1	
2	
3	
4	
5	THE STATE OF ARIZONA
6	CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION
7	
8	
9	
10	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING
11	
12	Phoenix, Arizona February 27, 2025
13	10:00 a.m.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR Certified Reporter CERTIFIED
25	Certificate No. 50666 TRANSCRIPT

```
Page 2
                                                                                                               Page 4
              PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
                                                             1 motion to approve the minutes?
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 10:00 a.m. on February
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Motion to approve the
    27, 2025, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections
                                                             3 minutes for January 30th, 2025.
4 Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference Room,
5 Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following
                                                             4
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
6 Board Members:
                                                             5 Werther.
7
                                                             6
                                                                          Is there a second?
             Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
8
             Mr. Galen Paton
                                                             7
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
             Ms. Amy Chan
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
                                                             8
9
             Mr. Steve Titla
             Ms. Christina Werther
                                                             9 Paton.
10
                                                            10
                                                                          It's been moved by Commissioner Werther and
11
                                                            11 seconded by Commissioner Paton that we approve the
    OTHERS PRESENT:
12
                                                                minutes. I will call the roll.
                                                            12
             Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
                                                            13
                                                                          Commissioner Werther.
13
             Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
                                                            14
             Mike Becker, Policy Director
14
             Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director
                                                            15
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
             Avery Xola, Voter Education Manager
                                                            16
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
15
             Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon
                                                            17
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
             Eric Fraser, Osborn Maledon
16
             Cathy Herring, Meeting Planner, KCA
                                                            18
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
             Richard Corles, Member of the Public
                                                            19
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
17
             Bill Oter, Member of the Public
                                                            20
                                                                          (No response.)
19
                                                            21
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing nothing from
20
                                                            22 Commissioner Titla, the minutes are approved 4-to-0.
21
                                                            23
                                                                          Item III, discussion and possible action on
22
23
                                                            24 the Executive Director's Report. Tom.
24
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Commissioners, thank you for
25
                                                   Page 3
                                                                                                               Page 5
1
                     PROCEEDING
                                                             1 being here. Thanks.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. Agenda
                                                                          Really kind of a brief report, but there is a
 3 Item I is the call to order. It's 10:00 a.m. on
                                                             3 local election in Tucson. It is an all-mail election,
 4 February 27th, 2025. I'm Mark Kimble. I call this
                                                             4 so that means that everybody who's eligible to vote
 5 meeting of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission to
                                                             5 gets a ballot by mail. And tomorrow is the last day
                                                             6 for folks to request a replacement ballot by mail, and
7
             With that, we will take attendance.
                                                             7 then the -- we recommend that folks mail back no
8 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
                                                             8 longer -- no later than March 4th. And we've got
  record.
                                                               information about that election on our website.
10
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
                                                            10
                                                                          A couple things I really wanted to highlight
11
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Christina Werther.
                                                            11 as far as voter education. Avery has been working to
12
             COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.
                                                            12 put together a voter outreach work group, including
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And Commissioner Titla, you
                                                            13 representatives -- ultimately hope that -- he hopes to
                                                            14 have all the counties' representatives there. I think
14 are with us?
                                                            15 this is a really good initiative because it will help
15
             (No response.)
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I believe you're with us,
                                                            16 to make sure that, you know, the counties and Avery can
17 Commissioner Titla, although you may be muted. But we
                                                            17 coordinate on information, issues they're identifying,
18 will proceed on the belief that we have all five
                                                            18 you know, leverage their resources together, so I'm
19 Commissioners with us this morning.
                                                            19 very excited about that. I think it's a good step to
20
             Item II, discussion and possible action on
                                                            20 sort of formalize and make, you know, some permanence
21 minutes for the January 30th, 2025 meeting.
                                                            21 to the role we've been playing in supporting county
22 Commissioners, you have the minutes from our January
                                                            22 election officials. So that's really exciting.
                                                            23
23 meeting in your packet. Is there any discussion?
                                                                          And Captain Activate was at the Legislative
24
             (No response.)
