
- 17 Now Item Number V: Discussion and possible
- 18 action on administrative law judge recommendation on
- 19 MUR 17-01, Jesus Rubalcava.
- 20 Go ahead.
- 21 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners,
- 22 so this is a return of the measure -- of the award that
- we entered that was appealed to the administrative law
- 24 judge. What I think we'd like to do -- I don't know --
- 25 Joe LaRue is here, and he represented us at the ALJ.

09:48:30-09:49:38 Page 15 09:50:59-09:52:35 Page 17

- So we'll always be very thankful for all
- 2 the help you did, both the Commission, me personally.
- 3 So thank you very much, and we wish you nothing but the
- 4 best of luck. So thank you.
- 5 All right.
- MR. COLLINS: Did you have anything you
- 7 want to the add?
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Oh, I'm sorry. Gina,
- 9 thank you.
- Thank you, Tom. 10
- 11
- 12 MS. LARSEN: Chairman, Commissioners, thank
- 13 you so much for all your kind words and, Tom, thank you
- 14 for reaching out to some of the previous commissioners.
- 15 And Todd and Daniel, those are so nice for everything.
- I have really enjoyed my time here at the
- 17 Commission, and I have learned a lot. I have grown a
- 18 lot. I have definitely been challenged while I've been
- 19 here, and I've just -- I've enjoyed every minute of
- 20 being here. I've enjoyed my coworkers immensely, and
- 21 this has been a fabulous place to come to work and to
- 22 do something good, something that I believe in. And,
- 23 you know, this is a fantastic agency, and we rarely
- 24 have turnover here. And I think that's a testament to
- 25 the environment in which we work and the people in

- 1 We also have independent advice from the Attorney
- 2 General's Office, a different division because this is
- 3 an adjudicatory decision.
- And so with that, I think I'll turn it over
- 5 to Joe to walk you through his and on my behalf's
- 6 recommendations and then, to the best of my knowledge,
- Mr. Rubalcava is not here and hasn't contacted to us to
- appear, although he did receive notice at least twice.
- So that's -- I guess I will turn it over to
- 10 Joe, Mr. Chairman, with your permission, if that's 11 okay.
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay.
- MR. LaRUE: Thank you, Tom. 13
- Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, the
- administrative law judge issued what is known as a
- recommended order on February 28th. In that
- recommended order, she provided what lawyers and courts
- call findings of fact and conclusions of law. And, in
- 19 layman's terms, non-lawyer terms, that means that she
- found certain pieces of evidence to be true or
- compelling, and she made certain conclusions of law as 22 to with regard to how the law works and what should
- 23 happen.
- After having made those findings of fact
- 25 and conclusions of law -- which I guess I should say

09:52:38-09:54:11 Page 18 09:56:02-09:57:33 Page 20

- 1 the findings of fact are based on the evidence that was
- 2 presented to her in the hearing where Tom and Sara both
- 3 testified and Mr. Rubalcava also testified. After
- 4 making those findings of fact and conclusions of law,
- 5 she issued what we call a recommended order, and this
- 6 is a little different than the way things work in state
- 7 court.
- 8 In state court the judge issues an order
- 9 and that is the order. In the administrative law
- 10 courts, the administrative law judge in this type of
- 11 situation issues a recommended order, and that order
- 12 then comes back to the Commission for the Commission to
- 13 act upon.
- 14 You are represented by counsel from the
- 15 Attorney General's Office separate from me, and so she
- 16 can address what I'm about to say when I'm done and
- answer any questions that you may have about the
- process, but just by brief overview, the Arizona
- 19 Revised Statutes say that within 30 days, the
- 20 Commission must either accept, modify or reject the
- 21 administrative law judge's recommended order. And so
- 22 we are within that 30-day mark, and the -- the
- 23 intention, I guess, is that the Commission will take
- 24 one of those actions today.
- 25 My recommendation as the attorney that

- 1 date of your final administrative decision, the full
- 2 civil penalty in the amount of \$52,290.60.
- As I -- as I said a few moments ago, she
- 4 basically affirmed your judgment against Mr. Rubalcava,
- and that's why, again, as the attorney that litigated
- this, I would recommend that the Commission accept the
- recommended order from the administrative law judge.
- 8 Do you have any questions for me?
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEYER: I do not, Mr. LaRue.
- 10 Anyone else have a question?
- 11 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman?
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Kimble.
- COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: One question. So if 13
- 14 we accept this, it is binding on Mr. Rubalcava.
- Is it also binding on us that we cannot 15
- negotiate any lower amount than this? That this is the
- amount he has to pay and it is now out of our hands?
- MR. LaRUE: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
- Kimble, my understanding of the law is that you can
- always negotiate a lower amount, but this will be the
- repayment order issued to Mr. Rubalcava. And that
- becomes your starting point if, in fact, you want to
- negotiate a lower amount.
- COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you. 24
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any other questions from

09:54:14-09:55:58 Page 19 09:57:37-09:58:34 Page 21

- 1 litigated this, but not as your attorney -- again, your
- 2 attorney is on the dais with you, by my recommendation
- 3 as the attorney who litigated this is that you accept
- 4 her order for these reasons. She basically agreed with 5 you fully with regard to your repayment order. She did
- 6 reduce the order by \$86.40. And the reason she did
- 7 that, during the evidentiary portion of the hearing
- 8 Mr. Rubalcava produced a receipt from Vista Print for
- **9** business cards in the amount of \$28.80.
- 10 She recognized that the auditor -- that the
- 11 auditors had recognized that Mr. Rubalcava might have
- 12 actually spent some money on allowable purposes, but he
- 13 had not demonstrated that. She took this receipt as
- **14** demonstration that \$28.80 had been spent on legitimate
- 15 campaign-related expenses that are allowed under the
- 16 Clean Elections Act. So what she did is she took that
- 17 \$28.80 and she multiplied it by 3 because, if you
- 18 recall, your civil penalty order was three times the
- 19 repayment order.
- 20 And so she multiplied that by 3, which
- 21 comes up to \$86.40, and then she reduced the civil
- 22 penalty by that amount. She then issued a recommended
- 23 order where she recommended that the Commission affirm
- 24 all of its findings against Mr. Rubalcava and order
- 25 Mr. Rubalcava to repay, within 30 days of the effective

- 1 the commissioners?
- (No response.)
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you, Mr. LaRue.
- MR. LaRUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 4
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. So at this point in
- 6 time, I think we want to take a vote, do we not, Tom,
- on whether or not we want to accept the order and
- the -- I'm sorry. What -- can you say your name for
- **9** the record?
- MS. FROEDGE: Yes. I'm sorry. My name is 10
- 11 Anne Froedge.
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Ann Froedge. Thank you.
- Ms. Froedge, did you have any comments 13
- 14 before we move to a vote on Mr. LaRue's recommendation?
- MS. FROEDGE: Mr. Chairman, members of the 15
- 16 Commission --
- 17 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Can you talk into the mic,
- 18 please?
- 19 MS. FROEDGE: Oh. This one?
- 20 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Yes. There you go.
- MS. FROEDGE: Yes. Mr. Chairman, members 21
- 22 of the Commission, I would just request that you ask
- the Commission members if they've reviewed the entire administrative law judge decision and, if there's going
- 25 to be a request to make any changes to the findings of

09:58:37-09:59:40 Page 22 | 10:00:28-10:01:16 Page 24

- 1 fact, that everyone state that they have reviewed the
- 2 record of the case.
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. I have reviewed it.
- 4 I have reviewed the opinion.
- 5 Have the other commissioners also reviewed
- 6 it?
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yes.
- 8 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Yes.
- 9 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Yes.
- 10 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. We've all reviewed
- 11 it.
- MS. FROEDGE: And then, also, I would
- 13 request that you vote separately on the findings of
- 14 fact and the conclusions of law in the order.
- 15 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Three separate votes?
- 16 MS. FROEDGE: Yes.
- 17 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Okay. So, I guess,
- 18 first, is there a motion that we approve the finding of
- 19 facts of the administrative law judge decision in Case
- 20 Number 18F-002-CCE?
- 21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I
- 22 would -- I would move that we approve the findings of
- 23 fact of the administrative law judge in this case.
- **24** CHAIRMAN MEYER: Is there a second?
- 25 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second.

- 1 (No response.)
- 2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Abstentions?
- 3 (No response.)
- 4 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Motion carries to
- 5 approve the conclusions of law 4 to 0.
- 6 And, finally, we need a motion, if there is
- 7 one, to adopt the administrative law judge's
- 8 recommended order in this matter.
- **9** Is there a motion?
- 10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I would
- 11 so move that we adopt the administrative law judge's
- 12 recommended order in this matter.
- 13 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you, Commissioner
- 14 Chan.
- 15 Is there a second?
- 16 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second.
- MS. FROEDGE: Mr. Chairman, we need a roll
- 18 call vote on the order, please.
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. So each person
- 20 needs to go through individually?
- 21 MS. FROEDGE: Yes.
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. All right. So it's
- 23 been moved and seconded that we adopt the
- 24 administrative law judge's recommended order, and we're
- 25 going to do a roll call vote on this motion.

09:59:40-10:00:26 Page 23 10:01:18-10:02:32 Page 25

- 1 CHAIRMAN MEYER: It's been moved and
- 2 seconded.
- 3 All in favor of approving -- of approving
- 4 the findings of fact and granting the motion say aye.
- 5 (Chorus of ayes.)
- 6 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition?
- 7 (No response.)
- 8 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any abstentions?
- 9 (No response.)
- 10 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Motion carries to
- 11 approve the findings of fact 4 to 0.
- 12 Is there a similar motion to approve the
- 13 conclusions of law in this case?
- 14 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I would
- 15 move that the Commission approve the conclusions of law
- 16 made by the ALJ in this matter.
- 17 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you.
- **18** Is there a second?
- 19 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second.
- 20 CHAIRMAN MEYER: It's been moved and
- 21 seconded that we approve the administrative law judge's
- 22 conclusions of law in this matter.
- All in favor say aye.
- **24** (Chorus of ayes.)
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition?

- 1 Commissioner Chan?
- 2 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I vote aye.
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commission Kimble?
- 4 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Aye.
- 5 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Paton?
- 6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Ave.
- 7 CHAIRMAN MEYER: And Commissioner Meyer,
- 8 myself, I vote aye as well.
- 9 Motion carries 4 to 0.
- 10 I believe that resolves Matter Number V.
- On to Item Number VI: Discussion and
- 12 possible action on legislation affecting the
- 13 Commission, campaign finance, election, and
- 14 administrative law.
- **15** Tom?
- 16 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners,
- 17 we have -- you'll have Mike's report on the status of
- 18 legislation that we're tracking. That's available.
- 19 It's also available on our website and has been.
- There's one -- one piece of legislation I
- 21 want to note and then a piece of legislation I'd like
- 22 to talk about a little more in depth. The one I want
- **24** the city of Tempe and the city of Phoenix activities.
- 25 There is a measure that's being heard today in Senate

to note is related to Commissioner Chan's discussion of

10:02:36-10:04:10 Page 26 10:05:58-10:07:14 Page 28

- 1 jud called House Bill 2153 that would prohibit cities
- 2 from, essentially, doing what Tempe and Phoenix are --
- 3 Tempe has proposed to do and what the city of Phoenix
- 4 is discussing doing.
- There have been questions raised about
- 6 whether or not, even if that bill were to pass, it
- 7 could be applied to Tempe and Phoenix and Tucson, for
- 8 that matter, which are all charter cities. Tucson has
- 9 had its own campaign finance organic charter law for
- 10 close to 40 years unchallenged and un- -- without
- 11 anyone saying otherwise. So it raises a novel issue of
- 12 constitutional law if it does, in fact, advance out of
- 13 the legislature. We haven't taken a position on the
- 14 bill, but it is something that we're tracking.
- 15 The thing I wanted to talk to you about
- 16 more specifically is HCR 2007 which we've talked about
- 17 before. This is a measure that would -- if enacted,
- 18 would be sent to the voters for their approval or veto
- 19 rather than being sent to the governor. As such, you
- 20 know, I've noted before in previous meetings, it
- 21 raises, I think, Voter Protection Act issues because it
- 22 had -- did not receive a three-quarters vote in the
- 23 House and it does amend the Clean Elections Act.
- But putting that to one side, the bill, as 24
- 25 we've talked about, has three principal components.

- 1 against inflation. So the Senate research staff fact
- 2 sheet, what's being presented to the public in the
- 3 summary of this bill, is flat out untrue. It's not
- inflation and it's actually deflationary.
- It has the odd effect in the short-term of
- 6 increasing the amount of money that clean candidates
- can take from individuals by almost a third because
- those levels are low, but over time, it is not
- 9 inflation. And it is a -- it is not a conforming
- change. It is a radical change to the way this program
- operates, and it's not being discussed in a
- straightforward way.
- Likewise, the exemption language that they
- 14 have removed does not -- it's intended, I think it's
- safe to say, to get the Commission under the
- jurisdiction, in some manner, of the Governor's
- Regulatory Review Council, which has been a matter of
- continuing dispute, but it does -- it does not at all
- make clear what the law is going to be because the
- Clean Elections Act has numerous provisions that
- provide for procedures that are not consistent or are
- potentially in conflict with the Arizona Administrative
- Procedures Act rule-making provision.
- So it is -- it is going to create issues,
- 25 not resolve them, and the -- and the legislature is not

10:04:13-10:05:52 Page 27 10:07:17-10:08:44 Page 29

- 1 One, it prohibits participating candidates from making
- 2 expenditures to parties in 501 entities, and that's
- 3 Part 1. Part 2 is it removes the language from the act
- 4 exempting the Commission from the rule-making
- 5 provisions of the Arizona Procedures Act -- the Arizona
- 6 Administrative Procedures Act; and then, third, it
- 7 changes the inflation adjustment that applies to Clean
- 8 Elections candidate spending limits, Clean Election
- 9 candidate contribution limits and your own per diems
- 10 from inflation to \$100.
- 11 And I want to -- this will take a little
- 12 bit of time for me to get through talking about this,
- 13 but those latter two provisions have not been discussed
- 14 by the legislature in a straightforward manner. I will
- 15 just give you an example. Today HCR 2007 is being
- 16 heard in Senate jud -- Senate jud's meeting right now
- 17 as we speak. That bill may be the last bill that gets
- 18 heard there today, but nevertheless, that's where it
- 19 is.
- 20 The fact sheet that the Senate research
- 21 staff prepared for this states that the change in the
- 22 inflationary adjustment from inflation to a flat \$100
- accounts for inflation. That is false. It is not.
- 24 \$100 is not inflation, and a fixed \$100 is, in fact,
- 25 deflationary because \$100 declines in value over time

- 1 discussing that squarely. The reason why the
- 2 legislature is not discussing those two issues squarely
- 3 is because the legislature has been talking about this
- 4 in terms of the issue of party expenditures that were
- 5 made in 2016. We've rehashed this now for two years,
- 6 three years. We passed a rule that tried to address
- it. That rule didn't pass unanimously.
- So, you know, there is a -- obviously,
- 9 reasonable minds can differ about what the appropriate
- way to go about this is, but it's my view and, I think,
- the view of -- and Mike's view that at this point, you
- know, we should take that off the table. There is
- no -- nothing to be gained at this point by -- we have
- 14 opposed the bill in its totality based on the fact that
- we have a rule in place on the party expenditure issue.
- Notwithstanding that rule, I think, for 16
- purposes of this legislative session and in order to
- get the public, the press, the legislators themselves
- to understand what is really being proposed to do to
- Clean Elections, that we essentially say that --
- essentially, go to a neutral position on Section 1 of
- 22 the bill.
- 23 I'm briefing you on this because -- and
- 24 wanted to raise this with you-all because we have a
- 25 rule in place on this, but, you know, I'll tell you

10:08:48-10:10:18 Page 30 | 10:11:36-10:13:04 Page 32

- 1 after that rule passed, you know, we did have a --
- 2 there was -- and not all of you may know this. I had
- 3 the impression many of you did but, you know, the
- 4 speaker of the House put out a press release that said,
- 5 you know, he was upset about the rule choice that was
- 6 made.
- 7 I will tell you that I personally committed
- 8 to the speaker that in the event something came up that
- 9 was -- that warranted it, we could revisit that rule on
- 10 an emergency basis. Others, obviously, don't think
- 11 that's sufficient, but -- and I'm not proposing we
- 12 change the rule for this election cycle, but I do
- 13 propose and intend to make clear that as to Section 1,
- **14** we just -- we don't have an interest in arguing about
- 15 that because Sections 2 and 3 are not being discussed
- 16 properly, not being discussed honestly and do
- 17 tremendous damage to both the independence of the
- **18** Commission and the operation of the program in general.
- 19 So that's where I come down on that. If
- 20 you have -- I don't need a vote on that, per se, but I
- 21 do if you -- if the commissioners have strong
- 22 objections to modifying the way we approach this, I
- 23 would like to hear that because I would -- I obviously
- 24 don't want to get out in front of you, but that is my
- 25 proposal going forward.

- 1 Commissioner Paton made his views on this
- 2 known. So it is clear that reasonable minds can differ
- 3 and reasonable minds do differ on the Commission about
- 4 that particular policy. And so I don't think it gives
- 5 anything away, to be honest with you, in terms of the
- 6 Commission's actions to take that off the table now and
- 7 simply say, look, that's a party issue.
- 8 At the end of the day, if the Democratic
- 9 party or the Republican party wants to make these --
- 10 take expenditures from candidates or 501 people want to
- 11 take expenditures from candidates, that's their issue.
- 12 You know, Sections 2 and 3 are really Commission
- 13 issues. And so that's -- and that's my -- I think you
- 14 are correct in observing the tension there, but
- 15 nevertheless, I just don't think that there's any other
- **16** way to get -- I'll just give you an example.
- 17 The Arizonans -- Americans for Prosperity's
- 18 Arizona Chapter has been touting this bill as no money
- 19 for political parties, and then omits from its, you
- 20 know, updates that it sends to its members and other
- 21 interested parties any mention of Sections 2 or 3. The
- 22 same can be said for -- and, as I said, even the
- 23 research staffs of the legislature are not accurately
- 24 and truthfully describing the impact of Sections 2 and
- **25** 3.

10:10:21-10:11:34 Page 31 | 10:13:07-10:14:32 Page 33

- 1 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
- 2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any comments?
- 3 Commissioner Chan.
- 4 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman and Tom,
- 5 I'm having a little heartburn over going neutral on
- 6 Section 1 of the bill only because I understand what
- 7 you're saying, but -- and perhaps the reason you're
- 8 saying this -- and you can correct me if I'm wrong --
- 9 is because you want to focus on the other two parts
- 10 that are so -- such travesties, but can't we focus on
- 11 those without going neutral on Section 1 if we
- 12 inherently disagree with Section 1? I feel like we're
- 13 sacrificing our policy position a little bit if we go
- 14 neutral on that even though we still will have our
- **15** rule.
- MR. COLLINS: I think that's also been --
- 17 Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan, I think that's -- I
- 18 think that's exactly the question before you, and my
- 19 recommendation is a balance that the -- that whatever
- 20 sacrifice there is with respect to the policy is not
- 20 sacrifice there is with respect to the policy is not
- 21 sufficiently grave enough here because it doesn't22 require us to change the rules. It doesn't require us
- 23 to do anything in the immediate term. What it simply
- 24 says is, look, I mean, that bill -- that rule did not
- 25 pass unanimously in the first place.

- 1 And there is -- so I cannot -- I have not
- 2 been able to think of another way to change the
- 3 dynamics of this conversation. And given that the
- 4 Commission itself was divided on this issue in the
- 5 first place, it's clear that there is -- if a
- 6 reasonable person can reach either conclusion, I just
- 7 think that this is the only way we -- or I should say
- 8 this isn't the only way. This is, in my view, the best
- **9** way to proceed.
- 10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. Thank you, Tom.
- 11 And, Mr. Chairman, Tom, I guess my only
- 12 remaining comment on that would be that I understand
- 13 what you're saying about Sections 2 and 3 again, you
- 14 know, that that specifically deals with the Commission
- 15 and that that's where our real fight is, but it is
- 16 barring -- Section 1 is barring participating
- 17 candidates from deciding where they spend money to buy
- 18 those voter files.
- 19 And I appreciate what you're saying, too,
- 20 about Commissioner Paton's desire -- and, Commissioner
- 21 Paton, I still respect your opinion even though we
- 22 disagree on that, but I still want to point out that
- 23 I -- in listening to the participating candidates who
- 24 came to speak to us about it, I was very moved by their 25 arguments, by how they said it would impact them if we

10:14:37-10:16:08 Page 34 | 10:17:30-10:18:41 Page 36

- 1 prohibited that. And I just fear -- and maybe I'm
- 2 being a little too rigid, but I fear that if we go to
- 3 neutral we're just giving up some of our integrity -- I
- 4 mean, not integrity. I don't want to put it in that
- 5 kind of a good/bad terminology, but some of our
- 6 position on what we really think about this as a
- 7 Commission who has voted on it.
- 8 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Tom, in response to
- 9 that -- and maybe you can help clear up an
- 10 understanding -- a misunderstanding that I may have is
- 11 even under this statute, would participating candidates
- 12 still be allowed to purchase voter files from the
- 13 parties?
- 14 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, yes. I should
- 15 have -- I should have gone over that. Yes. The one
- 16 exception is for the voter file. What they couldn't do
- 17 is some of the -- you know, the hiring of field workers
- 18 and some of the other consulting services that were
- **19** purchased in the 2016 cycle.
- 20 Mr. Chairman, if I may just to -- just to
- 21 talk through this point with Commissioner Chan, you
- 22 know, I think that the other thing to bear in mind is
- 23 that this measure should have passed at the -- at
- 24 the -- passed onto the voters and be -- you know, as an
- 25 enactment of the legislature. And the legislature

- 1 for -- since January, since this bill dropped, to get
- 2 an acknowledgment anywhere.
- If the Senate research staff and the House
- 4 research staff will not acknowledge the actual impact
- 5 of this bill and the public and the press and most
- folks rely on those fact sheets, not the bills, to make
- 7 their decisions, there's no other way for us to change
- 8 the dynamic that I can -- or, I should say -- I keep
- 9 saying no other way -- this is the best way to change
- 10 the dynamic of this conversation that I've been able to
- 11 come up with.
- 12 Ultimately, it's your call. That's why we
- 13 have brought it back to you, but I think that we can be
- 14 clear that we have a rule. We're giving a chance to
- 15 see if that rule works. If that rule doesn't work, we
- 16 obviously would like -- we would review it again and
- 17 see if we need to do something different, but in the
- 18 meantime, you know, the honest to God truth is that
- 19 folks are being misled by the very, quote/unquote,
- 20 nonpartisan folks who are supposed to be telling them
- 21 what's in the legislation that they're voting on.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, if I just
- 23 may follow up with --
- 24 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Sure. Go ahead.
- 25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: And then -- and then

10:16:10-10:17:22 Page 35 | 10:18:42-10:20:04 Page 37

- 1 tells itself that they're not really voting for
- 2 something when it's sent to the voters. If you read
- 3 the constitution, it says that referendums are
- 4 enactments, just in case anyone wants to read the
- 5 constitution out there, but the thing is that the
- 6 voters will still have to decide that and folks will
- 7 still have to -- have to make -- have to make a
- 8 decision about that.
- 9 This is not the final call on it. This is
- 10 a specific question of how do we -- how do -- and won't
- 11 be involved in that once it goes to the ballot. That
- 12 won't be our discussion, and it's going to be up to the
- 13 various parties, the various folks who try to influence
- **14** elections to do that in the event that it goes forward.
- 15 And so for those -- for that reason, I
- 16 think, again, there's a mitigation on the impact of
- 17 this. Again, if it wasn't for the fact that we do have
- 18 a rule and a policy that has been voted on, I would not
- 19 be -- you know, I wouldn't -- I would not be raising 20 it.
- 21 So I think all of your concerns are well
- 22 thought through and well articulated and then the
- 23 things that, you know, Mike and I have talked about,
- 24 too, as we -- as we go forward, but at the end of the
- 25 day, you know, if we -- if we can't -- I have tried now

- 1 I'll turn it over because I'm sure the other
- 2 commissioners, including yourself, probably have some
- 3 comments.
- 4 Tom, I definitely value your opinion, and
- 5 so I want to listen to what my fellow commissioners
- 6 have to say and, depending on what their thoughts are,
- 7 I would be willing to do what you recommend.
- 8 I want to bring up a couple of issues. One
- 9 is that this certainly does not sound like it's a
- 10 single subject. So I think even for referenda there 11 are single-subject rules for what goes to the ballot.
- 12 So that may be an issue that would be decided if this
- 13 does pass and get referred to the ballot by the
- 14 legislature.
- And my second comment is that I'm extremely
- **16** disturbed to hear that what sound like the most -- the
- 17 meatiest policy issues are not being honestly and
- 18 openly discussed at that legislature. This sounds like
- 19 a very, like I said, heavy, dense policy bill and
- 20 regardless of whether you support or oppose Clean
- 21 Elections, to have a conversation that by omission is
- 22 dishonest, I find very disturbing. And, unfortunately,
- 23 I think we're seeing more and more of that in our
- 24 policymakers at all levels of government, it seems,
- 25 these days.