                                                            24 Conference Youth Day. I stole that picture from Avery
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a
                                                            25 and put it in the report, so hopefully everyone is okay
```

```
Page 6
                                                                                                               Page 8
1 with that. I couldn't resist. So that was cool.
                                                             1
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
                                                             2
             And then we are working on starting our
                                                                          The Annual Report is approved 4-to-nothing.
 3 research around voter education that we do in the off
                                                                          Item V, discussion and possible action on
                                                             4 Montenegro, formerly Toma, versus Fontes, Arizona
 4 years to sort of understand where voters are coming
 5 from, and that will be ongoing beginning next month.
                                                             5 Supreme Court Number CV-24-0166-PR, and litigation
             I think the other issues in the -- in the --
                                                             6 arisings from the Voters' Right to Know Act.
7 in the, you know, the legal report, we have an item on
                                                                          Commissioners, next week the Arizona Supreme
 8 our Agenda later to talk about the case that the
                                                             8 Court will hold oral arguments in the case Montenegro
9 Supreme Court will have argument on next -- next week.
                                                             9 versus Fontes. Our attorneys in that matter are
10 So really that's -- that's about all I got.
                                                            10 available to brief us on that matter. Is there a
                                                            11 motion to go into executive session to meet with our
11
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Tom.
12
             Are there any questions or comments from
                                                            12 attorneys?
13 Members of the Commission?
                                                            13
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I move to go into
14
                                                            14 executive session.
             (No response.)
15
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
                                                            15
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
16
             We'll move on to Item IV, discussion and
                                                            16 Werther.
17 possible action on the 2024 Annual Report. The
                                                            17
                                                                          Is there a second?
18 Commission provides a regular report to the Governor
                                                            18
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
19 and the Legislature on its activities. The report is
                                                            19
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll on
20 in your packet, this colorful report.
                                                            20 Commissioner Werther's motion and Commissioner Paton's
             Do any of the Commissioners have questions
                                                            21 second to go into executive session.
21
22 for staff about the report?
                                                            22
                                                                          Commissioner Werther.
23
             MR. COLLINS: We chose the --
                                                            23
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom.
                                                            24
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
24
25
                                                            25
             MR. COLLINS: Yeah. The design, just for
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
                                                   Page 7
                                                                                                               Page 9
1 everyone, is to reflect our debate stage at the -- for
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
 2 the broadcast debates that we did last year.
                                                             2
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
                                                             3
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
             Hearing no questions or comments from Members
                                                             4
                                                                          (No response.)
 5 of the Commission, do I have a motion to approve the
                                                             5
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
 6 Annual Report?
                                                                          We have voted 4-to-nothing to go into
7
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I move to approve the
                                                             7 executive session.
                                                             8
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: So just to note, for those of
8 2024 Annual Report.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
                                                             9 you who are in the online audience, the executive
10 Werther.
                                                            10 session will be closed to you. But if you're here for
11
                                                            11 a later Agenda item, we'll be back out after it.
             Is there a second?
12
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
                                                            12
                                                                          (The following section of the meeting is in
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
                                                            13 executive session and bound under separate cover.)
14 Paton.
                                                            14
15
             It's been moved by Commissioner Werther,
                                                            15
                                                                          (End of executive session. Public meeting
16 seconded by Commissioner Paton that we approve the
                                                            16 resumes at 10:46 a.m.)
17 Annual Report. I will call the roll.
                                                            17
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: We are back in regular
                                                            18 session. Let the record show Commissioner Chan had to
18
             Commissioner Werther.
19
                                                            19 leave us for a previous commitment, so we still have
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
20
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
                                                            20 four Members of the Commission present.
21
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
                                                            21
                                                                          We will now move to Item VI, discussion and
22
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
                                                            22 possible action on the following 2024 primary and
23
             COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
                                                            23 general election candidate audits. Mike and our
24
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
                                                            24 auditors at Fester and Chapman have been reviewing
                                                            25 primary and general election clean candidates'
             (No response.)
```

```
Page 10
                                                                                                              Page 12
1 financial records as part of our compliance process.
                                                             1 there's anyone.
 2 The rules require these audits to be approved by the
                                                                         (No response.)