10:20:04-10:21:16 Page 38 10:22:42-10:23:53 Page 40

- And so if anybody is listening over at the
- 2 legislature, I would encourage you to revisit what
- 3 you're -- what you're really talking about with this
- 4 bill and really make sure that you're fully
- 5 understanding the ramifications of what you're sending
- 6 to the -- to the voters, potentially, because all of
- 7 your legislation has -- even a referenda to the voters,
- 8 they all have impacts and affect people deeply.
- And, of course, I personally think that
- 10 this Commission has so much integrity and does
- 11 important work for the people of Arizona and, of
- 12 course, that's why I am very disappointed and disturbed
- 13 to hear what you're telling us about today, Tom. So
- 14 thank you for keeping us informed that way.
- 15 And with that, Mr. Chairman, I'll give the
- 16 floor back to you and the other members.
- 17 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you for your
- 18 comments, Commissioner Chan.
- And, Commissioner Kimble and Commissioner 19
- 20 Paton, I do want to hear from you if you have comments
- 21 on this.
- Before that, though, Tom, I just had a --22
- 23 maybe you can clarify how exactly do we sort of change
- 24 the messaging on this or, by going neutral on the first
- 25 issue, how do -- how do we then, I guess, bring clarity

- 1 cancelled it.
- So lobbying has not really been where we've
- 3 been, but looking at this from a media perspective, I
- mean, my intention would be to go on Horizon and say
- literally let's stop talking about Section 1.
- Section 1, reasonable minds can differ. Reasonable
- commissioners do differ. Sections 2 and 3 are damaging
- the independence of the Commission and fundamentally
- 9 damaging to the overall program and are being presented
- dishonestly.
- And I think that if we do that, we can --11
- 12 we can maybe change the dynamic and get folks to
- understand that if they really, really want to focus on
- party stuff, if that's really what this bill is
- 15 about -- I think that's window dressing, to be honest
- with you. I think that that's the cover to do Sections
- 2 or 3. And if they really want to do party stuff,
- let's do party stuff. You don't need to do Sections 2
- or 3 to accomplish what AFP, the Free Enterprise Club
- and Representative Coleman have represented is their
- 21 principal problem.
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Thank you.
- 23 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman?
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Kimble. 24
- 25 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Yeah, I would just

10:21:21-10:22:40 Page 39 10:23:54-10:25:27 Page 41

- 1 to what this bill is really about? Maybe I'm -- I'm
- 2 not a lobbyist.
- MR. COLLINS: Sure. 3
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: I'm just an old commercial
- 5 litigator, but maybe you could explain a little bit
- 6 about the process.
- MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, that's a good
- 8 question, and I am, unfortunately, a lobbyist.
- There's a couple of ways we can do this.
- 10 Number 1, look, it's going to pass out of the -- out of
- 11 the Senate jud committee. There's just no doubt. It's
- 12 a party -- these things have paused on party lines. So
- 13 it is what it is. That is what it is. I think that --
- 14 I will tell you from a media perspective, I am
- 15 scheduled, unless I hear otherwise, to be on Horizon
- 16 tonight, which is Arizona -- Phoenix PBS's television
- 17 program tonight.
- 18 And if I am on -- I don't know who I'm
- 19 going to be on with. I know that Representative
- 20 Douglas -- Doug Coleman, who is the sponsor of this
- 21 bill, has refused to go on and has refused every --
- 22 every request we've had to meet with him. I guess we
- 23 requested -- six times we made a request to meet with
- 24 him, just to give you an example how the lobbying on
- 25 this has gone. Once he scheduled a meeting and then he

- 1 briefly say that I support what Tom is saying. I think
- 2 that it's not a question so much of totally backing
- 3 away from Section 1. It's more of a strategy that our
- 4 best bet at this point is to focus on 2 and 3, and I
- agree with that from a strategic point.
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioner Paton,
- 7 anything to add?
- COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, I mean, I kind
- **9** of predicted all of this, Tom.
- MR. COLLINS: That's true. That's true. 10
- 11 That's true.
- COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, I think we
- 13 just aggravated a bunch of people, and I don't consider
- 14 myself really super partisan or anything like that, but
- it aggravated me. And so if it aggravates me, people
- that live it and all that, you know what that's done to
- them. So that's ignited this thing that I thought was
- going to happen.
- And I don't like to backtrack. You know, I
- 20 coached. You make a decision. You stick to it
- generally is how I generally did things, but if we can
- 22 keep some of this -- tamp down some of this to where
- then we'd be focused on these other two items, then I 24 think that would probably be a good thing. And you're
- 25 going to take a lot of the ammunition away from the

10:25:32-10:26:57 Page 42 10:28:20-10:29:40 Page 44

- 1 people that are very upset by this because they're
- 2 going to use this. They're going to use this in all
- 3 their advertisements and paint Clean Elections as
- 4 biased, basically.
- 5 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Well, I think we've
- 6 certainly hashed the issue out. I -- Tom, I have no
- 7 problem. I don't think any of the four of us -- if I'm
- 8 misspeaking for any of the commissioners, let me know,
- 9 but I think we support your plan. And I'm not looking
- 10 to this so much as backing down or changing course but
- 11 just shining a light on the other two issues.
- So, Tom, do you need anything further from
- 13 us or any more discussion on that issue? And then
- 14 maybe where do we go from here, I guess, for the next
- 15 meetings?
- 16 MR. COLLINS: Well, I think -- no. I think
- 17 that -- I don't think I need anything further. I think
- 18 that all of your comments are well taken. I think
- 19 that, you know, obviously, I agree with Commissioner
- 20 Paton in terms of his observations of what would
- 21 happen. I think that it's in the transcripts from
- 22 the -- from the rule meetings, and so I'm not in a
- 23 position to dispute that at all.
- 24 And I think that by the next meeting -- I
- 25 do not believe that they will have likely moved this

- 1 true.
- 2 Mary, are you there?
- 3 MS. O'GRADY: I am here.
- 4 MR. COLLINS: Okay.
- 5 Real briefly, the brief overview on this
- 6 is -- and it's up to you-all, obviously, whether or not
- 7 you want to go into executive session, but the
- 8 high-level overview on this is, as you know, we were
- 9 successful at the Arizona Supreme Court. And now Mary
- 10 and I are seeking authorization to take whatever legal
- 11 actions are necessary to collect the fine and obtain
- 12 the report that the Legacy Foundation Action Fund owes
- 13 the Commission.
- 14 So that is what we are asking for. If you
- 15 have specific questions that go into legal issues,
- 16 obviously, we can go into executive session. I think
- 17 you-all may be familiar enough with this that we may
- ${f 18}$ not need that, but we're asking for your authorization
- 19 for us to take whatever legal actions are necessary in20 order to collect the fine and obtain the report that
- 21 the Legacy Foundation owes.
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Thank you, Tom.
- I guess, Commissioners, we do have some
- 24 items here that are confidential attorney-client in our
- 25 packet.

10:27:01-10:28:19 Page 43 | 10:29:41-10:30:43 Page 45

- 1 out of the House -- or the Senate, rather, by the next
- 2 meeting because typically they do the budget before
- 3 they do the referendums and decide what's going to be
- 4 on the ballot; however, it will be positioned, in a
- 5 sense, in the way -- in a way that they can move that
- 6 at any time. So if we're going to -- if we're going to
- 7 go out there and argue and try to make this case on8 what's really going on here, now is the time to do it.
- 9 So I appreciate all of your comments. I
- 10 appreciate Commissioner Chan's concerns, I do, but I
- 11 think that -- I think I have what I needed. So we'll
- 12 report back but, you know, doing it now gives us the
- 13 ability to take the most time we have between the
- 14 committee and the floor to try to make this case about
- 15 what's really going on here.
- 16 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Thank you, Tom.
- So that closes out Agenda Item Number VI.
- 18 We'll move on to Agenda Item Number VII, which is
- **19** discussion and possible action on Legacy Foundation
- 20 Action Fund versus Citizens Clean Elections Commission21 and related matter under review. The Commission may go
- 22 into executive session on this item.
- Tom, I believe we have Mary on the phone or
- 24 she was on the phone earlier?
- MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, I think that's

- 1 Does anyone have any questions that they
- 2 would like to ask counsel which would require us to
- 3 move into executive session, or do you feel informed?
- 4 We can certainly move into executive
- 5 session if anyone wants to, but I don't feel the need
- 6 to.
- 7 (No response.)
- 8 CHAIRMAN MEYER: No? Okay. So I think
- 9 we're good on that.
- 10 Do you need a motion, Tom, a motion
- 11 authorizing counsel to move forward?
- MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, yeah, a
- 13 motion directing counsel to take whatever legal actions
- 14 are necessary to obtain the -- to obtain the fine and
- 15 report from Legacy Foundation Action Fund would be --
- 16 would be welcomed.
- 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I would
- 18 so move.
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Is there a second?
- 20 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second.
- 21 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. We have a motion
- 22 that's been moved and seconded to direct counsel to
- 23 move forward to obtain the fine in this matter.
- MR. COLLINS: And the report.
- **25** CHAIRMAN MEYER: And the report?

10:30:44-10:31:34 Page 46 10:33:02-10:34:24 Page 48

- 1 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Is there -- I'm
- **3** sorry. All in favor say aye.
- 4 (Chorus of ayes.)
- 5 CHAIRMAN MEYER: All opposed?
- 6 (No response.)
- 7 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Abstentions?
- 8 (No response.)
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Motion carries
- **10** 4 to 0.
- 11 All right. Item Number VIII -- thank you,
- **12** Mary.
- 13 Item Number VIII: Discussion and possible
- 14 action on Arizona Advocacy Network, et al., versus
- 15 State of Arizona, et al. Again, we may go into
- 16 executive session here if we need to.
- 17 Tom, you want to give us your thoughts on
- 18 this? And Mary is going to -- is helping with this one
- 19 as well.
- 20 MR. COLLINS: That's right. And --
- 21 Mr. Chairman, that's correct. This is just a brief
- 22 update. There was the Rule 16 conference. I think
- 23 that the scheduling report was filed. I'm not sure.
- 24 Mary, is that right?
- MS. O'GRADY: Yes, it should have been

- 1 protection issues with respect to how 501(c)(4)s that
- 2 are similarly situated where disparately treated under
- 3 the act, and we looked at the failure to comply with
- 4 Article 7, Section 16, which it requires that there
- 5 be -- under the Arizona Constitution, that there be --
- 6 that political committees disclose their contributions
- 7 and expenditures and there be general publicity for
- 8 that
- **9** Those are things we need guidance on
- 10 whether we -- whether we -- you know, whether we change
- 11 or not or any of those things. Regardless of what the
- 12 rules are, as an agency those are things we need
- 13 guidance on. So we think it's appropriate to get them
- **14** all briefed so that we can get a judicial decision on
- 15 all of the issues because that gives us -- gives us the
- 16 guidance we need.
- 17 I will also say that we're going to -- one
- 18 of the other odd issues is that the -- and just for the
- 19 record, so everybody knows, the Attorney General's
- 20 Office is not representing the Secretary of Sate and
- 21 the, quote/unquote, State in this case. So Mr. LaRue
- 22 and Ms. Karlson are not involved in this matter, but in
- 23 their initial disclosures, the Secretary of State takes
- 24 the position that Article 7, Section 16, which says
- 25 that at its first session the legislature shall pass a

10:31:40-10:33:01 Page 47 10:34:27-10:35:53 Page 49

- 1 filed.
- MR. COLLINS: And so under the -- the only
- 3 thing I would think that you-all should know is so
- 4 there's a briefing schedule that takes summary judgment
- 5 briefing will be going on. I think the final replies
- 6 on summary judgment there under the schedule --
- 7 proposed schedule is the beginning of July.
- 8 And then the other issue to be aware of is
- 9 that the Secretary of State and the, quote/unquote,
- 10 state and the Governor's Regulatory Review Council have
- 11 taken the position that the briefing should only be
- 12 about the Voter Protection Act and only after the Voter
- 13 Protection Act is resolved should there be briefing on
- 14 the equal protection challenges and the Article 7,
- 15 Section 16 challenge.
- The plaintiffs take the position that it's
- 17 our case and we should be able to do whatever we want.
- 18 We have taken the position that is consistent with the
- 19 plaintiff's position in this case for one reason, which
- 20 I think is the only valid reason first -- the only --
- 21 what a state agency should take a position on which is
- 22 guidance.
- When we did our rules, which are part of
- 24 this lawsuit, we based our decisions on not exclusively
- 25 the Voter Protection Act. We looked at equal

- 1 law that basically requires disclosure of expenditures
- 2 and contributions and publicity of them is essentially
- 3 a dead letter. The legislature can pass whatever it
- 4 wants and call it a political committee, and there is
- 5 no meaning in that provision other than a general
- 6 direction
- 7 If you -- there's no reported judicial
- 8 opinion on this -- on that yet. That has not been the
- 9 position that we've taken in our rule-making process
- 10 and -- and those rules all passed, you know,
- 11 unanimously, I think. I may be wrong about that, but
- 12 I'm pretty sure they did.
- In any event, we don't think that Article
- 14 7, Section 16 is a dead letter. We think it's a
- 15 substantive constitutional provision that if the folks
- 16 who put together the Arizona Constitution did require
- 17 there to be disclosure, then the question is whether or
- 18 not having so restricted the definition of political
- 19 committee as SB1516 did, if that falls below the
- 20 threshold that the framers of the Arizona constitution
- 21 required.
- And, you know, from an originalist
- 23 perspective, if you look at the language and then you
- 24 look at the fact -- at what the legislature passed at
- 25 its very first session of the 1912 Act on disclosure

10:35:57-10:37:11 Page 50 10:38:41-10:40:06 Page 52

- 1 and you look at what's in 1516, I think a voter in 1912
- 2 would be very surprised with what they see in Senate
- 3 Bill 1516 compared to what they see -- what they saw in
- 4 1912 the legislature do.
- So that's -- that's all -- all the
- 6 information I'm sharing with you is on file and public,
- 7 and I just wanted -- I thought that sort of fills out,
- 8 I think, every status of where we are.
- I don't know if Mary has anything she wants
- 10 to add.
- MS. O'GRADY: No, nothing to add. I'm just 11
- 12 waiting for the schedule to be set in the case.
- 13 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Any questions from
- **14** any commissioners?
- 15 (No response.)
- CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. Thank you, Mary. 16
- 17 Thank you, Tom.
- Item Number IX: Discussion and possible
- 19 action on Interagency Service Agreement with the
- 20 Arizona Attorney General's Office.
- 21 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Mr. Chairman, so as you
- 22 know, the elections subsection, I guess, you might call
- 23 it, of the Attorney General's Office changed
- 24 divisions -- I don't know -- six months ago or
- 25 something like that. And we did an Interagency Service

- 1 and Kara, and their support staff to be able to do
- 2 their jobs. And I think it's something we've done for,
- 3 I think, the entire time the Commission has been in
- 4 existence, and I think we should continue to do it.
- I have a couple of notes and I'll just --
- 6 just to summarize real quickly, in the past we have had
- written into the agreement that there be consultation
- with -- with us about any changes in personnel.
- 9 That's, in part, because, you know, we actually -- we
- like our attorneys and we truly -- we'd like to know if
- whoever is coming on, we'd like to also like them.
- My understanding is that another difference
- between SGO and agency counsel is agency counsel
- actually as part of their interview process in the
- unlikely and hopefully not happening event that one of
- our attorneys were to leave, that they actually take
- the interviewees to the clients and have them meet
- which is, again, I think a better way of doing things.
- And interesting, but I do still want that in the -- in
- the written agreement.
- 21 I also -- we previously had a provision
- that required the AG to give us notice of relevant AG
- opinions. They do publish those requests online now,
- but since we're not part -- since we're not with SGO
- anymore, we don't -- you know, we're just not

10:37:18-10:38:35 Page 51 10:40:07-10:41:47 Page 53

- 1 Agreement for the last six months of last calendar year
- 2 with that division, and then what we are trying to do
- 3 is get on track to do a Calendar Year 2018 Interagency
- 4 Service Agreement.
- What the new division that they're in,
- 6 which I think is called the agency counsel or state
- 7 agency -- I'm not sure what the division is called.
- 8 You have to tell me. Whatever the division that
- 9 they're in is now called --
- MS. KARLSON: Agency counsel. 10
- 11 MR. COLLINS: -- agency counsel, the way
- 12 that they proceed with dealing with ISAs is a little
- 13 different with how SGO did, but actually I think in a
- 14 beneficial way. What they would like to do is have an
- 15 agreement on the amount of financial commitment and
- 16 then we can talk about the other -- other issues that
- 17 might come up.
- And so I do recommend that we -- the 18
- 19 approval to enter into an ISA at the amount of \$172,000
- 20 as detailed in the memo and the exhibit which is the
- 21 budget -- which comes from the AG accounting
- 22 department. I think that, as I articulated in the
- 23 memo, this benefits the Commission in a number of ways.
- 24 It helps with retention. It ensures that there's
- 25 resources for the election attorneys that we have, Joe

- 1 necessarily going to have that info. So it just would
- 2 be helpful to maintain that notice.
- And then, finally, I intended to ask and I
- 4 haven't had a chance to discuss with the attorneys with
- whom Kara and Joe work, but, you know, in the event
- 6 that there's -- there's a lot of litigation going on.
- Joe and Kara are in demand, to say the least. And so I
- think we'd like to have a plan to -- I'd like to
- 9 have -- I know I'd like to have -- I shouldn't say
- "we." By "we" I mean the Clean Elections staff think
- 11 there ought to be a plan to deal with if there's
- 12 situations where they're unavailable.
- There is another division in the AG's
- 14 office that does campaign finance enforcement matters
- which I think, in the first instance, it at least has
- some -- it has -- you know, works on similar issues,
- has an understanding of the way that campaign finance
- 18 laws and enforcement works. So it seems like that
- 19 would be the logical place for overflow work to go.
- 20 So those are the three issues that I would
- 21 like to see in the ISA. If any of those become issues
- 22 or become -- are serious problems or we haven't --
- 23 aren't able to work out some way of dealing with them,
- 24 you know, we'll return back to you, obviously, but the 25 principal goal here is just to give me authorization to

10:41:50-10:42:57 Pa	ge 54 10	:43:49-10:43:53 Page 56
1 commit to the expenditure and then and then we'll	1	(No response.)
2 hash out the details going forward.		
3 So in the event that this all works out, I	3	3 (No response.)
4 wouldn't bring the ISA back for further approval. I	4	CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries. We are
5 would go forward and sign it myself, just so you		adjourned.
6 understand that. So as I said in the memo, I am		•
7 requesting approval to enter into the ISA for \$172,000	, -	
8 for the calendar year.	8	
9 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commissioners, do we have	e g)
10 a motion?	10	
11 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman?	11	L
12 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Commission Kimble.	12	2
13 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: I move that we	13	3
14 authorize Tom to enter into the ISA with the Attorney	14	<u>L</u>
15 General's Office with the additional stipulations that	15	5
16 the director has enumerated today.	16	5
17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would second that	17	
18 motion.	18	3
19 CHAIRMAN MEYER: And just to clarify, that	19	
20 motion is for \$172,000?	20	
21 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Yes, Mr. Chairman.	21	
22 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Okay. We've had a motion		
23 and a second to authorize Mr. Collins to enter into an	23	
24 ISA for \$172,000 with the Attorney General's Office.25 All in favor say aye.	24	
25 All ill lavol say aye.	2:	
10:42:58-10:43:49 Pa	ge 55	Page 57
	ge 55	_
1 (Chorus of ayes.)	_	STATE OF ARIZONA)
1 (Chorus of ayes.)	1	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
1 (Chorus of ayes.)2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition?	3	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
 1 (Chorus of ayes.) 2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? 3 (No response.) 	3 4	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. 	3 4	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taken 		STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to 		STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the 		STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a 	1 8 9	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. 	1 8 9 10	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? 	1 8 9 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, 	1 8 9 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Item Number XI: Adjournment. 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Item Number XI: Adjournment. Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA) COUNTY OF MARICOPA) BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Item Number XI: Adjournment. Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. CHAIRMAN MEYER: There's a motion. 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. Is there a second? 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Item Number XI: Adjournment. Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. CHAIRMAN MEYER: There's a motion. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second. 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. CHAIRMAN MEYER: There's a motion. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second. CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. It's been moved and seconded. All in favor of adjourning? 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
1 (Chorus of ayes.) 2 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? 3 (No response.) 4 CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. 5 And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: 6 Public comment. This is the time for consideration of 7 comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker 8 as a result of public comment will be limited to 9 directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the 10 matter for further consideration and decision at a 11 later date or responding to criticism. 12 Any public comment? 13 (No response.) 14 CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, 15 Item Number XI: Adjournment. 16 Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. 18 CHAIRMAN MEYER: There's a motion. 19 Is there a second? 20 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second. 21 CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. It's been 22 moved and seconded. 23 All in favor of adjourning? 24 (Chorus of ayes.)	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018.
 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Any opposition? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: Motion carries 4-0. And now we are at Agenda Item Number X: Public comment. This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions of the public. Action taker as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism. Any public comment? (No response.) CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. Next step, Item Number XI: Adjournment. Is there a motion to adjourn the meeting? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Motion to adjourn. CHAIRMAN MEYER: There's a motion. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Second. CHAIRMAN MEYER: All right. It's been moved and seconded. All in favor of adjourning? 	1	STATE OF ARIZONA COUNTY OF MARICOPA BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona, and by virtue thereof authorized to administer an oath; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 23rd day of March, 2018. LILIA MONARREZ, RPR, CR #50699

	24:7,11,24;25:14;27:6;	appear (1) 17:8		bunch (1) 41:13
ф	28:22	applied (1) 26:7	n.	business (1) 19:9
\$			В	
	administratively (1)	applies (1) 27:7		buy (1) 33:17
\$100 (5) 27:10,22,24,	4:12	apply (1) 8:1	back (8) 14:4,5;18:12;	
24,25	admirable (2) 11:22;	appreciate (5) 5:9;	36:13;38:16;43:12;	C
\$172,000 (4) 51:19;	14:24	14:14;33:19;43:9,10	53:24;54:4	
54:7,20,24	adopt (3) 24:7,11,23	appreciated (2) 14:14,	backing (2) 41:2;42:10	calendar (3) 51:1,3;
\$28.80 (3) 19:9,14,17	ads (1) 8:25	21	backtrack (1) 41:19	54:8
\$52,290.60 (1) 20:2	advance (1) 26:12	appreciation (1) 9:15	balance (1) 31:19	call (10) 3:4,4;17:18;
\$86.40 (2) 19:6,21	advertisements (1) 42:3	appreciative (2) 11:20;	ball (1) 9:4	18:5;24:18,25;35:9;
	advice (1) 17:1	14:22	ballot (5) 5:18;35:11;	36:12;49:4;50:22
\mathbf{A}	Advisory (1) 5:20	approach (1) 30:22	37:11,13;43:4	called (4) 26:1;51:6,7,9
	Advocacy (2) 8:7;46:14	appropriate (2) 29:9;	barring (2) 33:16,16	came (3) 10:25;30:8;
abilities (1) 11:9	affairs (1) 9:16	48:13	based (3) 18:1;29:14;	33:24
ability (1) 43:13	affect (2) 7:25;38:8	approval (4) 26:18;	47:24	campaign (7) 5:13,17;
able (8) 12:7;13:2,25;	affecting (1) 25:12	51:19;54:4,7	basically (5) 10:4;19:4;	7:18;25:13;26:9;53:14,
33:2;36:10;47:17;52:1;	affirm (1) 19:23	approve (10) 3:11,12,	20:4;42:4;49:1	17
53:23	affirmed (1) 20:4	14;22:18,22;23:11,12,	basis (1) 30:10	campaign-related (1)
	AFP (1) 40:19	15,21;24:5		19:15
Abstentions (5) 4:1;	AG (3) 51:21;52:22,22	approving (3) 3:20;	bear (1) 34:22	can (28) 4:20;14:1,6;
23:8;24:2;46:7;56:2	again (8) 19:1;20:5;	23:3,3	Becker (1) 14:3	18:16;20:19;21:8,17;
accept (5) 18:20;19:3;	33:13;35:16,17;36:16;	April (1) 7:13	become (2) 53:21,22	28:7;29:9;31:8;32:2,
20:6,14;21:7	46:15;52:18	area (1) 12:25	becomes (1) 20:22	22;33:6;34:9;36:8,13;
accepted (1) 10:20		argue (1) 43:7	begin (1) 5:16	38:23;39:9;40:6,11,12;
access (1) 6:11	against (3) 19:24;20:4; 28:1	arguing (1) 30:14	beginning (1) 47:7	41:21;43:5;44:16;45:4;
accomplish (1) 40:19			behalf's (1) 17:5	
accounting (2) 11:1;	aged (1) 6:18	arguments (1) 33:25	below (1) 49:19	48:14;49:3;51:16
51:21	agency (9) 15:23;	Arizona (18) 5:20,21;	beneficial (1) 51:14	Canal (1) 10:17
accounts (1) 27:23	47:21;48:12;51:6,7,10,	8:7;9:18;18:18;27:5,5;	benefit (3) 6:9;7:3;	cancelled (1) 40:1
accuracy (1) 11:7	11;52:13,13	28:22;32:18;38:11;	11:23	candidate (7) 7:19,22,
accurately (1) 32:23	Agenda (4) 9:15;43:17,	39:16;44:9;46:14,15;	benefits (1) 51:23	23;8:2,5;27:8,9
acknowledge (1) 36:4	18;55:5	48:5;49:16,20;50:20	best (6) 11:14;15:4;	candidates (8) 8:1;
acknowledgment (1)	aggravated (2) 41:13,	Arizonans (1) 32:17	17:6;33:8;36:9;41:4	27:1;28:6;32:10,11;
36:2	15	Article (4) 47:14;48:4,	bet (1) 41:4	33:17,23;34:11
act (14) 18:13;19:16;	aggravates (1) 41:15	24;49:13	better (3) 6:10;12:1;	cards (1) 19:9
26:21,23;27:3,5,6;	ago (5) 4:11;5:12;7:19;	articulated (2) 35:22;	52:18	carries (7) 4:3;23:10;
28:20,23;47:12,13,25;	20:3;50:24	51:22	biased (1) 42:4	24:4;25:9;46:9;55:4;
48:3;49:25	agree (2) 41:5;42:19	assistance (1) 12:19	big (2) 13:21,24	56:4
action (11) 3:8;4:4;	agreed (1) 19:4	astounding (1) 13:6	Bill (21) 8:3;26:1,6,14,	case (11) 22:2,19,23;
16:18;25:12;43:19,20;	Agreement (6) 50:19;	attorney (13) 7:16;17:1;	24;27:17,17;28:3;	23:13;35:4;43:7,14;
44:12;45:15;46:14;	51:1,4,15;52:7,20	18:15,25;19:1,2,3;	29:14,22;31:6,24;	47:17,19;48:21;50:12
50:19;55:7	AG's (1) 53:13	20:5;48:19;50:20,23;	32:18;36:1,5;37:19;	Caucus (1) 8:7
actions (6) 12:22;	ahead (2) 16:20;36:24	54:14,24	38:4;39:1,21;40:14;	certain (3) 4:12;17:20,
18:24;32:6;44:11,19;	al (2) 46:14,15	attorney-client (1) 44:24	50:3	21
45:13	Alec (2) 6:3,5	attorneys (4) 51:25;	bills (1) 36:6	certainly (4) 12:6;37:9;
activities (1) 25:24	ALJ (2) 16:25;23:16	52:10,16;53:4	binding (2) 20:14,15	42:6;45:4
actual (1) 36:4	allowable (1) 19:12	auditor (1) 19:10	bit (4) 13:16;27:12;	CHAIRMAN (120) 3:3,
actually (7) 5:24;19:12;	allowed (2) 19:15;	auditors (1) 19:11	31:13;39:5	14,18,24;4:1,3,8,25;
28:4;51:13;52:9,14,16	34:12	authorization (3) 44:10,	bitter (1) 16:3	5:1,2;8:14,15,16;9:9,
add (4) 15:7;41:7;	almost (1) 28:7	18;53:25	both (3) 15:2;18:2;	14;10:1,16;12:14,15;
50:10,11	although (1) 17:8	authorize (3) 5:16;	30:17	13:11,12;14:9,16;15:8,
addition (1) 13:3	always (5) 8:21;10:11;	54:14,23	brief (3) 18:18;44:5;	12;16:12,13,16,21;
additional (1) 54:15	14:21;15:1;20:20	authorized (1) 4:11	46:21	17:10,12,14;20:9,11,
address (2) 18:16;29:6	amend (1) 26:23	authorizing (1) 45:11	briefed (1) 48:14	12,18,25;21:3,4,5,12,
	Americans (1) 32:17	available (2) 25:18,19		15,17,20,21;22:3,10,
adjourn (2) 55:16,17 adjourned (1) 56:5	ammunition (1) 41:25	award (1) 16:22	briefing (7) 5:20,21; 29:23;47:4,5,11,13	15,17,21,24;23:1,6,8,
	amount (11) 13:14;	aware (1) 47:8		10,14,17,20,25;24:2,4,
adjourning (1) 55:23	19:9,22;20:2,16,17,20,	away (3) 32:5;41:3,25	briefly (3) 12:17;41:1;	10,13,17,19,22;25:3,5,
Adjournment (1) 55:15	23;28:6;51:15,19	awe (2) 10:11;12:19	44:5	7,16;31:1,2,4,17;33:11;
adjudicatory (1) 17:3 adjustment (2) 27:7,22	Ann (1) 21:12	aye (9) 3:22;23:4,23;	bring (3) 37:8;38:25;	34:8,14,20;36:22,24;
adjustment (2) 77:177	Anne (1) 21:12	25:2,4,6,8;46:3;54:25	54:4	38:15,17;39:4,7;40:22,
			broken (1) 8:22	JU. 12,11,27.4,1,4U.44,
administrative (21) 4:6,				23 24.41.6.42.5.43.16
administrative (21) 4:6, 19,22;16:18,23;17:15;	anymore (1) 52:25	ayes (6) 3:23;23:5,24;	brought (1) 36:13	
administrative (21) 4:6,				23,24;41:6;42:5;43:16, 25;44:22;45:8,12,17, 19,21,25;46:2,5,7,9,21;