 3 Commission.
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you. The
             With that, do any Members of the Commission
                                                             4 public may also send comments to the Commission by
 5 have questions for Tom or the rest of the staff, Mike,
                                                             5 e-mail at ccec@azcleanelections.gov.
 6 or anyone?
                                                                          At this time, I would entertain a motion to
7
             (No response.)
                                                             7 adjourn.
8
                                                             8
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I move to adjourn.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: No?
9
             Mr. Corles, I see you were here. Did you
                                                             9
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
10 want to make a comment?
                                                            10 Werther.
11
             (No response.)
                                                            11
                                                                          Is there a second?
12
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Mr. Corles, you're on mute.
                                                            12
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
13 If you wish to make a comment, could you unmute
                                                            13
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
14 yourself?
                                                            14 Paton.
15
             MR. CORLES: No comment.
                                                            15
                                                                          It's been moved by Commissioner Werther,
16
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
                                                            16 seconded by Commissioner Paton that we adjourn. I will
17
                                                            17 call the roll.
             Any -- no more comments or questions from the
18 Commission. I'll entertain a motion to approve the
                                                            18
                                                                         Commissioner Werther.
19 audits identified in Item VI of the Agenda.
                                                            19
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
                                                            20
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I motion to approve
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
20
21 the 2024 primary and general election candidate audits.
                                                            21
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
22
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
                                                            22
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
23 Werther.
                                                            23
                                                                          MS. HERRING: He's in the chat.
                                                            24
                                                                          MS. THOMAS: He's responding via chat.
24
             Is there a second?
25
                                                            25
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: He's responded in chat?
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
                                                 Page 11
                                                                                                              Page 13
1
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner
                                                             1 What did he say?
                                                             2
 2 Paton.
                                                                         MS. HERRING: "I vote aye to adjourn."
             It's been moved by Commissioner Werther and
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Commissioner Titla
 4 seconded by Commissioner Paton that we approve the
                                                             4 votes aye, Chair votes aye.
 5 audits identified in Item VI of the Agenda. I will
                                                             5
                                                                         By a vote of 4-to-nothing, we are adjourned.
 6 call the roll.
                                                             6 Thank you very much.
7
             Commissioner Werther.
                                                             7
                                                                          (The meeting concluded at 10:50 a.m.)
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
8
                                                             8
9
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
                                                             9
10
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
                                                            10
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
                                                            11
11
12
                                                            12
             (No response.)
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I know you're with us,
                                                            13
14 Commissioner Titla, but I can't hear your response.
                                                            14
15
             The Chair votes aye, so the audits are
                                                            15
16 approved 3-to-nothing.
                                                            16
17
             Item VII, this is the time for consideration
                                                            17
18 of comments and suggestions from the public. Action
                                                            18
19 taken as a result of public comment will be limited to
                                                            19
20 directing staff to study the matter or rescheduling the
                                                            20
21 matter for further consideration and decision at a
                                                            21
22 later date or responding to criticism. Please limit
                                                            22
                                                            23
23 your comment to no more than two minutes.
             Does any member of the public wish to make a
                                                            24
25 comment at this time, anyone on Zoom? Doesn't appear
```

```
Public Meeting
                                                February 27, 2025
                                                                                                                    14
                                                 Page 14
 1 STATE OF ARIZONA )
                      ) ss.
 2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA )
             BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
 5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
 6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
 7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
 8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
 9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
13
             I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
18
              DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 28th day of
19 February, 2025.
20
21
22
                        Certified Reporter #50666
24
25
```

1	argument 6:9	Chan 3:12 4:17,18 7:22, 23 9:1,2,18	Court 6:9 8:5,8
10:00 3:3	arguments 8:8	Chapman 9:24	cover 9:13
10:46 9:16	arisings 8:6	chat 12:23,24,25	criticism 11:22
10:50 13:7	Arizona 8:4,7	chose 6:23	CV-24-0166-PR 8:5
	attendance 3:7	Christina 3:11	
2	attorneys 8:9,12	Citizens 3:5	date 11:22
2024 6:17 7:8 9:22 10:21	audience 9:9	clean 3:5 9:25	day 5:5,24
2025 3:4,21 4:3	auditors 9:24	closed 9:10	debate 7:1
27th 3:4	audits 9:23 10:2,19,21 11:5,15	COLLINS 4:25 6:23,25	debates 7:2
	Avery 5:11,16,24	9:8	decision 11:21
3	aye 4:14,16,18 7:19,21,23	colorful 6:20	design 6:25
3-to-nothing 11:16	8:1,23,25 9:2,5 11:8,10,15	comment 10:10,13,15	directing 11:20
30th 3:21 4:3	12:19,21 13:2,4	11:19,23,25	Director's 4:24
	В	comments 6:12 7:4 10:17 11:18 12:4	discussion 3:20,23 4:23
4	back 5:7 9:11,17	Commission 3:5 6:13,18	6:16 8:3 9:21
4-to-0 4:22	ballot 5:5,6	7:5 9:20 10:3,4,18 12:4	
4-to-nothing 8:2 9:6 13:5	beginning 6:5	Commissioner 3:10,11,	E
4th 5:8	beginning 6.5 belief 3:18	12,13,17 4:2,4,7,8,10,11, 13,14,15,16,17,18,19,22	e-mail 12:5
	bound 9:13	7:7,9,12,13,15,16,18,19,	education 5:11 6:3
Α	broadcast 7:2	20,21,22,23,24 8:13,15, 18,20,22,23,24,25 9:1,2,3,	election 5:3,9,22 9:23,25
a.m. 3:3 9:16 13:7	Dioducasi 7.2	18 10:20,22,25 11:1,3,4,7,	10:21
Act 8:6	С	8,9,10,11,14 12:8,9,12,13, 15,16,18,19,20,21,22 13:3	Elections 3:5
action 3:20 4:23 6:17 8:3	call 3:3,4 4:12 7:17 8:19	Commissioners 3:8,19,	eligible 5:4
9:22 11:18	11:6 12:17	22 4:25 6:21 8:7	end 9:15
Activate 5:23	candidate 9:23 10:21	commitment 9:19	entertain 10:18 12:6
activities 6:19	candidates' 9:25	compliance 10:1	excited 5:19
adjourn 12:7,8,16 13:2	Captain 5:23	concluded 13:7	exciting 5:22
adjourned 13:5	case 6:8 8:8	Conference 5:24	executive 4:24 8:11,14, 21 9:7,9,13,15
Agenda 3:2 6:8 9:11 10:19 11:5	ccec@	consideration 11:17,21	21 9.7,9,13,13
all-mail 5:3	azcleanelections.gov.	cool 6:1	F
Amy 3:12	12:5 Chair 8:1 9:5 11:15 13:4	coordinate 5:17	February 3:4
Annual 6:17 7:6,8,17 8:2		Corles 10:9,12,15	Fester 9:24
approve 4:1,2,11 7:5,7,	CHAIRMAN 3:2,13,16,25 4:4,8,15,17,19,21 6:11,15, 24 7:3,9,13,20,22,24 8:1,	counties 5:16	financial 10:1
16 10:18,20 11:4		counties' 5:14	folks 5:6,7
approved 4:22 8:2 10:2	15,19,24 9:1,3,5,17 10:8, 12,16,22 11:1,9,11,13	county 5:21	Fontes 8:4,9
11:16	12:3,9,13,20,22,25 13:3	couple 5:10	formalize 5:20