50:13,16,21;54:9,11, 12,19,21,22;55:2,4,14, 18,21,25;56:2,4 challenge (2) 13:8; 47:15 **challenged (1)** 15:18 **challenges (1)** 47:14 **CHAN (32)** 3:12;4:25; 5:1,2,5;8:14,15,16; 9:10:13:11,12,13; 14:10;22:8,21;23:14; 24:10,14;25:1,2;31:1,3, 4,17;33:10;34:21; 36:22,25;38:18;45:17; 54:17;55:17 **chance (3)** 6:3;36:14; 53:4 **change (11)** 27:21; 28:10,10;30:12;31:22; 33:2;36:7,9;38:23; 40:12;48:10 **changed (1)** 50:23 changes (3) 21:25; 27:7;52:8 changing (1) 42:10 Chan's (2) 25:23;43:10 **Chapter (1)** 32:18 **character (1)** 11:9 **charter (2)** 26:8,9 chief (1) 11:19 **choice (1)** 30:5 Chorus (6) 3:23;23:5, 24;46:4;55:1,24 circumstances (1) 4:13 citation (1) 7:24 cities (3) 8:19;26:1,8 Citizens (3) 3:5;9:2; 43:20 city (9) 5:13,15,15;8:17, 17;9:7;25:24,24;26:3 Civil (4) 5:20;19:18,21; 20:2 claims (1) 8:24 **clarify (2)** 38:23;54:19 clarity (1) 38:25 Clean (14) 3:5;7:19; 8:1;19:16;26:23;27:7, 8;28:6,20;29:20;37:20; 42:3;43:20;53:10 clear (6) 28:19;30:13; 32:2;33:5;34:9;36:14 clients (1) 52:17 close (2) 4:12;26:10 closes (1) 43:17 **closure (3)** 4:6,16;5:3 closures (2) 4:19,23 Club (1) 40:19 coached (1) 41:20 Coleman (2) 39:20; 40:20 collect (2) 44:11,20 **COLLINS (23)** 4:8;5:4, 6;9:25;15:6;16:21;

25:16;31:16;34:14; 39:3,7;41:10;42:16; 43:25;44:4;45:12,24; 46:1,20;47:2;50:21; 51:11:54:23 **combined (1)** 11:23 coming (2) 12:13;52:11 **comment (5)** 33:12; 37:15;55:6,8,12 comments (12) 3:10; 9:11,24;14:12;21:13; 31:2;37:3;38:18,20; 42:18;43:9;55:7 commercial (1) 39:4 **Commission (47)** 3:5,8; 4:11;5:19;6:1;8:10; 9:17;10:21,25;11:1,2, 13;12:10;13:9;14:19; 15:2,17;16:5,15;18:12, 12,20,23;19:23;20:6; 21:16,22,23;23:15; 25:3,13;27:4;28:15; 30:18;32:3,12;33:4,14; 34:7;38:10;40:8;43:20, 21;44:13;51:23;52:3; 54:12 **COMMISSIONER (80)** 3:12,17;4:19,25;5:1,2, 5;6:25;7:10;8:14,15, 16;9;9;10:9,11,12,12; 12:14,15,16;13:11,12, 13,14;14:9,11,13; 16:13;20:11,12,13,18, 24;22:7,8,9,21,25; 23:14,19;24:10,13,16; 25:1,2,4,5,6,7,23;31:1, 3,4,17;32:1;33:10,20, 20;34:21;36:22,25; 38:18,19,19;40:23,24, 25;41:6,8,12;42:19; 43:10;45:17,20;54:11, 13,17,21;55:17,20 Commissioners (18) 4:9;10:9;14:17;15:12, 14;16:21;17:14;21:1; 22:5;25:16;30:21;37:2, 5;40:7;42:8;44:23; 50:14;54:9 **Commission's (2)** 5:24; 32:6 **commit (1)** 54:1 **commitment (1)** 51:15 **committed (2)** 16:7; 30:7 **Committee (5)** 5:20; 39:11;43:14;49:4,19

committees (1) 48:6

compelling (1) 17:21

complaints (3) 4:12,14,

complainant (1) 5:4

complaint (1) 4:20

community (1) 7:7

compared (1) 50:3

15 completes (1) 8:13 **compliance (1)** 9:16 comply (1) 48:3**components (1)** 26:25 concerns (2) 35:21; 43:10 conciliations (1) 12:3 **concluded (1)** 56:7 **conclusion (1)** 33:6 conclusions (9) 17:18, 21,25;18:4;22:14; 23:13,15,22;24:5 **conference (1)** 46:22 confidential (1) 44:24 conflict (1) 28:22 **conforming (1)** 28:9 congeniality (1) 11:24 congratulations (2) 9:19;12:11 consider (1) 41:13 consideration (2) 55:6, **consistent (2)** 28:21; 47:18 constant (1) 11:10 **constitution (5)** 35:3,5; 48:5;49:16,20 constitutional (2) 26:12; 49:15 consultation (1) 52:7 consulting (1) 34:18 **contacted (1)** 17:7 content (1) 6:11 continue (1) 52:4 continues (1) 11:13 **continuing (1)** 28:18 contribution (2) 8:4; 27:9 contributions (2) 48:6; 49:2 conversation (3) 33:3; 36:10;37:21 **council (3)** 5:15;28:17; 47:10 counsel (10) 18:14; 45:2,11,13,22;51:6,10, 11;52:13,13 couple (4) 7:18;37:8; 39:9;52:5 course (3) 38:9,12; 42:10 **court (3)** 18:7,8;44:9 courts (2) 17:17;18:10 cover (1) 40:16 coworkers (1) 15:20 create (1) 28:24 criticism (1) 55:11 crucial (1) 12:7 cruise (1) 10:17 curve (1) 14:18

D dais (1) 19:2 damage (1) 30:17 damaging (2) 40:7,9 Daniel (2) 11:18;15:15 dark (2) 8:20;9:1 date (2) 20:1;55:11 day (2) 32:8;35:25 days (3) 18:19;19:25; 37:25 dead (2) 49:3,14 deal (1) 53:11 dealing (2) 51:12;53:23 deals (1) 33:14 debate (1) 6:22 debates (2) 6:25;7:4 decide (2) 35:6;43:3 decided (1) 37:12 deciding (1) 33:17 decision (9) 4:17;17:3; 20:1;21:24;22:19;35:8; 41:20;48:14;55:10 **decisions (2)** 36:7; 47:24 declined (1) 4:17 declines (1) 27:25 deeply (1) 38:8 definitely (2) 15:18; 37:4 **definition (2)** 8:3;49:18 deflationary (2) 27:25; 28:4 demand (1) 53:7 **Democratic (2)** 8:7;32:8 demonstrated (1) 19:13 demonstration (1) 19:14 dense (1) 37:19 **department (1)** 51:22 **depending (1)** 37:6 depth (1) 25:22 deputy (2) 11:18,19 describing (1) 32:24 desire (2) 11:3;33:20 detail (1) 13:2 detailed (1) 51:20 details (1) 54:2 diems (1) 27:9 differ (5) 29:9;32:2,3; 40:6.7 difference (1) 52:12 different (4) 17:2;18:6; 36:17:51:13 direct (2) 4:20;45:22 directing (2) 45:13;55:9 **direction (1)** 49:6 director (5) 4:11;9:12;

10:3;11:18;54:16

Director's (1) 4:5

33:22

disagree (2) 31:12;

disappointed (1) 38:12 **disclose (1)** 48:6 **disclosure (4)** 5:14; 49:1.17.25 **disclosures (1)** 48:23 discuss (1) 53:4 **discussed (6)** 13:4; 27:13;28:11;30:15,16; 37:18 discussing (4) 12:23; 26:4;29:1,2 **Discussion (10)** 3:8; 4:4;16:17;25:11,23; 35:12;42:13;43:19; 46:13;50:18 dishonest (1) 37:22 **dishonestly (1)** 40:10 disparately (1) 48:2 dispute (2) 28:18;42:23 **District (1)** 7:12 districts (2) 6:24,24 disturbed (2) 37:16; 38:12 **disturbing (1)** 37:22 divided (1) 33:4 division (6) 17:2;51:2,5, 7,8;53:13 divisions (1) 50:24 done (10) 4:14,23;11:2, 4:13:23:14:2,8:18:16: 41:16;52:2 doubt (1) 39:11 **Doug (1)** 39:20 **Douglas (1)** 39:20 down (3) 30:19;41:22; 42:10 dramatically (1) 7:6 dressing (1) 40:15 dropped (2) 9:4;36:1 **Ducey (1)** 11:19 **During (3)** 10:21;14:25; 19:7 **dynamic (3)** 36:8,10; 40:12 **dynamics (1)** 33:3

\mathbf{E}

earlier (1) 43:24 easier (1) 6:11 echo (1) 14:16 **education (1)** 5:24 effect (1) 28:5 **effective (1)** 19:25 either (2) 18:20;33:6 **election (6)** 5:15;7:13; 25:13;27:8;30:12; 51:25

Elections (14) 3:5;8:21, 24;19:16;26:23;27:8; 28:20;29:20;35:14; 37:21;42:3;43:20; 50:22;53:10

cycle (2) 30:12;34:19

40:13;41:4

Citizens Clean Elections
else (2) 12:10;20:10 email (2) 7:16;10:14 emailed (1) 10:8 emergency (1) 30:10 enacted (1) 26:17 enactment (1) 34:25 enactments (1) 35:4 encourage (1) 38:2 encyclopedic (1) 12:20 end (2) 32:8;35:24 enforcement (3) 12:22; 53:14,18 enjoyed (3) 15:16,19,
enough (2) 31:21; 44:17 ensures (1) 51:24 enter (4) 51:19;54:7,14, 23 entered (1) 16:23 Enterprise (1) 40:19
entire (3) 12:4;21:23; 52:3 entities (1) 27:2 enumerated (1) 54:16 environment (1) 15:25 equal (2) 47:14,25
equally (2) 14:22,22 especially (1) 13:20 essentially (4) 26:2; 29:20,21;49:2 et (2) 46:14,15 even (10) 7:3,5,5;26:6; 31:14;32:22;33:21;
34:11;37:10;38:7 event (7) 4:18;30:8; 35:14;49:13;52:15; 53:5;54:3 everybody (3) 8:10; 10:10;48:19 everyone (3) 16:6;22:1;
56:6 evidence (2) 17:20; 18:1 evidentiary (1) 19:7 exactly (3) 11:4;31:18; 38:23
as:23 example (3) 27:15; 32:16;39:24 excel (1) 11:11 exception (1) 34:16 excited (2) 9:21;10:19 exclusively (1) 47:24 Executive (10) 4:5,11; 9:11;10:3;43:22;44:7, 16;45:3,4;46:16 exempting (1) 27:4 exemption (1) 28:13 exhibit (1) 51:20 existence (1) 52:4 expenditure (5) 8:2,3,4; 29:15;54:1 expenditures (7) 7:22;

27:2;29:4;32:10,11; 48:7:49:1 **expenses (1)** 19:15 **expertise (1)** 12:25 **explain (1)** 39:5 **expressed (1)** 11:3 **extremely (1)** 37:15

F

fabulous (2) 13:18; 15:21 fact (18) 17:18,24;18:1, 4;20:22;22:1,14,23; 23:4,11;26:12;27:20, 24;28:1;29:14;35:17; 36:6;49:24 facts (1) 22:19 failure (1) 48:3 falls (1) 49:19 false (1) 27:23 familiar (1) 44:17 fantastic (1) 15:23 far (1) 6:5 favor (7) 3:20,20;23:3, 23;46:3;54:25;55:23 fear (2) 34:1,2 **February (3)** 3:9,21; 17:16 feel (4) 8:18;31:12; 45:3.5 **fellow (2)** 14:17;37:5 few (1) 20:3 field (1) 34:17 fight (1) 33:15 file (2) 34:16;50:6 filed (2) 46:23;47:1 files (2) 33:18;34:12 **fill (3)** 13:24;14:1;16:15 fills (1) 50:7 final (3) 20:1;35:9;47:5 finally (2) 24:6;53:3 finance (7) 5:13,17; 7:18;25:13;26:9;53:14, 17 financial (2) 9:16;51:15 find (2) 11:8;37:22 finding (1) 22:18 findings (10) 17:18,24; 18:1,4;19:24;21:25; 22:13,22;23:4,11 fine (4) 44:11,20;45:14, 23 first (8) 22:18;31:25; 33:5;38:24;47:20; 48:25;49:25;53:15 fixed (1) 27:24 flat (2) 27:22;28:3 Flinn (2) 10:21;11:25 floor (3) 9:23;38:16; 43:14

focused (1) 41:23 folks (9) 7:4,8;35:6,13; 36:6,19,20;40:12; 49:15 follow (1) 36:23 former (2) 10:9,16 forward (7) 30:25; 35:14,24;45:11,23; 54:2,5 found (2) 13:18;17:20 Foundation (6) 10:21; 11:25;43:19;44:12,21; 45:15 four (1) 42:7 framers (1) 49:20 **Francisco (1)** 10:6 Free (1) 40:19 friend (1) 10:23 FROEDGE (11) 21:10, 11,12,13,15,19,21; 22:12,16;24:17,21 front (1) 30:24 full (1) 20:1 fully (2) 19:5;38:4 Fund (3) 43:20;44:12; 45:15 fundamentally (1) 40:8 further (4) 42:12,17; 54:4;55:10 future (1) 11:25

G

general (3) 30:18;48:7;

gained (1) 29:13

49:5 generally (2) 41:21,21 General's (7) 17:2; 18:15:48:19:50:20.23: 54:15,24 gets (2) 7:8;27:17 **Gina (4)** 5:19;6:4;7:11; 15:8 given (1) 33:3 gives (4) 32:4;43:12; 48:15,15 giving (2) 34:3;36:14 goal (1) 53:25 **God (1)** 36:18 goes (3) 35:11,14; 37:11 **Good (7)** 3:3,4;10:5; 15:22;39:7;41:24;45:9 good/bad (1) 34:5 **government (1)** 37:24 Governor (3) 11:19; 16:14;26:19 Governor's (2) 28:16; 47:10 granting (1) 23:4 grateful (1) 16:8

great (4) 6:21;10:22; 11:12.23 grow (1) 11:14 grown (1) 15:17 guess (11) 13:13;17:9, 25;18:23;22:17;33:11; 38:25;39:22;42:14; 44:23;50:22 guidance (5) 12:19; 47:22;48:9,13,16 guidebook (1) 7:20 qutted (1) 12:5

Н

half (1) 4:10 hands (1) 20:17 happen (4) 5:7;17:23; 41:18;42:21 happened (1) 5:11 happening (1) 52:15 happy (2) 9:20;13:6 hard (1) 6:4 hash (1) 54:2 hashed (1) 42:6 **HCR (2)** 26:16;27:15 hear (6) 10:19;30:23; 37:16;38:13,20;39:15 heard (4) 13:17;25:25; 27:16,18 hearing (2) 18:2;19:7 heartburn (1) 31:5 **heavy (1)** 37:19 help (2) 15:2;34:9 helpful (2) 11:24;53:2 helping (1) 46:18 helps (1) 51:24 high (1) 10:23 highest (1) 11:7 high-level (1) 44:8 highlights (1) 5:10 hired (1) 10:4 hiring (1) 34:17 honest (3) 32:5;36:18; 40:15 honestly (2) 30:16; 37:17 hope (1) 14:6 hopefully (2) 13:25; 52:15 Horizon (2) 39:15;40:4 host (1) 6:25 House (5) 26:1,23; 30:4;36:3;43:1

Ι

huge (1) 13:9

ignited (1) 41:17 II (1) 3:7 **III (1)** 4:4 **immediate (2)** 13:5; 31:23

immediately (1) 14:20**immensely (1)** 15:20 **impact (4)** 32:24;33:25; 35:16:36:4 impacts (1) 38:8**important (3)** 7:10; 13:19;38:11 **impossible (1)** 12:18 impression (1) 30:3including (1) 37:2 **increase (1)** 7:6 increases (1) 7:6increasing (1) 28:6independence (2) 30:17;40:8 independent (1) 17:1 **individually (1)** 24:20 individuals (1) 28:7 inflation (8) 27:7,10,22, 23,24;28:1,4,9 **inflationary (1)** 27:22 **influence (1)** 35:13 info (1) 53:1 information (1) 50:6informed (2) 38:14;45:3 **inherently (1)** 31:12 initial (1) 48:23 **inspiring (1)** 11:25 **instance (1)** 53:15 integral (1) 12:6 **integrity (3)** 34:3,4; 38:10 intend (1) 30:13 intended (2) 28:14;53:3 intention (2) 18:23;40:4 interacted (1) 7:19Interagency (3) 50:19, 25:51:3 interest (1) 30:14 **interested (1)** 32:21 **interesting (1)** 52:19 interferes (1) 5:23 interview (1) 52:14 interviewees (1) 52:17 into (16) 8:11;9:8; 13:19;21:17;43:22; 44:7,15,16;45:3,4; 46:15;51:19;52:7;54:7, 14,23 involved (2) 35:11; 48:22 **ISA (6)** 51:19;53:21; 54:4,7,14,24 **ISAs (1)** 51:12 issue (11) 26:11;29:4,

15;32:7,11;33:4;37:12;

38:25;42:6,13;47:8

issued (4) 17:15;18:5;

issues (17) 18:8,11;

26:21;28:24;29:2; 32:13;37:8,17;42:11;

44:15;48:1,15,18;

19:22;20:21

grave (1) 31:21

floored (1) 13:17

focus (4) 31:9,10;

34:23

measures (1) 5:17

meatiest (1) 37:17

51:16:53:16.20.21 **Item (13)** 3:7;4:4;9:15; 16:17;25:11;43:17,18, 22;46:11,13;50:18; 55:5,15 items (2) 41:23;44:24 IV (1) 9:15 **IX (1)** 50:18

J

January (1) 36:1 Jesus (1) 16:19 job (8) 10:5;11:12; 12:7,18;13:7,23;14:1, 23 jobs (1) 52:2 **Joe (6)** 16:25;17:5,10; 51:25;53:5,7 join (1) 14:19 joy (2) 10:22,24 jud (3) 26:1;27:16; 39:11 Judge (10) 10:3;16:18, 24;17:15;18:8,10;20:7; 21:24;22:19,23 judge's (5) 18:21; 23:21;24:7,11,24 judgment (3) 20:4;47:4, judicial (2) 48:14;49:7 jud's (1) 27:16 July (1) 47:7

K

jurisdiction (1) 28:16

Kara (3) 52:1;53:5,7 **Karlson (2)** 48:22; 51:10 keep (3) 13:1;36:8; 41:22 keeping (1) 38:14 **KIMBLE (28)** 3:17;7:10; 12:14,15,16;14:11; 16:13;20:11,12,13,19, 24;22:9,25;23:19; 24:16;25:3,4;38:19; 40:23,24,25;45:20; 54:11,12,13,21;55:20 kind (6) 9:4;13:20; 15:13;16:10;34:5;41:8 kinds (1) 7:9 knew (1) 13:15 knowledge (3) 12:20; 13:3;17:6 knowledgeable (1) 13:22 known (2) 17:15;32:2 knows (2) 8:10;48:19

\mathbf{L}

labor (1) 6:8 Laird (1) 10:16 Lang (2) 10:2,3 language (4) 7:20; 27:3;28:13;49:23 Larsen (4) 9:16;10:20; 11:21;15:12 LaRue (7) 16:25;17:13; 20:9,18;21:3,4;48:21 LaRue's (1) 21:14 **last (5)** 5:11;7:14; 27:17;51:1,1 later (1) 55:11 latter (1) 27:13 law (31) 8:11;16:18,23; 17:15,18,21,22,25; 18:4.9.10.21:20:7.19: 21:24;22:14,19,23; 23:13,15,21,22;24:5,7, 11,24;25:14;26:9,12; 28:19;49:1 laws (1) 53:18 lawsuit (1) 47:24 lawyers (1) 17:17 luck (1) 15:4 layman's (1) 17:19 leaders (1) 11:25 learned (1) 15:17 learning (1) 14:18 least (3) 17:8;53:7,15 leave (3) 16:3,3;52:16 leaving (2) 9:20;13:25 **left (3)** 6:6;8:20;10:17 **Legacy (4)** 43:19; 44:12,21;45:15 legal (4) 44:10,15,19; 45:13 legislation (6) 25:12,18, 20,21;36:21;38:7 **Legislative (3)** 7:11,12; 29:17 legislators (1) 29:18 **legislature (15)** 26:13; 27:14;28:25;29:2,3; 32:23;34:25,25;37:14, 18;38:2;48:25;49:3,24; legitimate (1) 19:14 legitimized (1) 9:3 letter (2) 49:3,14 **level (1)** 11:7 levels (2) 28:8;37:24 life (1) 16:4 light (2) 8:21;42:11 liked (1) 6:14 likely (1) 42:25 **Likewise (1)** 28:13 limited (1) 55:8

limits (4) 7:20;8:1;27:8,

lines (1) 39:12

listen (1) 37:5 listening (2) 33:23;38:1 literally (1) 40:5 litigated (3) 19:1,3;20:5 **litigation (1)** 53:6 **litigator (1)** 39:5 little (9) 13:15;18:6; 25:22;27:11;31:5,13; 34:2;39:5;51:12 live (2) 7:4;41:16 lobbying (2) 39:24;40:2 lobbyist (2) 39:2,8 localities (1) 9:5 logical (1) 53:19 long (3) 5:11;7:15;8:13 **look (8)** 6:2,17;31:24; 32:7;39:10;49:23,24; 50:1 **looked (3)** 6:17;47:25; 48:3 looking (4) 9:8;16:15; 40:3;42:9 loss (3) 11:12;13:10,22 **lot (7)** 14:13,25;15:17, 18;16:4;41:25;53:6 low (1) 28:8 **lower (3)** 20:16,20,23

\mathbf{M}

27:1

28:16

53:10

mailers (1) 8:25 maintain (1) 53:2 making (3) 8:24;18:4; manner (2) 27:14; many (1) 30:3 March (2) 3:6;5:15 mark (1) 18:22 Mary (8) 43:23;44:2,9; 46:12,18,24;50:9,16 matter (12) 23:16,22; 24:8,12;25:10;26:8; 28:17;43:21;45:23; 48:22;55:9,10 **matters (1)** 53:14 may (13) 8:22;18:17; 27:17;30:2;34:10,20; 36:23;37:12;43:21; 44:17,17;46:15;49:11 maybe (9) 11:17;14:4; 34:1,9;38:23;39:1,5; 40:12;42:14 mean (7) 7:15;31:24; 34:4;40:4;41:8,12; meaning (1) 49:5 meaningful (1) 13:21 means (1) 17:19 meantime (1) 36:18 measure (7) 5:14;7:8, 18;16:22;25:25;26:17;

media (2) 39:14;40:3 meet (3) 39:22,23; 52:17 meeting (10) 3:5,21,21; 11:3;14:3;27:16;39:25; 42:24;43:2;55:16 meetings (3) 26:20; 42:15,22 members (5) 21:15,21, 23;32:20;38:16 memo (4) 7:16;51:20, 23;54:6 mention (2) 7:14;32:21 mentioned (2) 14:3,4 messaging (1) 38:24 met (1) 5:11 MEYER (80) 3:3,14,18, 24;4:1,3;5:1;8:15;9:9, 14;12:15;13:12;14:9, 16;15:8;16:12,16; 17:12;20:9,12,25;21:3, 5,12,17,20;22:3,10,15, 17,24;23:1,6,8,10,17, 20,25;24:2,4,13,19,22; 25:3,5,7,7;31:2;34:8; 36:24;38:17;39:4; 40:22,24;41:6;42:5; 43:16;44:22;45:8,19, 21.25:46:2.5.7.9:50:13. 16;54:9,12,19,22;55:2, 4,14,18,21,25;56:2,4 mic (1) 21:17 might (4) 16:13;19:11; 50:22;51:17 Mike (3) 14:3,3;35:23 Mike's (2) 25:17;29:11 mind (1) 34:22 minds (4) 29:9;32:2,3; 40:6 minute (1) 15:19 minutes (6) 3:8,10,11, 13,15,21 misled (1) 36:19 miss (1) 12:12 missing (1) 14:24 misspeaking (1) 42:8 misunderstanding (1) 34:10 mitigation (1) 35:16 modify (1) 18:20 modifying (1) 30:22 moments (1) 20:3 money (7) 8:20,21;9:1; 19:12;28:6;32:18; 33:17 month (1) 6:6 months (2) 50:24;51:1 more (7) 6:11;25:22; 26:16;37:23,23;41:3; 42:13

morning (3) 3:3,4;12:4 most (3) 36:5;37:16; 43:13 motion (27) 3:11,14,18; 4:3;22:18;23:4,10,12; 24:4,6,9,25;25:9;45:10, 10,13,21;46:9;54:10, 18,20,22;55:4,16,17, 18;56:4 motivates (1) 5:22 mouth (1) 7:8 Move (15) 3:12;5:12; 9:14;21:14;22:22; 23:15;24:11;43:5,18; 45:3,4,11,18,23;54:13 moved (8) 3:19;23:1, 20;24:23;33:24;42:25; 45:22;55:22 moving (1) 9:21 **much (7)** 14:7;15:3,13; 16:10;38:10;41:2; 42:10 **multiplied (2)** 19:17,20 **MUR (1)** 16:19 MUR-03 (1) 5:4 MURS (1) 4:6 must (1) 18:20 myself (3) 25:8;41:14; 54:5