			0.20

Index: 10:00..formalize

G	12,16,22 11:1,9,11,13 12:3,9,13,20,22,25 13:3	move 6:16 7:7 8:13 9:21 12:8	Q
Galen 3:10	kind 5:2	moved 4:10 7:15 11:3 12:15	questions 6:12,21 7:4 10:5,17
general 9:23,25 10:21	L	mute 10:12	
good 3:2 5:15,19	leave 9:19	muted 3:17	R
Governor 6:18	legal 6:7		recommend 5:7
group 5:12	Legislative 5:23	N	record 3:9 9:18
Н	Legislature 6:19	note 9:8	records 10:1
hear 11:14	leverage 5:18	Number 8:5	reflect 7:1
Hearing 3:25 4:21 7:4	limit 11:22		regular 6:18 9:17
HERRING 12:23 13:2	limited 11:19	0	replacement 5:6
	litigation 8:5	officials 5:22	report 4:24 5:2,25 6:7,17,
highlight 5:10 hold 8:8	local 5:3	ongoing 6:5	18,19,20,22 7:6,8,17 8:2
	longer 5:8	online 9:9	representatives 5:13,14
hope 5:13		oral 8:8	request 5:6
hopes 5:13	M	order 3:3,6	require 10:2
1	mail 5:5,6,7	outreach 5:12	rescheduling 11:20
identified 10:19 11:5	make 5:16,20 10:10,13	Р	research 6:3
identify 3:8	11:24		resist 6:1
identifying 5:17	March 5:8	packet 3:23 6:20	resources 5:18
II 3:20	Mark 3:4	part 10:1	responded 12:25
III 4:23	matter 8:9,10 11:20,21	Paton 3:10 4:7,9,11,15,16 7:12,14,16,20,21 8:18,24,	responding 11:22 12:24
including 5:12	means 5:4	25 10:25 11:2,4,9,10	response 3:15,24 4:20
information 5:9,17	meet 8:11	12:12,14,16,20,21	6:14 7:25 9:4 10:7,11 11:12,14 12:2
initiative 5:15	meeting 3:5,21,23 9:12,	Paton's 8:20	rest 10:5
issues 5:17 6:6	15 13:7	permanence 5:20	result 11:19
item 3:3,20 4:23 6:7,16	member 11:24	picture 5:24	resumes 9:16
8:3 9:11,21 10:19 11:5,17	Members 6:13 7:4 9:20 10:4	playing 5:21	reviewing 9:24
IV 6:16	Mike 9:23 10:5	present 9:20	role 5:21
	minutes 3:21,22 4:1,3,12, 22 11:23	previous 9:19 primary 9:22,25 10:21	roll 4:12 7:17 8:19 11:6 12:17
January 3:21,22 4:3	Montenegro 8:4,8	proceed 3:18	rules 10:2
	month 6:5	process 10:1	
K	morning 3:2,19	public 9:15 11:18,19,24	S
Kimble 3:2,4,13,16,25	motion 4:1,2 7:5 8:11,20	12:4	seconded 4:11 7:16 11:4
4:4,8,15,17,19,21 6:11,15,	10:18,20 12:6	put 5:12,25	12:16
24 7:3,9,13,20,22,24 8:1, 15,19,24 9:1,3,5,17 10:8,			section 9:12

Index: Galen..section

send 12:4 vote 5:4 13:2,5 separate 9:13 voted 9:6 voter 5:11,12 6:3 **session** 8:11,14,21 9:7, 10,13,15,18 voters 6:4 **show** 9:18 Voters' 8:6 sort 5:20 6:4 votes 8:1 9:5 11:15 13:4 **staff** 6:22 10:5 11:20 W stage 7:1 starting 6:2 wanted 5:10 **step** 5:19 website 5:9 **stole** 5:24 week 6:9 8:7 **study** 11:20 Werther 3:11 4:2,5,10,13, 14 7:7,10,15,18,19 8:13, suggestions 11:18 16,22,23 10:20,23 11:3,7, supporting 5:21 8 12:8,10,15,18,19 **Supreme** 6:9 8:5,7 Werther's 8:20 work 5:12 Т working 5:11 6:2 talk 6:8 Υ **things** 5:10 **THOMAS** 12:24 year 7:2 time 11:17,25 12:6 years 6:4 **Titla** 3:13,17 4:19,22 7:24 **Youth** 5:24 9:3 11:11,14 12:22 13:3 **Tom** 4:24 6:11,24 10:5 Ζ **Toma** 8:4 **Zoom** 11:25 tomorrow 5:5 Tucson 5:3 U ultimately 5:13 understand 6:4 **unmute** 10:13 ٧ versus 8:4,9 VI 9:21 10:19 11:5

VII 11:17

Index: send..Zoom