N

name (2) 21:8,10 necessarily (2) 7:5;53:1 necessary (3) 44:11,19; 45:14 need (15) 6:12;24:6, 17;30:20;36:17;40:18; 42:12,17;44:18;45:5, 10;46:16;48:9,12,16 needed (1) 43:11 needs (1) 24:20 negotiate (3) 20:16,20, 23 **Network (2)** 8:7;46:14 neutral (6) 29:21;31:5, 11,14;34:3;38:24 nevertheless (3) 8:9; 27:18;32:15 **new (8)** 6:1,16;7:18; 11:11,23;13:8,20;51:5 **news (2)** 5:13;13:17 **next (5)** 11:3;42:14,24; 43:1;55:14 nice (1) 15:15 **night (1)** 10:18 non-lawyer (1) 17:19 **nonpartisan (1)** 36:20 **note (4)** 4:15;5:8; 25:21.23 noted (1) 26:20 **notes (1)** 52:5 **notice (6)** 4:5,10,22;

Koester (1) 10:12

kudos (2) 9:6,7

17:8;52:22;53:2

Notwithstanding (1)
29:16

novel (1) 26:11

Number (19) 3:7;6:23;
9:15;10:9;12:21,22;
16:17;22:20;25:10,11;
39:10;43:17,18;46:11,
13;50:18;51:23;55:5,
15

numerous (1) 28:20

0

objections (1) 30:22

observations (1) 42:20

observing (1) 32:14 obtain (5) 44:11,20; 45:14,14,23 obviously (8) 29:8; 30:10,23;36:16;42:19; 44:6,16;53:24 o'clock (1) 12:4 odd (2) 28:5;48:18 **off (4)** 8:20;10:17; 29:12;32:6 office (11) 6:6;12:4; 13:17;17:2;18:15; 48:20;50:20,23;53:14; 54:15,24 officer (1) 9:16 **O'GRADY (3)** 44:3; 46:25;50:11 **old (3)** 6:16,17;39:4 omission (1) 37:21 omits (1) 32:19 once (4) 6:14,16;35:11; 39:25 one (23) 4:15;5:8;7:17; 8:6:10:15:11:16:12:23: 13:13;18:24;20:13; 21:19;24:7;25:20,20, 22;26:24;27:1;34:15; 37:8;46:18;47:19; 48:17;52:15 online (1) 52:23 **only (9)** 31:6;33:7,8,11; 47:2,11,12,20,20 onto (1) 34:24 openly (1) 37:18 operates (1) 28:11 operation (1) 30:18 opinion (5) 9:5;22:4; 33:21;37:4;49:8 opinions (1) 52:23 opportunities (1) 11:12 opportunity (3) 10:2; 11:21;16:8 oppose (2) 9:2;37:20 **opposed (5)** 3:24;9:2; 29:14;46:5;55:25 opposition (3) 23:6,25; 55:2

order (26) 3:4;17:16, 17;18:5,8,9,11,11,21; 19:4,5,6,18,19,23,24; 20:7,21;21:7;22:14; 24:8,12,18,24;29:17; 44:20 organic (1) 26:9 organized (1) 6:10 oriented (1) 6:11 originalist (1) 49:22 Others (1) 30:10 otherwise (2) 26:11; 39:15 ought (1) 53:11 **out (19)** 15:14;16:14; 20:17;26:12;28:3;30:4, 24;33:22;35:5;39:10, 10;42:6;43:1,7,17; 50:7;53:23;54:2,3 outlined (1) 4:13 outstanding (1) 10:24over (10) 8:8;12:9; 17:4,9;27:25;28:8; 31:5;34:15;37:1;38:1 overall (1) 40:9 overflow (1) 53:19 overseen (1) 5:22 overview (3) 18:18; 44:5.8 owes (2) 44:12,21 own (3) 12:2;26:9;27:9 P

packet (1) 44:25 paint (1) 42:3 **Panama (1)** 10:17 Part (6) 27:3,3;47:23; 52:9,14,24 participating (4) 27:1; 33:16,23;34:11 particular (3) 8:9;12:24; 32:4 parties (5) 27:2;32:19, 21;34:13;35:13 partisan (1) 41:14 parts (1) 31:9 party (12) 7:21;8:3; 29:4,15;32:7,9,9;39:12, 12;40:14,17,18 pass (7) 26:6;29:7; 31:25;37:13;39:10; 48:25;49:3 passed (9) 4:21;5:13; 7:18;29:6;30:1;34:23, 24;49:10,24 passion (1) 11:21 past (1) 52:6 **Paton (12)** 6:25;14:13; 22:7;25:5,6;32:1; 33:21;38:20;41:6,8,12; 42:20 **Paton's (1)** 33:20

paused (1) 39:12 pay (1) 20:17 **PBS's (1)** 39:16 penalty (3) 19:18,22; 20:2 **people (9)** 11:9;14:5; 15:25;32:10;38:8,11; 41:13,15;42:1 per (2) 27:9;30:20 percent (1) 5:14 perform (1) 12:7 perhaps (1) 31:7 **permission (1)** 17:10 person (2) 24:19;33:6 personally (3) 15:2; 30:7;38:9 **personnel (1)** 52:8 **perspective (3)** 39:14; 40:3;49:23 Phoenix (9) 5:15,18; 8:18;9:7;25:24;26:2,3, 7:39:16 phone (2) 43:23,24 picking (2) 8:19;9:6 piece (2) 25:20,21 pieces (1) 17:20 **pilot (1)** 6:24 **place (7)** 14:5;15:21; 29:15,25;31:25;33:5; plaintiffs (2) 8:8;47:16 plaintiff's (1) 47:19 plan (4) 5:25;42:9; 53:8.11 plaque (2) 12:12,13 please (2) 21:18;24:18 **pleased (2)** 8:18;9:3 point (10) 12:10;16:14; 20:22;21:5;29:11,13; 33:22;34:21;41:4,5 policy (7) 11:22;31:13, 20;32:4;35:18;37:17, 19 policymakers (1) 37:24 political (4) 32:19;48:6; 49:4,18 portion (1) 19:7 position (13) 10:20; 26:13;29:21;31:13; 34:6;42:23;47:11,16, 18,19,21;48:24;49:9 **positioned (1)** 43:4 positive (1) 11:24 possesses (1) 11:10 **possible (7)** 3:8;4:4;

27:21 presented (4) 11:6; 18:2;28:2;40:9 press (3) 29:18;30:4; 36:5 pretty (1) 49:12 **previous (3)** 6:14; 15:14;26:20 previously (1) 52:21 principal (3) 26:25; 40:21;53:25 **Print (1)** 19:8 **prior (1)** 6:13 probably (2) 37:2;41:24 problem (2) 40:21;42:7 problems (1) 53:22 **Procedures (4)** 27:5,6; 28:21,23 **proceed (2)** 33:9;51:12 proceedings (1) 56:7 process (4) 18:18;39:6; 49:9:52:14 produced (2) 7:21;19:8 professional (3) 11:8, 10:16:4 professionalism (2) 11:7;14:23 professionally (1) 11:14 program (5) 6:24; 28:10;30:18;39:17; 40:9 prohibit (1) 26:1 **prohibited (1)** 34:1 prohibits (1) 27:1 properly (1) 30:16 proposal (1) 30:25 propose (1) 30:13 **proposed (3)** 26:3; 29:19;47:7 proposing (1) 30:11 **Prosperity's (1)** 32:17 **Protection (6)** 26:21; 47:12,13,14,25;48:1 proud (3) 6:3,19,20 provide (2) 10:24;28:21 provided (1) 17:17 provision (5) 8:9;28:23; 49:5,15;52:21 provisions (4) 8:6;27:5, 13;28:20 **public (9)** 11:22;28:2; 29:18;36:5;50:6;55:6, 7,8,12 publicity (2) 48:7;49:2 publish (1) 52:23 purchase (1) 34:12 purchased (1) 34:19 purposes (2) 19:12; 29:17

put (4) 8:11;30:4;34:4;

49:16

putting (1) 26:24

Q

quickly (5) 4:9;5:10,12; 6:12;52:6 quote/unquote (3) 36:19;47:9;48:21

R

radical (1) 28:10 raise (1) 29:24 raised (2) 7:1;26:5 raises (2) 26:11,21 raising (1) 35:19ramifications (1) 38:5 rare (1) 11:8 rarely (1) 15:23 rather (3) 7:16;26:19; 43:1 reach (1) 33:6 reaching (1) 15:14 read (5) 4:18;10:15; 11:17;35:2,4 **Real (6)** 5:10;6:8;10:1; 33:15;44:5;52:6 really (27) 4:9;6:3,14, 17,19,19,21;8:18,18; 9:2;14:14;15:16;29:19; 32:12;34:6;35:1;38:3, 4;39:1;40:2,13,13,14, 17;41:14;43:8,15 reason (6) 19:6;29:1; 31:7;35:15;47:19,20 reasonable (6) 29:9; 32:2,3;33:6;40:6,6 reasons (1) 19:4 recall (1) 19:18 receipt (2) 19:8,13 receive (3) 4:22;17:8; 26:22 received (1) 10:14 recently (1) 13:4 **Reckart (1)** 10:9 **Recognition (1)** 9:15 recognize (1) 8:17 recognized (2) 19:10, recommend (3) 20:6; 37:7:51:18 recommendation (5) 16:18;18:25;19:2;

17:16,17;18:5,11,21; 19:22,23;20:7;24:8,12,

17:6

21:14;31:19

recommendations (1)

recommended (11)

reconsider (2) 4:16,17 reconsideration (1) 5:3 record (6) 5:9;8:22;

10:15;21:9;22:2;48:19

16:17;25:12;43:19;

46:13;50:18

possibly (1) 13:1

potential (1) 5:17

predicted (1) 41:9

38:6

potentially (2) 28:22;

prepared (3) 6:5;11:6;

reduce (1) 19:6 reduced (1) 19:21 referenda (2) 37:10; 38:7 **referendums (2)** 35:3; 43:3 **referred (1)** 37:13 **reform (1)** 5:17 refused (2) 39:21,21 regard (3) 8:20;17:22; **regarding (1)** 7:17 regardless (2) 37:20; 48:11 **Regulatory (2)** 28:17; 47:10 rehashed (1) 29:5 reinstate (1) 4:20 reject (1) 18:20 related (2) 25:23;43:21 release (1) 30:4 relevant (1) 52:22 rely (1) 36:6 remaining (1) 33:12 remarked (1) 6:15 removed (1) 28:14 removes (1) 27:3 repay (1) 19:25 repayment (3) 19:5,19; 20:21 replies (1) 47:5 **Report (11)** 4:5;8:13; 9:12;25:17;43:12; 44:12,20;45:15,24,25; 46:23 reported (2) 7:22;49:7 reports (3) 11:2,4,6 Representative (2) 39:19;40:20 represented (3) 16:25; 18:14:40:20 representing (1) 48:20 **Republican (1)** 32:9 request (7) 4:16;5:3; 21:22,25;22:13;39:22, 23 **requested (3)** 7:17; 11:5;39:23 requesting (1) 54:7 requests (1) 52:23 require (4) 31:22,22; 45:2;49:16 required (2) 49:21; 52:22 requires (3) 4:22;48:4; 49:1 research (7) 5:21,22; 27:20;28:1;32:23;36:3, researching (1) 5:16 resolve (1) 28:25 resolved (1) 47:13 resolves (1) 25:10

resources (1) 51:25 respect (3) 31:20; 33:21;48:1 responding (1) 55:11 response (17) 3:25;4:2; 9:13;21:2;23:7,9;24:1, 3;34:8;45:7;46:6,8; 50:15:55:3,13:56:1,3 rest (3) 8:8;11:5;12:9 restored (1) 12:5 restricted (1) 49:18 result (1) 55:8 results (1) 6:9 retention (1) 51:24 return (2) 16:22;53:24 **Review (4)** 28:17; 36:16;43:21;47:10 reviewed (6) 21:23; 22:1,3,4,5,10 **Revised (1)** 18:19 revisit (2) 30:9;38:2 right (10) 3:18;15:5; 24:22;27:16;46:9,11, 20,24;55:14,21 **Rights (2)** 5:20,21 rigid (1) 34:2 role (2) 11:23;13:16 roll (2) 24:17,25 **Rubalcava (10)** 16:19; 17:7;18:3;19:8,11,24, 25;20:4,14,21 **Ruiz (1)** 11:18 rule (21) 4:13,21;8:11; 12:21;29:6,7,15,16,25; 30:1,5,9,12;31:15,24; 35:18;36:14,15,15; 42:22;46:22 rule-making (3) 27:4; 28:23;49:9 rules (6) 13:1;31:22; 37:11;47:23;48:12; 49:10

S

sacrifice (1) 31:20 sacrificing (1) 31:13 sad (3) 9:19,20;13:9 safe (1) 28:15 same (1) 32:22 **San (1)** 10:6 **Sara (15)** 9:16,19;10:2, 4,20,22;11:4,6,10,10, 13,21;12:2,17;18:2 Sara's (1) 10:11 Sate (1) 48:20 saw (2) 6:16;50:3 saying (7) 26:11;31:7, 8;33:13,19;36:9;41:1 SB1516 (1) 49:19 **schedule (5)** 6:22;47:4, 6,7;50:12 scheduled (2) 39:15,25

scheduling (2) 46:23; 55:9 **school (2)** 6:24;10:23 **se (1)** 30:20 second (17) 3:16,17; 4:10;11:16;22:24,25; 23:18,19;24:15,16; 37:15;45:19,20;54:17, 23;55:19,20 **seconded (6)** 3:19; 23:2,21;24:23;45:22; 55:22 **Secretary (5)** 7:21; 13:16;47:9;48:20,23 **Section (15)** 7:17; 12:21;29:21;30:13; 31:6,11,12;33:16;40:5, 6;41:3;47:15;48:4,24; 49:14 **Sections (8)** 30:15; 32:12,21,24;33:13; 40:7,16,18 seeing (1) 37:23 seeking (1) 44:10 seem (1) 14:5 **seems (3)** 5:11;37:24; 53:18 **Senate (10)** 8:3;25:25; 27:16,16,20;28:1;36:3; 39:11:43:1:50:2 sending (1) 38:5 sends (1) 32:20 sense (1) 43:5 sent (3) 26:18,19;35:2 **separate (2)** 18:15; 22:15 **separately (1)** 22:13 serious (1) 53:22 **service (5)** 9:17;10:25; 50:19,25;51:4 services (1) 34:18 session (9) 29:17; 43:22;44:7,16;45:3,5; 46:16;48:25;49:25 set (1) 50:12 seven (1) 12:3 **SGO (3)** 51:13;52:13, 24 **shall (1)** 48:25 **sharing (1)** 50:6 **sheet (2)** 27:20;28:2 sheets (1) 36:6 shine (1) 8:20 shining (1) 42:11 **shoes (1)** 13:24 shortest (1) 13:14 **short-term (1)** 28:5 side (1) 26:24 sign (1) 54:5

situation (1) 18:11 **situations (1)** 53:12 **six (3)** 39:23;50:24; 51:1 **skills (1)** 11:9 **slack (2)** 8:19;9:6 somebody (1) 14:1 someone (2) 11:8; 16:15 son's (1) 10:23 sorry (5) 15:8,11;21:8, 10:46:3 sort (2) 38:23;50:7 sound (3) 8:22;37:9,16 sounds (1) 37:18 **speak (2)** 27:17;33:24 speaker (2) 30:4,8 speaking (2) 8:23;14:2 special (1) 10:24 **specific (2)** 35:10;44:15 specifically (4) 5:8; 10:15;26:16;33:14 spend (1) 33:17 **spending (4)** 7:19;8:1, 21;27:8 **spent (3)** 16:4;19:12,14 spoken (1) 10:8 **sponsor (1)** 39:20 squarely (2) 29:1,2 staff (12) 4:20;5:16; 6:15;11:19;14:14; 27:21;28:1;36:3,4; 52:1;53:10;55:9 staffs (1) 32:23 **start (1)** 3:7 starting (1) 20:22 **State (13)** 8:19;9:4,17; 18:6,8;22:1;46:15; 47:9,10,21;48:21,23; 51:6 statements (1) 8:24 states (1) 27:21 State's (1) 13:16 status (2) 25:17;50:8 statute (1) 34:11 **Statutes (1)** 18:19 **steep (1)** 14:18 step (3) 11:13;13:19; 55:14 **Stephanie (1)** 6:3 stick (1) 41:20 **still (7)** 31:14;33:21,22; 34:12;35:6,7;52:19 stipulations (1) 54:15 stop (1) 40:5 straightforward (2) 27:14;28:12 strategic (1) 41:5 strategy (1) 41:3 **strong (1)** 30:21 study (1) 55:9

single-subject (1) 37:11

situated (1) 48:2

stuff (3) 40:14,17,18 **subject (1)** 37:10 **subsection (2)** 12:21; 50:22 **substantive (1)** 49:15 succeed (1) 11:11 **success (1)** 7:8 **successful (1)** 44:9 **sufficient (1)** 30:11 sufficiently (1) 31:21 suggestions (1) 55:7 suing (1) 8:8 **summarize (1)** 52:6 summary (3) 28:3;47:4, sums (1) 12:1 **super (1)** 41:14 **support (4)** 37:20;41:1; 42:9;52:1 supposed (1) 36:20 **Supreme (1)** 44:9 sure (8) 8:10;36:24; 37:1;38:4;39:3;46:23; 49:12;51:7 **surprised (1)** 50:2 sweet (1) 16:3

T

table (2) 29:12;32:6 talk (6) 4:9;21:17; 25:22;26:15;34:21; 51:16 talked (3) 26:16,25; 35:23 talking (5) 10:2;27:12; 29:3;38:3;40:5 tamp (1) 41:22 television (1) 39:16 telling (2) 36:20;38:13 tells (1) 35:1 **Tempe (7)** 5:13;8:17; 9:6;25:24;26:2,3,7 tension (1) 32:14 tenure (1) 11:5 term (1) 31:23 terminology (1) 34:5 **terms (6)** 7:4;17:19,19; 29:4;32:5;42:20 testament (1) 15:24 testified (3) 5:19;18:3,3 thankful (1) 15:1 **Thanks (2)** 14:13;16:11 third (2) 27:6;28:7 though (3) 31:14; 33:21;38:22 thought (3) 35:22; 41:17;50:7 **thoughts (2)** 37:6;46:17 three (6) 4:14;19:18; 22:15;26:25;29:6;

similar (2) 23:12;53:16

similarly (2) 10:13;48:2

simply (2) 31:23;32:7

single (1) 37:10

three-quarters (1) 26:22

53:20

threshold (1) 49:20	43:21;47:2,6;48:2,5	53:17,23	1 (11) 27:3;29:21;	
thrilled (1) 13:18	undoubtedly (1) 11:24	ways (2) 39:9;51:23	30:13;31:6,11,12;	9
times (3) 14:25;19:18;	unfortunately (2) 37:22;	website (7) 6:1,10,14,	33:16;39:10;40:5,6;	
39:23	39:8	16,16,17;25:19	41:3	91 (1) 5:14
today (7) 12:23;18:24;	United (1) 9:2	welcomed (1) 45:16	1:00 (1) 12:3	(1)
25:25;27:15,18;38:13;	unless (1) 39:15	what's (8) 5:10;8:11;	10 (1) 14:4	
54:16	unlikely (1) 52:15	28:2;36:21;43:3,8,15;	10:43 (1) 56:8	
Todd (3) 10:2,6;15:15	untrue (1) 28:3	50:1	15 (1) 3:9	
together (1) 49:16	up (15) 5:7;6:2;8:19;	Whereupon (1) 56:7	1516 (3) 8:4;50:1,3	
told (1) 10:10	9:6;12:1;19:21;30:8;	who's (4) 8:21,23,24;	15th (1) 3:21	
Tom (29) 4:7;5:2,3;	34:3,9;35:12;36:11,23;	13:14	16 (5) 46:22;47:15;	
9:22,23;15:10,13;	37:8;44:6;51:17	willing (1) 37:7	48:4,24;49:14	
17:13;18:2;21:6;25:15;	update (1) 46:22	window (1) 40:15	16-911 (1) 7:17	
31:4;33:10,11;34:8;	updates (1) 32:20	wish (2) 11:14;15:3	17-01 (1) 16:19	
37:4;38:13,22;41:1,9;	upon (1) 18:13	within (3) 18:19,22;	18-01 (1) 4:6	
42:6,12;43:16,23;	upset (2) 30:5;42:1	19:25	18F-002-CCE (1) 22:20	
44:22;45:10;46:17;	use (2) 42:2,2	without (4) 12:18,25;	1912 (3) 49:25;50:1,4	
50:17;54:14	T 7	26:10;31:11		
tonight (2) 39:16,17	\mathbf{V}	wonderful (5) 10:20;	2	
took (3) 10:23;19:13,16		11:9;13:19,23;14:1		
tops (1) 14:15	vacancy (1) 16:14	word (1) 7:8	2 (12) 7:11,12;27:3;	
totality (1) 29:14	valid (1) 47:20	words (3) 12:2;15:13;	30:15;32:12,21,24;	
totally (1) 41:2	Valley (1) 9:6	16:10	33:13;40:7,17,18;41:4	
touting (1) 32:18	value (2) 27:25;37:4	work (16) 10:11,22,25;	20 (1) 14:4	
towards (1) 6:12	various (2) 35:13,13	11:21;12:6,8;14:15;	2007 (2) 26:16;27:15	
track (2) 13:1;51:3	version (1) 6:13	15:21,25;16:1;18:6;	2016 (2) 29:5;34:19	
tracking (2) 25:18;	versus (2) 43:20;46:14	36:15;38:11;53:5,19,	2018 (5) 3:6,9,21;5:17;	
26:14	veto (1) 26:18	23	51:3	
transcripts (1) 42:21	VI (2) 25:11;43:17	worked (5) 6:4;7:5;	2153 (1) 26:1	
travesties (1) 31:10	view (4) 29:10,11,11;	12:2,3;16:9	22nd (1) 3:6	
treated (1) 48:2	33:8	workers (1) 34:17	24th (1) 7:13	
tremendous (1) 30:17	views (1) 32:1	working (4) 6:22,23;	28th (1) 17:16	
tried (2) 29:6;35:25		7:11;16:5	2811 (1) 17.10	
	VII (1) 43:18		3	
true (5) 17:20;41:10,10,	VIII (2) 46:11,13	works (5) 17:22;36:15;	3	
11;44:1	Vista (1) 19:8	53:16,18;54:3	0 (40) 5 16 10 17 20	
truly (1) 52:10	vote (10) 5:14;21:6,14;	world (1) 10:6	3 (12) 5:16;19:17,20;	
truth (1) 36:18	22:13;24:18,25;25:2,8;	written (3) 3:13;52:7,20	30:15;32:12,21,25;	
truthfully (1) 32:24	26:22;30:20	wrong (2) 31:8;49:11	33:13;40:7,17,19;41:4	
try (4) 13:20;35:13;	voted (3) 5:16;34:7;	wrote (2) 7:16;11:20	30 (2) 18:19;19:25	
43:7,14	35:18	***	30-day (1) 18:22	
trying (2) 8:20;51:2	voter (10) 5:24;8:23;	X		
Tucson (2) 26:7,8	26:21;33:18;34:12,16;		4	
turn (4) 12:9;17:4,9;	47:12,12,25;50:1	XI (1) 55:15		
37:1	voters (11) 5:23,23;6:9,		4 (4) 23:11;24:5;25:9;	
turnout (1) 7:3	12;9:7;26:18;34:24;	Y	46:10	
turnover (1) 15:24	35:2,6;38:6,7		40 (1) 26:10	
twice (1) 17:8	votes (1) 22:15	year (3) 51:1,3;54:8	4-0 (1) 55:4	
two (8) 4:10;10:14;	voting (4) 5:21,24;35:1;	years (7) 4:10;7:19;		
27:13;29:2,5;31:9;	36:21	12:3;14:4;26:10;29:5,6	5	
41:23;42:11		yesterday (2) 10:18,18		1
type (1) 18:10	\mathbf{W}	you-all (5) 12:10;29:24;	5 (1) 14:4	
typically (1) 43:2		44:6,17;47:3	501 (2) 27:2;32:10	
	waiting (1) 50:12	YouTube (1) 7:9	501c4s (1) 48:1	
U	walk (1) 17:5			
	wants (5) 32:9;35:4;	0	6	
Ultimately (1) 36:12	45:5;49:4;50:9		-	1
un- (1) 26:10	warranted (1) 30:9	0 (4) 23:11;24:5;25:9;	6 (1) 5:16	
unanimously (3) 29:7;	watching (2) 7:8;10:24	46:10	. ,	-
31:25;49:11	way (23) 7:7;14:23;	02 (1) 4:6	7	
unavailable (1) 53:12	18:6;28:10,12;29:10;	03 (1) 4:6	-	-
unchallenged (1) 26:10	30:22;32:16;33:2,7,8,		7 (4) 47:14;48:4,24;	
under (10) 4:12;8:3;	9;36:7,9,9;38:14;43:5,	1	49:14	
19:15;28:15;34:11;	5;51:11,14;52:18;	_		
, , , , - , , - ,	-,,-,,-,,,			